Developing and delivering training on the Aarhus Convention for Officials
A Manual for Trainers

Funded by the European Union and implemented by Royal Haskoning and The Regional Environmental Center for Central and Eastern Europe
Developing and delivering training on the Aarhus Convention for Officials

A Manual for Trainers

Kyiv, Ukraine
September 2004

EuropeAid 02-0114
Developing and Delivering Training for Officials on the Aarhus Convention: Manual for Trainers gives advice and practical support for the development and delivery of interactive, solution oriented training to assist the implementation of the Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters (the Aarhus Convention). It is designed for use by beginners as well as by more experienced trainers working with officials and civil society in the fields of public management, democracy and environment in the Eastern Europe and Caucasus region.

This Manual was developed under the European Union Project ‘Environmental Information, Education and Public Awareness’ (02-0114) implemented in Armenia, Azerbaijan, Belarus, Moldova and Ukraine. It supplements ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention: A User Guide for Officials in the Eastern Europe and Caucasus Region’, and national User Guides in each of the six countries of the project. It draws on a booklet of good practice, also developed under the project.

How to develop and deliver’, gives a general introduction to the training methods and interactive training approach used; and Part II, ‘Training Modules on the Aarhus Convention’. These two parts are designed to assist in the development of the practical skills and knowledge needed by both officials to fulfill their obligations, and civil society to exercise their rights.

The EU Project ‘Environmental Information, Education and Public Awareness’ aims to improve the quality of environmental protection and environmental decisions by incorporating public interests. It provides assistance to public officials, NGOs, the media and other sectors of civil society to continue implementation of the Aarhus Convention. The project is funded by the EuropeAid Programme of the European Union and is implemented by Royal Haskoning from the Netherlands in partnership with the Regional Environmental Center for Central and Eastern Europe (based in Hungary). The project was implemented from June 2002 to December 2004.
INTRODUCTION ................................................................................... 6

Part 1. How to develop and deliver training .............................................. 9

CHAPTER 1: What is necessary to know about interactive training ............ 10
  1.1. Why training on the Aarhus Convention? ......................................... 10
  1.2. What is interactive training? ............................................................... 10
  1.3. Who are the trainers and can you become a trainer? ....................... 13

CHAPTER 2: How to prepare a training seminar ...................................... 14
  2.1. Get to know your audience ............................................................... 14
  2.2. Set goals and objectives for the training .......................................... 18
  2.3. Develop a training programme .......................................................... 20
  2.4. Place components in the right order .................................................. 21
  2.5. Develop a work schedule .................................................................. 22
  2.6. Select appropriate methods .............................................................. 24
      Interactive mini-lecture ......................................................................... 26
      Small group exercises ........................................................................... 27
      Discussion .............................................................................................. 30
      Case study ............................................................................................. 35
      Role-play ............................................................................................... 37
  2.7. Prepare training materials ................................................................. 40
  2.8. Take care of logistics .......................................................................... 40

CHAPTER 3: How to conduct effective and successful training .................. 42
  3.1. What to know about group dynamics? .............................................. 42
  3.2. How to create a positive atmosphere and establish a good rapport with participants? .... 44
  3.3. How to maintain participants’ interest and raise the level of knowledge absorption during training? ............................................................. 46
  3.4. How to resolve a difficult situation? .................................................... 48
  3.5. How to deal with ‘difficult’ participants? .......................................... 50
  3.6. How to work with the audio and visual materials? .......................... 55

CHAPTER 4: Evaluation of training .......................................................... 56

Part 2. Training modules on the Aarhus Convention ............................... 59

Model Programmes .................................................................................. 60
  Training on Access to Environmental Information .................................. 60
  Training on Public Participation in Decision-making .............................. 62
  How to adapt the training for representatives of local authorities? .......... 64

Getting started ........................................................................................ 67
  Introductory part (Session 1) .................................................................. 67
  General information about the Aarhus Convention (Session 2) ............... 70
**TOPIC I. Access to Environmental Information** .............................................................. 80
  General principles of access to environmental information (Session 3) ......................... 80
  Passive dissemination of information, or how to respond to requests of the public (Session 4) .......................................................................................................................... 89
  Active dissemination of information (Session 5) ................................................................ 101
  Receiving environmental information:
  Establishment of a service for collecting and providing environmental information:
  Analysing problems and finding solutions (Session 6) ....................................................... 113

**TOPIC II. Public Participation in Decision-making** .......................................................... 116
  Main principles of public participation (Session 7) ............................................................ 116
  Methods of public participation (Session 8) ....................................................................... 126
  Methods to inform the public, ensuring effective public participation (Session 9) ................. 138
  Public participation plan (Session 10) ................................................................................ 149
  Role play: ‘Developing a strategic plan for the social and economic development of the town of N’ (Session 11) .......................................................... 158
  Working with media to facilitate the implementation of the Aarhus Convention (Session 12) ......................................................................................................................... 164

**TOPIC III. Access to Justice** (Session 13) ........................................................................ 171
  Conclusion (Session 14) .................................................................................................... 179

**ANNEXES** .................................................................................................................. 183
  1. Getting acquainted exercises ......................................................................................... 184
  2. Expectations .................................................................................................................. 185
  3. Training needs analyses: questionnaires ....................................................................... 186
  4. Energisers ...................................................................................................................... 188
  5. Setting the rules .............................................................................................................. 189
  6. Handout for the exercise ‘Coat of Arms’ ............................................................... 190
  7. Some methods for receiving feedback ......................................................................... 191
  8. Final evaluation form of the training ............................................................................. 192
  9. Role-play ‘Public participation in decision-making regarding construction’ ................. 194
 10. Role-play ‘Public participation in selection of locations for placement of landfills for waste burial’ .......................................................... 196
 11. List of Aarhus Convention experts ............................................................................ 204

**LIST OF LITERATURE** ................................................................................................. 208
Introduction

What this Manual is for?

This Manual continues the work of the Environment for Europe process involving the EU, other European countries, and the countries of Eastern Europe, Caucasus and Central Asia (EECCA) in developing long-term environmental policy priorities aimed at improving environmental conditions throughout Europe, and promoting the convergence of environmental policy and practice.

This Manual is designed to provide practical assistance for the implementation of the Convention on Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-making and Access to Justice in Environmental Matters (the Aarhus Convention). The successful implementation of the Convention depends on the one hand, on the level of professionalism of state officials, representatives of local authorities and members of civil society (non-governmental organizations, business structures and media etc.), and their knowledge of laws and procedures for the implementation of rights and duties. On the other hand it also depends on the desire of officials and members of civil society to implement the convention, and the willingness and ability of officials and the public to work with each other for the sake of environmental protection.

This Manual was created in order to stimulate the process of education and training for state officials, members of civil society, business, media and students. These materials will help teach members of civil society and state officials about the practical application of the Aarhus Convention. Although they were based on the experiences of countries in which the EU project was implemented, they contain recommendations on how they can be adapted for use with officials and civil society in all countries of Eastern Europe, the Caucasus and Central Asia.

What is the Structure of the Manual?


This Manual, is comprised of two parts, Part I ‘How to develop and deliver training’, gives a general introduction to the training methods and interactive training approach used; and Part II, ‘Training Modules on the Aarhus Convention’. Part I functions as a user manual for the ‘Training Modules’. It describes, provides the rationale for and gives practical assistance for the use of interactive techniques to deliver training to adults. It also outlines the skills that educators and trainers should have. It contains recommendations on how to develop, organize and deliver training, as well as descriptions of different methods of training and the evaluation of training.

The ‘Training Modules’ give practical support in the form of templates for training on each pillar of the Aarhus Convention, Access to Information, Public Participation and Access to Justice. The Modules include suggested programmes for training seminars and particular training sessions, proposed interactive exercises to be used during particular sessions, slides for presentation during the sessions and materials that can be distributed to training participants to supplement the training they receive. The templates differ in style and training method types and give trainers the opportunity to use different approaches and options in implementing training on the Aarhus Convention.

The Training sessions were designed as seminars of one and a half to two-days in duration, but they can be made shorter or longer as needed, as indicated by the developers in their comments or advice.

Who is the Manual is for?

This Manual is intended for use by those who deliver or plan to deliver training on the Aarhus Convention. It was composed to be useful for both professional educators and trainers and for trainers at the beginner-level. It will be useful for those experienced educators or trainers working in institutes for the professional training of state officials, in higher education institutions or public training centres. It should also be very helpful for beginner level trainers, such as representatives of state structures, who want to raise the level of knowledge and understanding of their employees, or members of non-governmental organizations who would like to train their own members or members of the wider community. The Manual will help also to facilitate cooperation between different stakeholders to better protect the environment.
How to use the Manual?

Even though this material presents scenarios for trainings on particular topics, the Manual can also be used to carry out training on the Aarhus Convention for different types of educational activities. For example, the presented materials can be used to prepare:

- Training sessions of several days or only a short time for officials or for members of civil society on one or all three pillars of the Convention.
- Courses in secondary schools or higher education institutions.
- Short courses to be included in the already existing curricula for training and professional development of state officials.
- Short half or quarter day seminars for various groups of people.

The interactive training exercises, lectures and discussions can be adapted to the framework conditions of the activity within which they are delivered, also to the goals of the training activity and to the needs of the participants.

For example, while carrying out joint training for state officials and members of non-governmental organizations, it is often necessary to provide parallel sessions as well as joint sessions. It is also important to carry out a joint analysis of what was learned during these simultaneous sessions and how accumulated knowledge can be applied in practice. The reason for this is that the Convention gives different rights and imposes different responsibilities for officials and civil society.

In order for the training components to be relevant to the conditions of the particular country, it is recommended that they be adapted to incorporate local legislation and experience, and to use local examples, and research, etc.
PART I

How to develop and deliver training
Chapter 1. What it is necessary to know about interactive training

1.1. Why training on the Aarhus Convention?

Different kinds of educational activities can be used to increase the level of environmental awareness among state officials, non-governmental organisations, youth and the general public. Conferences, round table discussions, seminars and open discussions can be organised, television programmes and televised debates are created, etc. The goal of such activities is to discuss specific issues, aimed at sharing the information and experiences or in reaching agreements.

At the same time, in order to implement the political decisions that are being made in the area of environmental protection, knowledge of laws and the mechanisms for their implementation is not enough. It is necessary for all those involved in the implementation of these laws, to develop new values, skills and knowledge.

The Aarhus Convention has been described by UN Secretary General Kofi Annan as ‘the most ambitious venture in environmental democracy ever undertaken under the auspices of the UN’. It is the first convention to link together environment and democracy, guaranteeing environmental human rights.

Implementing the Aarhus Convention requires a new attitude toward the environment, toward the decision-making process and the role of the public. Environmentally important decisions must be made with public participation, which is a conceptually new idea for many state officials and also for the public itself. At the same time, participants in decision-making processes should not only raise the level of their professional knowledge, but also change their attitudes toward the public, to learn to co-operate in a constructive way and to learn how to reach consensus.

Usual informational and educational activities are not enough to achieve these objectives. What is needed is the kind of interactive training methods presented here. During the project, the methods and materials in this Manual for Trainers have been successfully used to train more than 1298 officials and members of civil society in the six countries of the project. They include national officials, people working within local administrations, mass media, and high school and university teachers.

Clearly, training alone will not lead to full implementation of all the provisions of the Aarhus Convention nor an instant improvement in environmental conditions. It is just one of the components of a broader preventative approach, that combines effective education with implementation as described in the User Guides plus development of legislation, regulatory procedures, systems of enforcement, improvement of institutional structures, changes in general policy and improvement of infrastructure and planning.

1.2. What is interactive training?

Interactive training is a form of active training that allows the participants to not only obtain knowledge, master new skills and change their attitudes, but also to lay down the foundation for approaches to solving real life situations outside of the classroom — all in a short time. Interactive training allows the use of the participants’ experience, stimulates dialogue between the participants and the trainers and gives an opportunity to critically analyse the organisational and system-related causes for the problems that appear.

Interactive training is based on the main principles of the theory of adult learning and helps get the participants involved and make the educational process more active.

Adults digest the information in the most effective way when working on their own problem solving, performing practical exercises or while training others. Research shows, that adults remember 20 per cent of what they hear, 40 per cent of what they
Developing and delivering trainings for Officials. A Manual for Trainers

PART 1: How to develop and deliver training

Figure 1. Effectiveness of the training methods

see and hear and 80 per cent of what they see, hear and do. Accordingly, training is least effective when the information is received in a passive way, during lectures or at presentations. As shown in figure 1, using the information and critically analysing it, then immediately applying the knowledge in practice and in the training of others, significantly increases the effectiveness of digested information.

Since styles of adult learning differ, applying different methods of interactive training is more effective than applying a single method, which may work for some people and be unacceptable to others. Digested information is more effective when participants are given the opportunity to: hear, see, ask questions, take part in a role play, read, write, work with the equipment and discuss key questions.

Training is also more effective if its outcomes can be applied within the context of the work or the everyday life of the training participants. For instance, while working with state officials, you could suggest they discuss the difficulties that can arise when trying to get the public involved in the process of environmental decision-making. Such discussions will give the participants their first experience of understanding the possibility of public participation. Furthermore, trainers will give the participants an opportunity to understand the objective character of the difficulties they face in their work, and to start developing ways together to overcome them.

One of the main concepts used at the time of development of this manual was the theory of learning by experience, created by the American researcher David Colb [2, p. 21]. This theory explains to a great extent the essence of the processes of interaction taking place during interactive training (figure 2).
According to David Colb, the learning cycle consists of four successive and interconnected stages, specific experience, reflection and observation, abstract conceptualisation and active experimenting.

During the first stage of the cycle, the participants use either some specific personal experience that they already have or, as happens much more often, immediately obtain this experience with the help of a specially organised interaction during the learning activity.

During the stage of reflection and observation, conditions are created for the critical observation of, and reflection on what has been experienced and discussions are held among observing participants who are in some way related to the experience.

The productivity of such discussions will be greatest if the ‘triangular rule is observed by each of the participants. According to this rule three components are equally important — the topic, the group, and the person themselves. Unless all three components are present during the discussions, the emphasis will shift to one of these aspects which will negatively affect the effectiveness of the discussions.

In the third stage of the cycle, ‘Abstract Conceptualisation’, a unique knowledge can appear as a result of the joint reflections by the participants. The value of this unique knowledge is not in the information gained, but in its creative character. The value of this knowledge is strengthened by the participants’ interaction, i.e. their joint movement in some singular direction with the goal of realising their individual needs. The results of interaction in this stage are expressed in the form of conclusions and deductions from the participants themselves, as a result of this joint reflection.

In addition, as one of the ways to explain the experience obtained, the participants of a workshop can be offered theories that explain the aspects discussed in some particular way. This in no way means the substitution of personal conclusions by the concepts established, rather the theories offered help the participants to fully formulate and realise their own deductions.

During the final stage of the cycle, the possibility to review the formulated conclusions is especially important. Most often, this review takes place during the practice, and finally leads to gaining new specific experiences, which in turn become the beginning of a new learning cycle.

Sometimes the stage of active experimenting may not take place immediately during an educational activity, but may ‘occur’ after it is complete, perhaps during further learning activities by the participants.

The effectiveness of any educational programme depends, to a great extent, on the methods of communication. Unfortunately, monologues are the main method of communication during training in the existing educational systems within the EECCA region. First the educator transfers the knowledge to the students in the form of a monologue, and the students return the knowledge in their replies, again in the form of a monologue. Here, the educator becomes a sort of pole, around which all communication of the training participants is concentrated. In this manner, a unilateral model of communication is implemented (see figure 3a) [3, p.168].

In contrast to the traditional methods of training, the foundation of interactive training is the principle of multilateral communication (see figure 3b), characterised by absence of unilateral communication and a minimal focus on the point of view of the educator. The organisation of multilateral communication is facilitated by the use of corresponding training methods. Such methods are initially aimed at the realisation of the interests of an individual, and therefore special attention is paid to the organisation of the process of effective communication, in which the participants of the process of interaction are more mobile, more open and active [1, p.23].
1.3. Who are the trainers and can you become a trainer?

The experiences of carrying out educational activities on different topics and with different audiences has revealed that the success of training depends, to a great extent, on the abilities, skills and personal qualities of the trainer who carries out the training.

The most important qualities for a trainer are:

- Excellent understanding of the subject of the training (or to work in partnership with an expert in the field).
- Ability to speak brilliantly before an audience and to listen to others.
- Ability to offer participants opportunities to learn through participation and action.
- Flexibility and ability to easily adapt to the needs of the group.
- Desire to experiment with new ideas.
- Ability to learn fast and to learn from your mistakes.
- Desire to help others to learn.
- Ability to give clear instructions.
- Ability to create an atmosphere of openness and trust within the group.
- Ability to plan and implement training.
- Regular evaluation of your work and success.
- Ability to cope and learn when things do not go according to plan.
- Being organized in all aspects and precise in fulfilling tasks.

During training, the trainer plays a variety of roles — actor, lecturer, teacher, organiser, assistant, leader, preacher, philosopher, manager, diplomat, accountant and specialist.

Can you be a trainer on the Aarhus Convention if you have never conducted training before? This is a question you can answer yourself. Remember a training session you especially liked. Why did you like it? Imagine yourself in the trainer’s place. Do you have a desire to work with people? Do you enjoy communicating with them? Are you ready to learn how to prepare and conduct training?

If your answer to these questions was positive, you do not have to worry about not having some of the qualities listed above — a trainer will improve with each and every training session he or she conducts.

This manual was composed in such a way as to be of maximum assistance to you in preparing and carrying out a training session. It has all the necessary training materials on the Aarhus Convention, as well as methodological recommendations for the organisation of training on access to information, public participation and access to justice. It includes recommendations for trainers which describe in great detail, the process for preparing training, methods to use when conducting a training session and tips for interacting with a group, allowing you to attract and hold the attention of the audience. Resource material and information can be found in publications included in this pack (and on the enclosed CD), ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention: A Guide for Officials in the Eastern Europe and Caucasus region’ and ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention: A Guide for Civil Society in the Eastern Europe and Caucasus region’ and in the booklet ‘Environmental Democracy: 12 examples of practical action’.

With good preparation and some skills in working with people, you can start working as a trainer and will be able to carry out a one-day workshop or training for a small number of people, gradually increasing the duration of the educational activity and number of participants.

In order to determine the level of your professional growth it is a good idea to do a self-evaluation after each training session using the following format:

- Three things that you did best while carrying out the training
- Three things that were the weakest in your performance
- Plan of self-improvement such as:

  To do in the next training:
  
  To avoid doing in the next training:
  
  Keep this list, review it before beginning the next training and afterwards, and make the appropriate conclusions about your professional growth [9, p.48].
Chapter 2.
How to prepare a training session

The success of any educational activity, or an activity that requires a fluent and positive flow of information and opinions between people, be it a workshop, training, round table discussion or conference, depends on many factors and includes various elements that supplement and strengthen the common effect. It is unlikely that anyone could say what is the ideal recipe for training. Indeed, this will vary according to a range of factors such as the personality of the trainer, his or her knowledge and practical experience, how prepared the students are, their desire to learn and their need to apply obtained knowledge and skills in practice, as well as the situation in which the training takes place.

Nevertheless, good preparation and careful planning of the training session is always necessary. It significantly reduces the nervousness of the trainer, and helps the trainer to pay special attention to each participant and to quickly find solutions to any unforeseen situations.

During the preparatory stage, the trainer should pay attention to the following:

- Evaluating the level of knowledge and needs of future training participants.
- Setting aims and objectives.
- Developing the programme, its logic and schedule of work.
- Selecting methods.
- Preparing handouts.
- Organizational matters (such as the venue, equipment, food for participants, etc.).

2.1. Get to know your audience

Carrying out the training needs analysis is one of the features that differentiates interactive education from more traditional educational activities.

Collecting information about the participants, their level of knowledge and their training needs helps in setting the goals for the training session, to develop or modify a programme and to select the corresponding methods and styles for the training to be conducted.

For instance, in some cases you may need to work with a better-prepared group that has already participated in previous trainings sessions on the Aarhus Convention. The training goal for such a group is to improve knowledge of a particular topic (e.g. organising public participation in the development of a legal document). In other cases you may work with a group of people who do not have knowledge about the Convention. This could be, for example local authorities whose goal it is to set up an environmental information service for the local population. Accordingly, the goals and programmes of two such training sessions will be significantly different.

Furthermore, the analysis of training needs allows for establishing preliminary contact with the audience, easing the feeling of discomfort at the beginning of the training for both the participants and the trainer. You can collect examples from the experience of the participants — this will make the programme more fascinating [17].
practical advices

What attitudes do the participants hold towards the training?

- Motivation: do the participants want to study, do they see the need for self-development and training, how do they perceive the changes and the goals of the training?
- Do they express a need to voluntary participate in the training?
- What are their expectations from the offered course?
- What styles of training do they like the best or feel most comfortable with?

What knowledge, skills and experiences on the subject of the training course do the participants have?

- Level of knowledge on the topic; importance of the topic and goals of the training for participants.
- Presence of concrete skills, necessary for such an activity.
- Experience of such work.

What specific knowledge and skills would the participants like to obtain:

- System of knowledge on the topic of the training course.
- Experience in discovering and analysing problems related to this topic.
- Determining causes and obtaining knowledge/skills necessary to influence the problems or solve them.
- Understanding how this programme can help their work.
- Additional goals and objectives that would be of benefit for the course, if taken into account.

Personal information about the participants:

- The departments within the organisations where they work.
- Education, age, etc.

How to collect information?

It is possible to obtain information about the participants and their training needs, using a number of methods, some of which are:

- Questionnaires.
- Interviewing the participants (can be done by phone).
- Conversations with their managers.

If for some reason it was not possible to collect information about the training participants beforehand, use the first minutes of the training to carry out the participants’ needs analysis during the exercises ‘Getting Acquainted’ and ‘Expectations’. (see Annexes 1, 2).

Questionnaires

This method of information collection gives an opportunity to analyse a large spectrum of opinions on issues of interest in a short time. In order to use this method effectively, the questions should be well-composed; they should not be too general — as it will make it difficult to come to any conclusions, but they should also not be too specific (initially presuming one or another answer) — as the received information will not be sufficiently representative. Questionnaires can be used at the time of participant registration, by including the corresponding questions in the registration form. This will allow for an assessment of the experience and the needs of those participants who have not filled out the questionnaire in advance.

Interview (conversation) with the potential participants of the training

Opinions of the potential participants of the training can be very revealing, because they know the situation from the inside. However, it is not free from subjectivity. They are not always ready to determine their own training needs, analyse the problems and correctly determine the reasons for these problems. Such interviews are carried out according to a certain structure, moving from more general questions (these must be open questions) to more particular ones — and an informal conversational-style communication lets the real problems be discovered, leading to the development of new conjectures and to posing new, more specific questions.

Conversation with key people

The boss knows the problems that his or her employees face at work as no one else does. Furthermore, this is the person who carries the responsibility for the effectiveness of the work in general. Therefore the boss will be able to inform you about the organisation’s main problematic areas as well as the history of work on this or that matter, which will be the subject of the training you will be conducting.
Dear colleagues!

We would like to ask you to fill out this questionnaire and send it by fax, e-mail or post to the addresses indicated below by ___ (day) of ___________ (month), ______ (year).

Even if you do not know anything about the Aarhus Convention and have never worked with it, we ask you to please ensure that you answer the first two questions of the questionnaire. Your answers are of the utmost importance! The purpose of collecting this information is to determine awareness levels of non-governmental organisations about the ideas of the Aarhus Convention in our country, and participation levels of non-governmental organisations and existing initiatives in these processes.

Thank you in advance!

Address: e-mail: ______________________________________________________________________
Tel./fax: Name of a contact person: ______________________________________________________________________

1. State the full name of your organisation (initiative), year of formation, main areas of activities and contacts.

2. What do you know about the Aarhus Convention? Briefly state the main things.

3. From what sources did you receive information about the Convention?

4. Do you build upon the provisions of the Aarhus Convention in your work?

4a. If ‘yes’, then, please describe briefly the projects, activities where you have worked with the Convention.

4b. How successful was this work? What results have you achieved?

4c. Did you face any problems whilst working on the Convention? Please describe briefly.

5. Are you aware of any occasions when the people from your town, district or region requested environmental information from pertinent governmental structures? Do you, as a state official, receive requests for information from citizens or non-governmental organisations? (for state officials)

5a. If ‘yes’, then, please describe briefly, who sent the request, where the request was sent, and what the result was of this request.

(for state officials) If ‘yes’, then describe please, who sent you the request and what problems you faced when trying to respond to it?

6. Do you need information about the Aarhus Convention? If ‘yes’, what kind of information is of interest to you?

Thank you for your time in filling out this questionnaire!

Sample questionnaire. (Other examples of questionnaires can be found in the Annex 3)
Target groups at Aarhus Convention training

State Officials
Training on the Aarhus Convention is carried out for state officials of different levels: representatives of the Ministry of Environmental Protection and its regional (district) departments, representatives of other ministries and departments, representatives of local authorities, presidential administration, city mayors, etc.

Representatives of the Ministry of Environmental Protection generally know about the main provisions of the Convention and make attempts to use it. However, they need additional and specific knowledge about the mechanisms of applying the Convention in particular cases, such as the development of legislative acts, carrying out environmental impact assessments and developing plans and programmes. It is also necessary to raise awareness about the mechanisms for conveying information to the public (special difficulty is caused by issues connected with open and closed information, as well as with setting up work on the proactive dissemination of information). Special attention must be paid to the mechanisms for establishing contact with the public and overcoming the one-sided view of its representatives as an ‘element hindering the work’.

Representatives from non-environmental ministries and departments and many representatives of the local authorities do not have particular knowledge about the Aarhus Convention, some never used it, do not know what responsibilities the Convention imposes on them or have ever heard about it. While working with these target groups, along with those with general and specific knowledge about the Aarhus Convention, special attention must be paid to the motivation and the need to use the Convention as a mechanism for democratisation of society.

One special characteristic of this target group is that many state officials are reluctant to participate in trainings and seminars. They should be enticed to take part. In order to do that, preliminary work with the participants is necessary. This can be carried out through personal or group meetings, in written form, by telephone, via Internet, etc. From our viewpoint, the most economical means of communication with this target group is written correspondence.

Public Representatives
This is the group where academia, professors, educators, physicians, representatives of environmental NGOs, media, business, human rights activists and other stakeholders belong.

It is natural that public representatives have different levels of knowledge about the Aarhus Convention. Representatives of the large ‘central’ non-governmental organisations have the most extensive awareness of the rights provided by the Convention, to the greatest extent. They also have some experience gained from use of the Convention. They are interested in receiving knowledge about concrete mechanisms related to the immediate work that they carry out, for instance, public participation in decision-making, protecting their own rights in court, knowledge of where certain information can be obtained and what information is confidential.

Representatives from small non-governmental organisations (for instance, regional or district level ones) sometimes do not have particular knowledge about the Convention. For a start, they are interested in examples of how they can use its provisions. They need both the theoretical foundation (knowledge of the provisions of the Convention as well as legislative provisions), and the mechanisms of its practical application.

Start with a letter to the person in charge!
It is better to send the first letter to the heads of the governmental offices — ministers, chairpersons, directors, etc. It should attract the attention of the senior person, who is interested in having a more qualified staff member, able to secure contact with the public and to manage the information flow.

Send out invitation letters!
After the person in charge has nominated candidates to participate in the seminar, they should receive invitation letters. The information package, included with the invitation letter, should contain the training programme and a portion of the materials so that the topic is introduced to the prospective participants. These materials can be: corresponding parts of the User Guides referred to earlier, ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention: A user Guide for Officials in the Eastern Europe and Caucasus region, and national legislation, etc. The main task is to present the material in such a way as to provoke interest and desire to participate in a seminar or training.

Don’t forget about a variety of methods!
Using different methods of training allows the representatives of this target group to get involved in active work. In spite of scepticism about using role play or introductory exercises entitled, Getting Acquainted and Expectations, that some trainers sometimes exhibit, our experience shows that state officials receive them well and comment that the friendly atmosphere that these exercises create raises their interest towards the subject and the effectiveness of their work. We suggest using various methods, but use care when selecting such exercises as, Energizers and Getting Acquainted, taking into consideration the age of the participants and their individual characteristics.

Work with concrete examples!
Education will be most effective if you build the training on a local example. For instance, review the legal and practical side of how the public can take part in the development and implementation of the Plan for Social-Economic Development of the Town or in adopting the decision about construction of certain facilities/objects: dams, roads, landfill sites, etc.
2.2. Set goals and objectives for the training

Planning always begins with defining the idea of planned outcomes, i.e. goals and objectives of the training. Goals and objectives determine the level of achievement. Once you know what you want to accomplish, it is easier to find ways to achieve it.

Always start planning the training by setting goals and objectives! Define them at the first stage of the planning and present them to the participants during the first stage of your training when you conduct it.

Defining goals and objectives serves as the foundation for the development of the programme. It will help in planning a logical chain of activities that will take place during the course of the training, lays the foundation for the assessment of the effectiveness of the training, helps the trainer establish a rapport with the participants, giving the opportunity to correlate the expectations of the participants with the programme of the training. Besides this, clear goals allow the trainer to focus his or her attention on the participants during the training, rather than on the subject of the training (provide the trainer with flexibility regarding achieving the desired goal) [14].

What are goals and objectives?

The Goal is the generally formulated, anticipated outcome of the training. The goal is the most important and significant landmark within the activities of the participants and the trainer, which one should strive to achieve.

Objectives are specific, concrete outcomes of the activities, indicating the new skills and knowledge, obtained as a result of the training. A step-by-step, gradual implementation of the objectives facilitates the achievement of the general goal, thus securing it.

Goals and objectives must reflect the participants' training needs. Usually one general goal is defined for the training, and the tasks are developed for each separate session of the training.

practical advices

Be specific!
The more specific the formulated tasks, the more probability there is that they will be achieved by the end of the session. It is important that the objectives are defined (worded) clearly and unambiguously. There should be no room for free interpretation. For starters, consider the following questions:

- Why is this session/training being carried out?
- What knowledge and skills will the participants carry away with them after this session has finished?
- How should the participants feel after the session has finished?

Be practical!
When defining the anticipated outcomes, consider all the ‘framework conditions’ (i.e. external, objec-

tive conditions, that do not depend on you), in which you will be working: the subject of the training, abilities, interests and needs of the participants, time, allocated to work, etc. In order to set the goal use the following expression: ‘After the training the participants will / will be able to…’

Check the criteria for goals and objectives!
After setting goals and objectives check whether they satisfy the following criteria: specific, measurable, acceptable, realistic, timeliness. (S.M.A.R.T)

Don’t define too many objectives!
Sometimes the trainers try to define too many objectives for one session. In order to avoid this, it is necessary to determine, which goals and objectives are necessary and which ‘would be achievable’.
### Setting goals for training on the Aarhus Convention

The goals of different training sessions on the Aarhus Convention can vary. This depends largely on the target group and the context in which the training is conducted (general information or implementation of some particular project).

For example, in the aforementioned training of representatives from local authorities concerning the creation of an environmental information service, the following goals and objectives may be considered. (The planned duration of the training is two and a half days).

#### ✓✓ Goal
To make the participants familiar with the principles of the Aarhus Convention that are necessary for organising public access to information; to develop skills to use these principles when creating an environmental information service.

#### ✓ Objectives
After the training the participants will be able to:

- Familiarise themselves with the main provisions of the Aarhus Convention and of national legislation aimed at providing and disseminating environmental information.
- Define administrative functions, related to the implementation of the Aarhus Convention.
- Improve skills for receiving, processing, systemising, and freely disseminating information.
- Develop a plan for creating an environmental information centre and define the necessary resources and types of information to be actively disseminated.

Whilst preparing training on public participation in the development of plans and programmes for representatives of the public and local authorities, the goals may be defined as follows: (The planned duration of training is two days).

#### ✓✓ Goal
To make participants familiar with procedures of public participation, training them on such procedures and on how to apply them in the development of plans and procedures.

#### ✓ Objectives
After the training the participants will be able to:

- Know and follow the principles of public participation.
- Use methods, procedures and instruments for public participation.
- Develop model plans for public participation in development of plans and programmes.
- Discuss the draft plans and procedures for public participation.

If you conduct training for representatives of the public on the subject of Access to Environmental Information, your goals and objectives can be defined in the following way (the planned duration of the training is two and a half days):

#### ✓✓ Goal
To train representatives of the public on how to access environmental information in accordance with the Aarhus Convention and national legislation.

#### ✓ Objectives
After the training the participants will be able to:

- Inform others about the main provisions of the Aarhus Convention.
- Explain the term ‘environmental information’.
- Use the provisions of legal regulations for providing environmental information.
- Use the provisions in legal regulations for collecting and providing emergency environmental information.
- Understand what the limitations are on accessing environmental information.
- Develop methods for effective communication.

### Using your model programmes for training, adjust the goals according to the needs of your audience!

In Part II of this Manual, programmes are presented for different training on access to information, public participation, access to justice and working with the mass media. For each programme, specific goals are defined that may satisfy the needs of your participants or need some adjustment. Whilst developing a specific programme, refer to the information gained from the training needs analysis. See if there is any concrete example from the participants’ experience that can be studied during the process of training. It is better to ‘tie’ the training to the specific activity that is being carried out in the area of implementation of the Convention: development of some document, construction of some facility and issuing a license or a permit, etc.
2.3. Develop the training programme

A good programme is based on thorough planning of the two main components — content (what to teach) and process (how to teach). Programmes based on the principles of Colb’s training theory (Chapter 1), allow not only for the effective combination of different methods and styles of training, use the participants’ experience, but also the setting up of multilateral communication, and also the creation of an atmosphere, in which not only the trainer, but also the participants of the training take responsibility for the training outcome.

As presented in figure 4, the training programme, based on Colb’s theory, consists of three main elements: introduction, main part and conclusion. Each separate training session consists of the very same elements.

![Figure 4. Components of the programme](image)

**practical advices**

**Plan enough time for the introductory part of training!**

The introductory part is crucial to creating a favourable atmosphere, bringing the participants into the training process and establishing a connection with them. The duration of an introductory part depends on the length of training. For one and a half to three-day long training sessions, it is necessary to allocate 1.5-2.5 hours for the introductory part. If it is a short training (half-day or one day), you will need from 30 to 60 minutes. Use this time to let the participants get acquainted, review goals and objectives and if necessary make programme corrections (in Chapter 3 it is described in greater detail, how to select methods to enable the participants to get acquainted and to determine their expectations, as well as how to create a favourable atmosphere).

**Don’t forget about reviewing the goals and objectives!**

Before the beginning of each separate session, present its goals and objectives to the participants. If this is not the first session, emphasise what role this particular session will play in the training programme, and how it is connected with the other programme elements. Here you can also present the general plan of the session. In this way it will be easier for the participants to maintain their attention during the session.

**Prepare interactive exercises for the main part!**

Plan an exercise that gives the participants an opportunity to demonstrate (simulate, stage) a situation, which corresponds to the goal of that particular session. The experience gained as a result of this exercise will help in the acquisition of knowledge. The methods that are used here are: working in small groups; conducting case study analysis exercises; performing role play, and sometimes — well prepared interactive lectures (see Section 2.5. and exercises, offered in each of the modules on the Aarhus Convention).

**Develop a plan of analysis of the obtained experience!**

First give the participants an opportunity to share individual experiences, then analyse the concrete situation. Stimulate the process of analysis of the experience. Choose three or four questions that correspond to the goals of the exercise, for example:

- What experience have you gained (what have you learned as an outcome of the exercise)?
Developing and delivering trainings for Officials. A Manual for Trainers

PART 1: How to develop and deliver training

- What was difficult to understand or do?
- What do you think was successful?
- What would you have changed?

**Summarise obtained knowledge and make conclusions!**

This is the most important part of training. Summarising obtained knowledge and experience allows the participants to connect the information they have received with the situations they face in everyday life. We recommend posing the following questions:

- What did this activity help you understand?
- What main lesson can you learn from this activity and why?

When discussing their experiences together, participants have an opportunity to learn from each other. Sometimes some of them may even exchange their points of view, or attitudes towards the matter in question. Connecting questions with the content of the activity and inviting participants to make conclusions will stimulate them to expand the scope of the problem that is being analysed. Instead of reviewing and commenting on particular specifics, an opportunity arises to evaluate the general picture and review the issue from different perspectives. If necessary, give explanations on a particular matter.

**Think how to ensure application, and plan future actions!**

This is a key point in a training programme for an adult audience, because this stage gives participants the time needed to incorporate the new information into the context of their own lives in a purposeful way. Ask the participants to share ideas about how they can apply their newly obtained knowledge in practical terms. The following questions can be useful:

- What to do next?
- How can I apply what I have just learned?

**Summarise outcomes!**

The purpose of this session is to help the participants retain the main points of a session. Whilst summarising the outcomes, connect them with the goals of the session and the participants’ expectations. It is important to give participants an opportunity to understand that they have reached set goals, and that their expectations were met. If this is not the last session, say a few words about the next session, making a smooth transition to the next stages of the programme. If this is the end of the training, an evaluation of the entire course can be conducted by the participants themselves, as well as by the trainers.

2.4. Place components in the right order

A well-developed separate session, serving as a part of the programme, a well-developed single exercise or presentation is not the total requirement. If a component is in the wrong place within the general training programme, its effectiveness and meaning can be lost. For example, participants may feel tired when higher concentration is required. There are several fundamental principles for effectively developing a programme and helping to place its components in correct order [17].

**practical advices**

Start each part of the training with a review of new material!

First put forward an element that will capture the attention of the audience and will present the general picture of the studied subject.

Increase the level of difficulty of assignments gradually!

Choose the logic: from the particular to the general, or from the general to the particular.

Combine different methods!

When selecting methods, take into account the duration of the training and its components, as well as the time needed for a particular method, the form of communication and placement of participants, suggested by the method.

Pay attention to the logic of the programme!

The presented concepts and the skills that are based on them should supplement each other. If one idea logically follows another one, it will be easier for the participants to understand and memorise the material.

Familiarise participants with the elements, step-by-step!

Complex material is easier to study piece by piece, in order to bring the whole together and get the entire idea. Then move on to summarise.

Conclude the training with discussion about what to do next!

Let the participants think about how they can utilise the knowledge they have received in real-life situations and plan the steps that they will take to apply them in their work.
2.5. Develop a work schedule

As previously mentioned, the training chart, in Fig. 4 can be used both to develop a plan for a single session, and to plan a general training programme spanning several days. The next step in preparing training is the development of a work schedule, i.e. defining time frames for each training part and each session in particular.

When developing a work schedule it is necessary to take into account a few practical considerations.

---

**practical advices**

Decide on the duration of the training programme!

Start with calculation of the duration of the training (the number of days). For every day of the training, define the following; the start and end time of work, lunchtime (no less than one hour) and time for two 30-minute breaks.

For example:

- **8.45 – 9.00** opening and goals for the day
- **9:00 – 10.30** sessions
- **10.30 – 11.00** coffee break
- **11:00 – 13.30** sessions
- **13:30 – 14.30** lunch
- **14:30 – 16.00** sessions
- **16:00 – 16.30** coffee break
- **16:30 – 17.45** sessions
- **17.45 – 18.00** summarising outcomes, evaluation of the day

Allocate enough time for breaks!

It has been established that it is difficult for adults to concentrate and stay in one place for more than two hours at a time. Therefore, it is important to provide a 20-30 minute break after each 1.5-2 hour session. Breaks let the participants communicate with each other, exchange opinions or simply have a rest with a cup of tea or coffee. Breaks can also be used in order to do small assignments.

Make three or four working sessions in one day!

Plan each of them in accordance with the model presented above, taking into account all the particular characteristics of adult learning.

Use special exercises to raise the group’s energy and to increase attention span!

Usually after lunch participants tend to be sleepy, therefore after lunch it is necessary to get the participants involved in the process again. Plan an activity that can buck up the audience (Annex 5 ‘Energisers’ presents some ideas of such exercises). You may use different methods in order to support the attention of an audience.

In a short programme (less than one day), don’t plan too many things!

Short programmes are usually harder to develop, since there is always more information than time to present it. Therefore it is necessary to establish specific and acceptable goals. Limit yourself to the presentation of new information and the organisation of short discussions about how it can be used in various situations. Do not make the common mistake of trying to present too much information.

Whilst organising long programmes (more than one day), give more time to think things through and for practice!

A programme of more than a day in duration offers more time to reflect upon information and experiences, apply knowledge in practice, and plan further actions. If a programme provides brief intervals (a few days, a week) in between the training blocks, it may be possible to give participants assignments wherein results could be exchanged during the next class.

If the programme requires participants to stay together in one place for a period of several days, one of the evenings could be dedicated to undertaking joint projects or assignments, the results of which could be presented the next day. Give the participants an opportunity to apply in practice the skills that they have obtained. Invite them to express their evaluation of what is going on [14].
Subject of Training: Public Participation in Development of Plans and Programmes

*Joint programme for representatives of local authorities and civil society*

**Goal**
To learn to apply the principles of public participation in development of plans and programmes.

**Objectives**
The participants will be able to do the following:

1. Explain what the principles of public participation are, based on the Aarhus Convention and national legislation.
2. Apply methods, procedures and instruments in order to organise effective public participation.
3. Develop a model plan for public participation in the creation of the ‘City Plan for Waste Management’.
4. Discuss a draft plan and procedure of public participation.

### Day 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.00 – 10.30</td>
<td><strong>Opening training, getting acquainted</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.30 – 12.00</td>
<td>Our right to a healthy environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Information about the Aarhus Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Examples of application of the Aarhus Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Possible ways of public participation offered by the legislation of Azerbaijan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.00 – 12.20</td>
<td><strong>Coffee and tea break</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.20 – 13.00</td>
<td>Presentation of the draft plan for waste management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.00 – 14.00</td>
<td><strong>Lunch</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14.00 – 15.50</td>
<td><strong>What does public participation in decision-making mean?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• Who is responsible for decision-making?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• What decisions can be taken with public participation?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• What are the benefits of having the public participate in the decision-making?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• General principles of public participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.30 – 15.50</td>
<td><strong>Coffee and tea break</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.50 – 17.20</td>
<td>Levels of public participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Forms and methods of public participation in preparation of plans and programmes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.20 – 18.00</td>
<td>Planning public participation in the development of the ‘Waste Management Plan’</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Day 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.00 – 11.20</td>
<td>Possibilities for access to justice, provided by the Aarhus Convention and national legislation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.20 – 11.40</td>
<td><strong>Coffee and tea break</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.40 – 13.00</td>
<td>What are public hearings?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Preparation for public hearings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Methods of achieving consensus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.00 – 14.00</td>
<td><strong>Lunch</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.00 – 15.40</td>
<td>Public hearings based on the proposed plan of public participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.40 – 16.00</td>
<td><strong>Coffee and tea break</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.00 – 17.30</td>
<td>Analysis of public hearings on the basis of principles of public participation and rules of consensus building.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Presentation of the draft plan to get the public involved</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.30 – 18.00</td>
<td>Evaluation. Conclusions. Handing out certificates</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.6. Select appropriate methods

One of the mandatory conditions of effective training is the balance between the content and the process. Adults digest information better if they take part in the training process. Thus the inclusion of group exercises as part of a programme is required. At the same time, adult participants are quite fastidious — they won’t be satisfied by training filled with a multitude of group exercises that are not connected with their subject of interest. The trainer has to be able to determine at what time the facts should be presented, and when to use methods that allow for the participants to apply the facts and think them over.

In order to balance the programme and achieve the goals of a particular session or training as a whole, various methods can be utilised, the selection of which depends on the following factors: goals and objectives of the training, special characteristics and needs of the audience, the need to keep the attention of the audience over a certain period of time. There are also the following limitations: time, number of participants, and availability of equipment, etc.

Table 1 below illustrates the main characteristics, advantages and limitations of various methods. It will help you select an appropriate training strategy.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Training methods</th>
<th>Strengths</th>
<th>Limitations</th>
<th>The purpose of the method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>Allows you to</td>
<td>Passivity of audience. One-way communication. Responsibility for results of the training lies with the trainer. Difficulty evaluating the effectiveness of the training process. Lack of opportunity to receive experience and to work through abilities and skills.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• present factual material in a consistent and logical way;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• convey a large volume of information in a short time;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• open discussion on a problem;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• connect the theory and the experience drawn from the examples of good practices;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• work with a large audience.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small group exercises</td>
<td>Basic method, used in combination with other methods. Allows you to</td>
<td>Possibility of facing difficulties while arranging participants into groups. Need time to prepare some type of group work. Possibility of all groups obtaining similar results in some exercises, which would put certain limits on plenary discussion to follow.</td>
<td>Knowledge, skills, development of projects, search for solution to problem, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• develop effective communication and cooperation between participants while developing new skills and obtaining knowledge;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• receive comments from fellow students. Transfer responsibility for results of training to trainees.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>Allows</td>
<td>Possibility of spending a lot of time in order to carry out this method. Difficulties at formulating the questions for discussion and tasks. Need for certain level of preparation for both trainer and participants in order to take part in discussion. Possibility that some participants will dominate.</td>
<td>Knowledge, exchange of opinions and experience between the participants on a controversial problem; analysis of the problems, abilities and skills of backing up one’s point of view with arguments and defending one’s point of view or attitude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training methods</td>
<td>Strengths</td>
<td>Limitations</td>
<td>The purpose of the method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Case studies</strong></td>
<td>Allows you to</td>
<td>Possibility of needing to spend a lot of time in order to develop the cases. Possibility of facing conflict situations in the process of developing and adopting decisions. Possibility that participants will have problems connected with transferring learning experience into real life situations.</td>
<td>Application of knowledge and skills, skills of analysing and solving problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• develop ability to analyze, ask relevant questions, develop decisions and defend one’s point of view;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• improve participant’s communicative skills;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• develop ability to see situation from several different angles and take into consideration various factors that influence the situation;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• develop several decisions and analyse them.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Role plays</strong></td>
<td>Allows you to</td>
<td>Possibility of having to spend a lot of time for development and preparation of a play. Possibility of encountering psychological barriers of the participants, which will impede ‘role’ performance. Requirement that the method is to be used in small groups. Need for a correctly structured analysis in order for the learning goals to be achieved.</td>
<td>Skills, social action, attitude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• reconstruct a problematic situation ‘in action’;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• see the roles of other participants, gain an understanding of their motivations, and ‘play through’/‘try out the new models of behaviour;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• develop an ability to analyse the decisions that were made, etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Work with text, working sheets and questionnaires</strong></td>
<td>Allows you to</td>
<td>Possibility of spending a lot of time in order to develop the hand-outs. In use for only for a short period of time.</td>
<td>Expand knowledge, review experience and attitude of the experts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• get all participants involved in content work;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• participants work through the material and ponder over it on their own, without external influence;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• use the results of independent work when working in small or big groups.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Brainstorming</strong></td>
<td>Allows you to</td>
<td>Possibility of participants becoming distracted from the problem which is being solved. Need time limit of between 10-15 minutes.</td>
<td>Development of criteria, development of lists, knowledge, attitude</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• open the way for creative thinking and creation of new ideas;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• collect many ideas over a short period of time;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• encourage all participants, as any ideas are being considered.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Audiovisual materials (movies, slides, etc.)</strong></td>
<td>Allows you to</td>
<td>Possibility of having too large a number of questions appearing in participants’ minds, which would make a focused discussion more difficult.</td>
<td>Attitude, knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• bring in entertaining detail into the training process, and stimulate questions;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• focus attention of audience;</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• work with large groups.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Adapted from Merri Weinger. Teacher’s guide on basic environmental health. [19]

Now let’s take a more detailed look at some methods, effectively utilised whilst conducting training on the Aarhus Convention.
Interactive mini-lecture

Lectures allow for the quick conveyance of a significant volume of information to a large audience. Lectures allow for the presentation of material in a concise and logical form in a short time.

Traditional lectures are characterised by a long monotonous presentation of material by a lecturer and by certain passiveness of the listeners’ attitude. In contrast to this, during the course of intensive education at training sessions, interactive mini-lectures of no more than 15 minutes in duration are utilised. They include a significant amount of activity for the audience and are indispensable whilst conducting training on the Aarhus Convention.

Mini-lectures allow for the presentation of the main provisions and requirements of the Convention, legislation, and other information. It is desirable to use lectures at the beginning of a training programme, after having conducting the ‘getting acquainted’ session with participants, in order to introduce them to the understanding of a problem.

**Start the lecture in an unusual way!**

Try to grab the attention of the audience with a bright opening. Ask provocative questions, tell an interesting story, demonstrate something, show the results of training needs analysis for this target group or ask a few questions in such a way that participants can answer by raising their hands, etc.

**Present the material briefly and clearly!**

In order to keep the attention of an audience, the length of a lecture should not exceed 15 minutes. Select three to five main points and present them in an easily comprehensible form.

**Use illustrations and visual aids!**

Use visual aids, graphs, drawings, slides, handouts and other technical means. They contribute to better understanding and retention of information. You can also distribute a short summary of your lecture and other handouts (printed copy of slides), so that the attention spans of participants do not get derailed by having to take excessive notes.

**Maintain audience rapport!**

Be interactive. Get the participants involved in the training process and the process of thinking over the presented information with the help of strategically placed questions. Use examples to illustrate the theory and humour to maintain a rapport with your audience. Don’t read from a script! Use your own words and demonstrate your enthusiasm.

Maintain visual contact with the audience: try to make eye contact with each and every member of your audience, not only with one participant. Embrace everyone. Use open postures and positive body language — this helps win over the audience. Be careful of your gestures.

**Watch the logic of presentation!**

At the beginning of a mini-lecture present its plan (put it on a board or on paper, etc.) and emphasise what questions will be reviewed. Whilst conducting a mini-lecture, follow the plan. Do not jump from one subject to another at random.

**Reinforce presented material!**

After presenting the information, plan an exercise that will help participants memorise and apply the new knowledge. This can be through discussion, work in small groups, exercises aimed at solving a particular problem and role plays.

**Watch the tone of your voice!**

Courtesy and sincerity should become your motto. No matter how the participants behave themselves, you should make your remarks about their behavior in a reserved and polite manner. The words ‘thank you for your question’ can be pronounced with a dozen various intonations, including such that will make the participant regret the very moment he or she decided to exhibit activity. Even the toughest participants should be loved, however paradoxical this may sound. Both your verbal and non-verbal expressions during the lecture will, by means of thousands of nuances, manifest your real attitude toward the group — let it be friendly, whatever the cost!

**Identify difficult places!**

When preparing the lecture, identify all the so-called ‘delicate spots’ that can become subjects of participants’ questions. Imagine yourself in the shoes of the participant and try to anticipate what details may lead to questions, remarks, violent reactions, and prepare to face them, as much as possible.
Prepare to face difficult questions in advance!

It’s good if you know all the answers to anticipated questions. However, if a question takes you by surprise, you must have a behavioral model to act properly in such a case:

- Pause for 5-7 seconds and think, standing before the participants. Demonstrate to the participants that you are not ignoring the question, rather taking the necessary time to think it over. This way the participants will pause together with you, giving you time to collect your thoughts, find an answer, or understand what to do next.
- Re-address the question to the group: ‘And how would you answer this question yourselves?’
- Admit sincerely that you don’t know the answer, but explain to the participants that you will certainly consult a specialist, will look through the literature, etc. and will find the answer. The following response also goes down well: ‘Thank you, this was a wonderful question. It is very difficult indeed, and we have devoted a lot of time and energy to finding an answer to it. We will certainly get back to it and review it together with a specialist’.

- If you are planning to answer questions after the lecture, don’t forget to announce this at the beginning, so that the people will be able to jot down their questions and ask them later.
- A good solution is to create a question-and-answer box. This will enable the participants to put their questions, related to the content of the training, in a special place during the entire training session. Trainers will be able to read them in their spare time and prepare answers.

Not a single question should be ignored!

Using the above described examples, respond to ALL questions that are being asked, as well as ALL remarks and comments.

There should be less ‘YOU’ and more ‘WE’!

Use less pronouns that separate you from the participants. Unacceptable expressions are those such as as ‘you must’ or ‘you are obliged’. Substitute them with softer expressions, like ‘the law speaks of the obligation…’, ‘it is recommended to do it in the following way…’, etc.

Small group exercises

Working in small groups, in contrast to the lecture, switches the training process from the trainer to the participants themselves. This method stimulates cooperation between members of the group, allows them to realise each participant’s natural aspiration for communication and facilitates the digestion of information and formation of skills.

Small groups are used in order to draw the interest of participants to a new subject, study or reinforce new material, develop a project, find solution to a problem, etc. This is a basic training method, which is easily combined with other methods. For example, you can brainstorm, hold a discussion, perform a role-play or a case study analysis in a small group. Discussion in small groups can be a component of an interactive lecture. Having been split into small groups, participants can find answers to given questions, develop a definition, develop a list of problems and/or solutions to them, share experience and examples, discuss and select main points from a given text, etc.

Using small group-work facilitates the development of effective communication and the cooperation of participants — important skills for the joint work of stakeholders in any project. Therefore we recommend that you use small group-work actively when carrying out trainings on the Aarhus Convention.

The method is simple. Having received an assignment from a trainer, participants gather in small groups. They do the assignment together, making a report about the outcomes of the work for later presentation to a larger audience.
Plan work thoroughly!
It is necessary to decide how to split the bigger group into smaller ones. It is also necessary to clearly define what the participants should achieve as a result of the work, determine the duration of the work in small groups and the way in which the reports about completion of the assignment will be given to the larger audience.

Define the number of participants!
The optimal number of participants placed into small groups, largely depends on the total number of participants in the training, the character and the volume of assigned work, availability of necessary materials and the time allocated for the implementation of the assignment. Changing the composition of a group at the time of training will contribute to a wider exchange of experiences. Participants can be placed into groups of two or three people or in larger groups of four to seven people.

Split up participants into groups quickly and effectively!
There are many methods to assign the participants to groups. Participants can be arranged into groups in alphabetic order, with the help of lists, prepared in advance, or with the help of numbered colour cards. The main thing is not to waste time waiting for complex explanations of how to split into groups and to try to give the participants who have never worked with each other yet, a chance to exchange knowledge and experience. When group sizes change, the method used to arrange participants into groups can also be changed.

Give brief and precise instructions on the forthcoming work!
Instructions should be a simple, ordered, and step-by-step explanation to the participants of what they should be doing. Avoid complex phrases. Make sure the participants understand and can do what is required of them. Whilst giving instructions, use action-oriented words: note, tell, present to the other groups, etc. It is sometimes useful to distribute an assignment in a printed form or to write it on a whiteboard.

Define clearly the time allocated for the task!
Whilst giving instructions, define clearly the allocated time for group assignments and write it on the whiteboard. This will help them organise their work effectively. Do not give too much time — people will get distracted or bored. Before the end of the group work, walk around the room and encourage all the groups to finish their work on time.

Suggest the participants choose roles within the group!
In order to effectively organise work in a small group, it is advisable to select from among its participants someone to act as moderator in order to steer the discussion, someone else as a secretary to take notes of the ideas from the participants, someone as presenter, who will present the outcomes of the group work at a plenary meeting, and finally someone to be responsible for keeping track of the time.

Watch the groups working!
Observe one group after another, watching how they perform their assignments and answer questions arising from their work. Groups may need additional instructions and clarifications.

Develop a method of reporting the results of implementing an assignment in advance!
At the time of giving instructions, explain to the participants, how they will report the results of the implementation of the assignment. The method of reporting the results of implementation of the assignment is determined not only by the complexity of an assignment, but also by the time allocated for its completion. There are several ways of reporting the implementation results of an assignment:

- **Presentation**: groups present the results verbally or by explaining the notes that the group made earlier on a whiteboard or paper. This way of reporting takes the longest time.
- **Gallery**: groups present the results of their work in the form of posters or notes on large sheets of paper. The participants are given time to review and analyse presentations. Then the results are discussed in a large group and the important elements, stressed by every group, are emphasised.
- **Reporting group-to-group**: When there are several groups and little time, groups can present results to each other, but not to the whole audience. In this case you may need several rooms.
- **Partial report**: Each group reports not on all points mentioned, but only on the most important ones.
- **Summary**: After the sheets with the groups’ work results are placed on the walls, the trainer selects the most interesting ones and asks the group to comment on them in greater detail.
- **Discussion**: Instead of simply reporting you can organise a discussion, in the process of which questions can be asked to one or another group. This method saves time, but it is possible to lose some original ideas created by a particular group.
Some Small Group Activities

All questions used with large groups, can be used for small groups too. The difference is that when working in small groups, all participants get involved in the work. Below you will find different approaches to working in small groups. [17]

‘Think, discuss, share’  25 minutes

How to organize the work:
1. Pose a question to the large group. Put the question on a sheet of A1 paper.
2. Ask each participant to think about the answer.
3. Afterwards, ask participants to discuss their answer with their neighbour on their right.
4. In conclusion, discuss with the whole group the possible answers to the question.

‘Triads’  30 minutes

How to organize the work:
1. Split up the group into smaller groups of three persons each.
2. Hand out to each participant their role: of interviewer, interviewee, and observer. The interviewer asks a question, the interviewee responds to it, and the observer takes notes about what he or she witnesses.
3. Give a subject for the interview or a question for discussion, and assign a time period (not more than 7 minutes each).
4. Ask the participants to swap roles.
5. After the end of three rounds of discussion (when each participant has played each of the roles) bring the larger group back together again and discuss what new issues have been learned on the subject. You can also ask, which role was easier to play and why.

‘Circles’  45 minutes

This method develops the ability to listen and helps each participant make a contribution to the group work. The time depends on the number of participants. Assume that every participant will speak for no longer than 3 minutes.

How to organize the work:
1. Pose a question to the group. Put the question on a sheet of A1 paper.
2. Ask each participant to answer in turn, observing the following rule: when each person answers, they should first repeat the main points of the previous person’s answer before giving their own.
3. Change the one who answers first if you use this method more than once. [17]

‘6x5, 5x6’  45 minutes

How to organize the work:
1. Split the participants up into six groups of five persons each.
2. Give each group one common subject for discussion. Put the assignment on a sheet of A1 formatted paper.
3. After the end of the group discussion, each participant of the group becomes the ‘bearer’ of group knowledge.
4. Arrange the participants into new groups, based on the rule of ‘one participant from each group’. In this manner, you form five groups of six persons each. In order to make the procedure of forming the new groups easier, assign a number to each participant from the previous groups (1, 2, 3, 4, 5). The resulting six ‘number ones’ will form the new group number one, the six ‘number twos’ will form the new group number two, etc. — i.e. all similar numbers get arranged into one group.
5. Ask each participant to share in the results of the discussion of the subject in the previous group. [17]

‘1x2x4’  45 minutes

How to organize the work:
1. Ask the participants to individually think over an answer to a question, or ponder over some issue or the ways to solve some problem.
2. Then put the participants into pairs and ask each pair to jointly produce an answer to the question, or formulate a summary of thought about the issue or problem.
3. Then arrange the pairs into groups of four, who will form one answer/summary out of the previous two, which is acceptable to all four persons.
4. The final results are put on a sheet of A1 paper, and presented later by each group.
Discussion

Discussion is a broad public dialogue of some controversial issues. It is one of the main methods of training, in which the trainer plays the role of a ‘show host’ and acts as the catalyst for an informal, unconstrained exchange of information and experience between the participants. Discussion allows for an increase in the level of interaction between the training participants and the effectiveness of the educational process.

Discussion is used to exchange opinions and experience between the participants on a controversial issue, in order to develop skills needed for devising arguments and defending one’s opinion, as well as increasing their motivation. A trainer moderates the discussion, bringing to the attention of the participants, key matters that have come up during the discussion, in order to present and review various facets relating to the issue under discussion.

This method is actively used during training on the Aarhus Convention, as well as during round table discussions, conferences and seminars.

practical advices

Give the participants sufficient information!
Before the start of the discussion, give the participants enough background information in the form of a text, ready-written dialogue, role-play, case study or a short video clip.

Define the problem issue clearly!
The question or subject of a discussion should be controversial: i.e. those for which there is no single answer, rather those which allow for various solutions, in particular, opposing, mutually exclusive ones. For instance, initiating a discussion on the assessment of the implementation of the provisions of the Aarhus Convention and the need to carry out more work in the country, you may use one (or all three) of the statements below, offering the participants a choice to support or refute any of them, based on their opinion:

- In our country the Aarhus Convention is not being implemented at all.
- The Aarhus Convention was ratified by our country and there is nothing else we need to do.
- People have the opportunity to participate in decision-making processes on environmental issues but they do not use it.

You should not use the questions like, ‘who is right and who is wrong?’ The possible events should be the central focus, such as ‘What would be possible in this or that situation?’, ‘What would happen if…?’ or ‘Are there alternative possibilities or ways to act?’

Develop a plan for conducting a discussion!
A plan can be an important component in your preparation to conduct a discussion. It looks like a list of questions that will help you direct the discussion and focus participants on the issue for discussion.

Stick to the selected format of carrying out the discussion!
During the discussion of a controversial matter, precisely follow the format tailored to the discussion that you have selected, for example a round table discussion, a discussion in a common circle, ‘take your position’, etc. Clearly sticking to the selected format for conducting a discussion will help make it more effective and reach the goal that has been set, within the allocated time-frame.

Watch the time and follow the schedule!
It is better to have some time remaining — then it will be possible to share it equally among the participants at the end of the discussion. But if you will be lacking time for collective discussion and summarising the results, your discussion will not reach the goals that have been set.

Don’t let the participants deviate from the subject of the discussion!
Before the start of the discussion give the participants a few minutes to think over the issue and define their arguments. During the discussion listen to the participants carefully and watch their mood. Take notes. They will help you stay within the boundaries of the issue being discussed. If the discussion deviates from the subject at hand, make a summary of the main points and bring the attention of the participants back to the main subject. You can use phrases like: ‘It seems that we have deviated a bit from the subject, let’s return to the concept…’.

Stimulate active discussion!
Actively mime and use gestures that help support the discusional flow, without interrupting it. If the discussion dies, change the definition of the problem being discussed or use another method to look for new ideas.
Don’t let the participants turn the discussion into a conflict, but don’t suppress the expression of emotions either. Avoid over-generalising, using indefinite questions and questions with double meanings. Put concrete questions in order to support the discussion and abstract ones in order to calm things down.

An atmosphere of trust during the discussion will help make it more open and effective. Additional advice that will help you whilst conducting a discussion or to handle difficult situations is presented in Chapter 3.

**Summarise the results of the discussion immediately!**

A discussion can end both by achieving consensus (adoption of a coordinated decision), and by participants’ retaining different points of view.

In order to conclude the discussion, ask: “Would anyone else like to add something in conclusion?” Ask those who expressed the desire, to summarise the results of the discussion, for example, by asking them to list the most convincing arguments that were put forward by all sides.

If there is not enough time, the trainer can summarise the results by him or herself, taking into account all the opinions expressed by the group. Bring the attention of the group to the opinions and ideas that are connected to the issue at hand and softly correct any inaccuracies you had noted earlier during the discussion.

### Some Discussion Activities

**Take a position**

This method is useful at the beginning of work with issues and problems under discussion. It can be used at the beginning of training or a session in order to demonstrate varied points of view on the studied issue, or after the participants have already familiarised themselves with certain information and have determined possible opposing solutions to the problem. To start a discussion, it is advisable to use a question that may have opposing solutions (e.g. ‘yes’ and ‘no’), or two extended definitions of opposing points of view.

When analysing opposing points of view, the participants familiarise themselves with different positions, learn to predict the consequences of individual activities and political decisions both for society and individual citizens, apply in practice their skill to defend their own positions and learn to listen to others thus acquiring additional knowledge on a subject.

**How to organize the work:**

1. Present the problem (question for discussion). Give them a few minutes to think it over and define their position regarding the given question.
2. Place posters with the words ‘I agree’ and ‘I disagree’ on opposite sides of the room. (You can also present polar positions. For example, ‘Public Participation is Useless and Unnecessary’, ‘Public Participation is Necessary and Creates Significant Effects’). You can present three positions: ‘I agree’, ‘Don’t know, have no particular opinion’ or ‘I am opposed’.
3. Ask the participants to stand near the poster that reflects their opinion regarding the given problem (‘to vote by foot’).
4. Suggest to all those who share one particular point of view to discuss it and develop arguments together in its defence.
5. After all points of view have been presented, ask if there is anyone who has changed his or her mind. Ask such participants to come over to the other poster and explain the reasons for the conversion of opinion.
6. Ask the participants to mention the strongest arguments of their own and the opposing side.

**Change your position**

This technique is similar to the technique ‘Take a position’. It gives all the participants the chance to get involved in the discussion of the problem issue. Furthermore, it gives the participants an opportunity to understand opposing points of view and develop the skills for devising arguments, and active listening, etc.

**How to organize the work:**

1. Define the assignment for the whole group.
2. Arrange groups into four-person clusters. Split each cluster into two pairs.
3. One of the pairs in a cluster should present arguments in favour of the ‘yes’ position. The other should defend the opposing ‘no’ position. Give enough time to prepare arguments and announce the time allocated.
4. When the preparation time is up, ask the participants to present their arguments to their partners.
5. Then ask the pairs to exchange their positions and repeat everything from the beginning. This will require much less time.
6. Ask the cluster to discuss the subject freely. Now the participants have an opportunity to express their own point of view. As a result of the discussion the cluster should either reach agreement or come to the conclusion that they don’t have enough information. Determine the time frame of the free discussion in advance.

Source: [8, pp 50-59]
7. Summarise the results together with the entire group.

Discussion in a large circle ‘Microphone’
This is a technique to discuss a subject in a large circle, which gives everyone an opportunity to say something quickly, taking turns, answering questions or expressing one’s point of view or position.

How to organize the work:
1. Pose a question to participants.
2. Offer an object (pen, pencil, etc.) to be used as an imaginary microphone. The participants should pass it to one another, taking turns holding the floor.
3. Only give the floor to the person who holds the imaginary microphone.
4. Ask participants to speak in a concise and quick way (taking no longer than one minute).
5. Do not comment and do not evaluate the responses.

As an option, you can interview a few participants, approaching them with the ‘microphone’.

Unfinished sentence
This technique is often combined with the ‘microphone’ technique. It gives an opportunity to work on the form and content of expressed thoughts, and compare them with others. Work using this technique gives the participants an opportunity to overcome stereotypes, to express themselves more freely on the subject of the discussion, to develop their own skill of speaking in a concise and convincing manner.

How to organize the work:
1. Define the subject, on which the participants will have to speak.
2. Pose an unfinished sentence and ask the participants to complete it. Subsequent participants should start speaking with the words you proposed.
3. The participants should work with open sentences, for instance ‘this decision was made because…’; ‘the most important thing for me at the training is…’; or ‘for me public participation is…’.

Panel Debate
This method can be described as follows — a few people discuss the problem with an audience. This form of discussion combines the advantages of a lecture and of a group discussion. A group of three to five people conducts a discussion with the other participants present. The observers join in the discussion later, either expressing their opinion or asking the participants questions.

TV talk-show style discussion gives an opportunity to clearly express different points of view on the given problem, but you should not forget that the principal participants of the discussion should be competent enough in the given area and should be well prepared for the particular conversation. It is also important that the personal qualities of the actors do not distract from the subject of discussion, and that all participants have equal opportunities to express their points of view (their statements should be no longer than three to five minutes).

The moderator makes sure that none of the participants deviate from the given subject. The duration of such discussion should be no longer than 90 minutes.

How to organize the work:
1. Define the subject under discussion, invite the principal participants, and mention the conditions of the organisation of the discussion (duration of interventions, etc.).
2. Ask the participants in the discussion to sit in such a manner as for the ‘observers’ to sit around the table at which the principal participants sit (i.e. the observers’ tables should be put in the form of letter ‘U’).
3. To start the discussion, introduce the principal participants and announce the subject of the discussion.
4. First the principal participants will speak. Their contributions should take no longer than 20 minutes, after that you should ask the rest of participants to take part in the discussion. If necessary, remind the participants about the agenda, schedule and the need to observe proper etiquette during the discussion.
5. After the end of the discussion summarise the results, give a short analysis of the input of the principal participants.

Discussion in the form of a symposium
Just as in a TV talk-show style discussion, this type of discussion combines the advantages of both a lecture and a group discussion. This form of discussion helps professionals share their knowledge and experiences with the audience, without turning their comments into long and tedious lectures. It also makes dialogue between the listeners and the lecturer easier.

Two or three lecturers (professionals or simply the people who are very competent in the subject) express their points of view on the problem in a short form. The maximum length of each lecture should not exceed ten minutes. Then 20 minutes is given for joint discussion.

Discussion in the form of a symposium is especially effective when it is necessary for the whole group to share experiences and the results of work etc. In this case it is possible to organise the entire conference into several subject blocks, which logically supplement each other.

How to organize the work
1. In order to prepare a symposium, the trainer needs to meet the lecturers and agree on the plan of the organisation of presentations, their subjects and schedule.
2. Firstly, open the discussion, explain the subject under discussion and let the principal participants speak. Keep to the schedule.

3. After the lecturers have made their presentations, offer to everyone who wants to, the opportunity to take part in the discussion. The duration of the joint discussion is 20 to 30 minutes, while each person’s input should not be longer than two or three minutes. Try to get as many participants as possible involved in the conversation. If needed, remind the participants about the agenda, schedule and need to observe proper etiquette during the debates.

4. After the conclusion of this joint discussion, summarise the results of the discussion as a whole. Lecturers may answer the questions.

Discussion in the form of a debate
Discussion in the form of a debate can be used when a very complex or controversial problem is discussed, and the opinions of the participants differ sharply from one another. The purpose of this form of discussion is to teach the participants to express their points of view in a comprehensive, strictly logical way, but at the same time in a calm and friendly manner. The participants should be able to present arguments ‘for’ and ‘against’ the discussed idea and try to persuade opponents and observers alike that their position is the right one.

During the training it is the ‘Carl Popper’s debate format’ that is used most often. It was especially created to encourage cooperation and team spirit. The participants in the debate work in teams of three people. The teams prepare to defend opposing points of view on the problem.

The subject of the debate is a certain statement, defined roughly in a way questions brought out for referenda are usually defined. For example, Public Participation Must Become an Inseparable Element of All Environmentally Significant Decisions Being Made. The first team assumes the advocate position trying to prove the statement with the help of arguments in its favour and refute the arguments of the opposing side. The opposing team argues against the statement and the arguments in favour of it, put forward by the asserting side. The duration of each participant’s contribution to the debate is strictly limited.

How to organise work
1. Divide the participants into two groups. Give the participants an opportunity to choose for themselves, which point of view they will defend, or arrange them into random groups.

2. Explain the subject and rules of the debate: preparation time for groups is 10 to 15 minutes. If the debate subject is new to the participants, give them the necessary information and more time for preparation. Representatives of each group should speak in turn, according to the schedule, shown on the table below. Each group has the right for three presentations.

3. During preparation, participants assign roles to members of the group and decide how to use the allocated time in the best way. Representatives of one group can ask questions to representatives of other groups, as well as comment on the arguments of their opponents. The groups can use drawings, charts and other visual aids. Representatives of the groups should agree on the order of their presentations.

4. Start the debate. Whilst giving participants the right to speak, keep to the schedule.

5. To conclude the debate, you can ask the participants to fill out a questionnaire or do a secret ballot in order to determine which team was the most convincing.

6. Make a summary, and if you utilised a jury, ask them to speak.

**Carl Popper’s debate format:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Floor</th>
<th>Speaker</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First presentation of the asserting side</td>
<td>A1</td>
<td>6 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First round of questions by the opposing side to the asserting side</td>
<td>O3 and A1</td>
<td>3 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First presentation by the opposing side</td>
<td>O1</td>
<td>6 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First round of questions by the asserting side to the opposing side</td>
<td>A3 and O1</td>
<td>3 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second presentation of the asserting side</td>
<td>A2</td>
<td>5 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second round of questions by the opposing side to the asserting side</td>
<td>O1 and A2</td>
<td>3 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second presentation by the opposing side</td>
<td>O2</td>
<td>5 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second round of questions by the asserting side to the opposing side</td>
<td>A1 and O2</td>
<td>3 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third presentation of the asserting side</td>
<td>A3</td>
<td>5 minutes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third presentation by the opposing side</td>
<td>O3</td>
<td>5 minutes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Both teams may take up to 8 minutes for preparation during the round.

http://www.idebate.org/info/russian/whatsdebate.asp

Apart from the already mentioned types of discussion, there are some other types that can sometimes be useful in training practice: ‘Round Table’, ‘Expert Group Meeting’, ‘Concentric Circles’, ‘6x6x6’.

**Round Table**

Round Table — is a conversation within a not very big group (not more than five participants), whose members discuss a certain question, communicating both with each other and with all the other participants as the ‘audience of the ‘round table discussion’.
Expert Group Meeting

Expert Group Meeting (loop-type discussion) — exchange of opinions in a group of four to six participants with a chair who is appointed in advance. It has two stages: 1) discussion of the selected problem by all participants in the small group; 2) presentation of the position of the group in the form of short (three to five minutes) statements by each of its members to the entire audience. Discussion of this position with the audience is not envisaged.

Concentric Circles

Concentric Circles — during the starting phase similar to the ‘round table’, but the communication between the members of the working group and the audience takes place in the form of exchange of roles; the working group becomes the audience and the audience turns into a discussion group.

6 x 6 x 6

6 x 6 x 6 — simultaneous discussion of a certain problem by six groups, (each comprised of six participants), for six minutes. After this the facilitator creates six new groups, each of six participants, who previously discussed six different subjects. This method is similar to the ‘mosaic’ method.

Among the methods utilised to work with discussion matters there are more simple ones. They are used in the capacity of elements of the more complex methods, for example work in small groups, mini-lectures, and the like. It is to this group of methods that Brainstorming and Multi-voting belong [17].

Brainstorming

Brainstorming is a well-known interactive technology for collective discussion. It is widely used in order to develop several decisions to a certain problem. Brainstorming stimulates creative abilities, facilitates involvement of all the participants in the process and gives everyone an opportunity to express their own opinion.

How to organise work

1. After presenting the problem and defining the subject in question, please make sure that everyone understands what the discussion is going to be about. Define the question clearly. For example, Possible Barriers for the Public to Take Part in Decision-making or What are the Advantages of Public Participation?
2. Ask the participants to express ideas, comments, cite phrases or words related to this problem. Don’t interrupt the process of expressing ideas. At this stage, one of the following methods can be used:
   - Circles: Go around the group asking each participant to offer up an idea.
   - Popcorn: The participants speak freely — until everyone has expressed all their ideas.
3. Put all the ideas on a board or a big sheet of paper in the order of appearance, without remarks, comments or questions. Don’t miss even one expressed idea. Don’t discuss and don’t criticise suggested ideas. Otherwise the participants will focus on grounding their own point of view and will stop generating new and better ideas.
4. Stimulate all of the participants to generate the biggest number of ideas. Quantity will become quality. It is important to support and note even the most fantastic ideas.
5. Ask the participants to develop or change the ideas of the others. Combining or changing previously expressed ideas often leads to creation of new ideas, much better in comparison with the original ones.

Multi-voting

This method uses several rounds of voting in order to select the most important ideas from a large number of alternatives. Selection is conducted through a series of voting rounds, each round reducing the number on the previous list by precisely one half. Using this method, even a list of 30-50 questions can be reduced to a more acceptable number after about four or five consecutive voting rounds. Multi-voting usually follows brainstorming, to determine questions that should be the focus of future discussions.

How to organize the work

1. Make a list of questions and assign a number to every question.
2. If the group agrees, combine two or more similar questions into one.
3. If necessary, change the numbers of the groups of questions.
4. Ask all the participants to choose and prioritise the most important questions with the help of coloured sticky notes or in some other way. Voting may be done in an open way, simply by raising one’s hand when the corresponding question is read aloud.
5. Put down the numbers of the selected questions on a separate sheet of paper. The number of selected questions should not exceed one third of the total number of questions on the list.
6. Count all votes.
7. In order to shrink the list, remove the questions that attract the least number of votes. Here, the minimum number of votes, is determined by the number of participants. As a rule, if the group is not large (five or less), cross out the questions that have attracted less than two votes. If the group is of medium size, (from 6 to 15 persons), remove all of the questions that attracted less than three votes. In large groups (more than 15 people), remove the questions that attracted less than four votes.
8. Repeat the actions described in points three to six with the list of remaining questions until the number of questions reaches a desirable figure. If the list doesn’t shrink due to equal distribution of votes, select the question that is considered the most important by everyone.
Case study

Case studies are used in order to review real-life situations and examples in a sort of ‘slow-motion’. Case studies serve as examples for generalisations, provide grounds for a high level of abstraction and thought, demonstrate human feelings and emotions and help connect new theoretic material with real-life creating an opportunity to apply acquired knowledge in practical terms. This method is used whilst conducting training on the Aarhus Convention in order to analyse the viewpoints of different stakeholders in the decision-making process, as well as in order to study the consensus-building process. For example, a study of the situation in which local authorities make decisions allowing the construction of a game park, which can lead to cutting down a part of the natural forest, allows us to examine various factors that influence the decision-making by local authorities, and to develop skills for consensus-building. Case studies are also effectively used to reinforce knowledge when examining matters related to access to justice.

Conducting exercises using case studies involves the following main steps: presenting the case to the participants, studying and analysing the case independently, analysing the case in a group and developing the solution, selecting the solution and summarising the results.

Prepare the problem case in advance!
When developing the description of a case (example, dilemma), it is necessary to provide sufficient information to the participants. Different sides of a conflict should necessarily be studied, as well as the opposing positions and interests of the actors. If a situation is of a dilemma type, its description should contain the four main components of the description of a dilemma: general context of the dilemma; introduction to the choice that the dilemma offers; equally strong arguments ‘for’ and ‘against’ should be put forward and the proposal to make a clear choice in the end. Check, how clearly the case is described and whether all the information is necessary to solve the problem.

Arrange participants into small groups!
The optimal size of the group for case study analysis would be between six and ten people. It is advisable that there are people of different educational, professional and vocational backgrounds in each group. If the common group is quite large, divide it into sub-groups, and have each of them deal with one of the aspects of the given problem. If needed, introduce an element of competition by instructing the groups to attempt to solve the problem within a certain time frame.

Clearly define exercise goals and individual and group assignments!
Instructions should be clear and concise. Having handed out the description of the case, make sure the participants understand the root of the problem. If necessary, ask the participants to select one problem so that during the process it can be studied in greater detail. Be prepared to give explanations where necessary.

Give participants time to individually study the situation!
Explain that each and every participant should read the description of the situation, highlight the problem and select the method that can be used to analyse it. Stimulate the participants so that they define the necessary facts and missing information and start developing a course of action.

Stimulate sub-groups work!
Watch the work of every group. From time to time go around the groups to ensure each participant has an opportunity to express and justify their position. Stimulate the conduct of situation analysis and the process of agreement on recommended action. Ask the groups to prepare reports on the results of their work.

Conduct joint discussion!
Discussion is an important component of any exercise. It facilitates the exchange of experiences, aids in working out every aspect of a situation and correct possible errors. Before the exercise, prepare questions needed to conduct a discussion. Study the situation on your own, in order to be able to freely answer the questions, give comments and explain in a well-grounded way the new variants of a decision [8, p. 39].

Questions in order to analyse a situation and conduct a discussion

Variant 1:
- Facts. What is happening? Where and when? Who has contributed to the problem? What do we know about them? Which facts are useful and which are of secondary importance? What is fact and what is opinion?
• **The reason for the situation.** What is the conflict about? What questions is it necessary to review in order to solve the problem? What are the interests belonging to each side? Why do they oppose each other?

• **Arguments.** What arguments can be drawn in support of each side? What documents or information can we rely upon whilst defending one or another position?

• **Decision.** What can be the solution for the situation? Why this particular solution? What is the choice of such a solution based on? Are there any other ways to solve the problem?

### Variant 2:
- What problem is presented in the example?
- How do different people see this situation?
- What can be done in order to solve it?

### Some Case Study Activities

#### Problem-solving exercises
Use of this technique teaches the participants how to solve problems independently as well as to make decisions collectively.

**How to organise work**

1. Prepare the problem assignment, the problem case.
2. Explain the case to the participants and define the core of the problem. Make sure the assignment is clear to everyone. If needed, provide additional information.
3. Arrange the participants into groups, so they discuss the problem before starting to look for solutions.
4. Using the ‘brainstorming’ technique, create as many different variants of the solution to the problem, as possible. During this stage consider each and every possible solution. A large number of ideas should be generated.
5. Together with the participants analyse, clarify and merge the expressed ideas.
6. Discuss the possible positive and negative consequences of each suggested solution.
7. Choose the best variant and agree on the selection with everyone (this can be done by voting or according to the rules used to reach consensus).
8. In case the chosen solution is unacceptable or ineffective, choose two alternative variants and reach an agreement regarding their use.

**Stages in the process of problem solving:**
- Define the core of the problem.
- Define the significance of the problem.

#### Tree of solutions
As a variant of a technique to be used to solve a problem, a ‘tree of solutions’ can be used, which helps the participants to analyze and better understand the mechanisms of making complex decisions. The method is similar to the one described above, but the search for proposed solutions is carried out according to a certain scheme.

**How to organize the work**

1. Define and put on the whiteboard (blackboard) the problem assignment or the problem case.
2. Make sure the assignment is clear to everyone. Give the necessary additional information. Make sure that the participants understand the importance of the solution of the problem for the actors of the case.
3. Using the ‘brainstorming’ technique, create as many different variants of the solution to the problem as possible. At this stage not even one solution is discarded. A large number of ideas should be generated.
4. Discuss the variants of solution of the problem using the following question: ‘What positive and what negative aspects will this solution bring to each side?’ Choose three or four possible solutions.
Role-play

Role-play (role play and simulation play) imitates reality. Role-play is understood as a certain simulation of a real-life situation for training purposes, its reproduction is a ‘playback’ by the participants. Playing through a real situation the participants have an opportunity to reproduce it in a simplified form and study the procedures related to the function of civil institutions, within a framework of an economical, political and cultural life of one or another country, which is especially important in order to conduct trainings on the Aarhus Convention.

The goal of such plays is to reflect certain phenomena, mechanisms (procedure of decision-making by local self-governmental bodies, mechanisms for increasing an income of an enterprise, etc.) and to discover any irregularities. They facilitate the study of different viewpoints and approaches towards solving the problem, as well as practising behavioural skills for a new situation, the perfection of abilities and inter-personal skills of working, and a change in attitude and values.

For example, a role-play is an effective method to ‘work through’ the skills of organising a dialogue between the stakeholders and those studying the process of public participation in decision-making. A role-play, simulating a meeting between local authorities and the members of a neighbourhood committee, centred on concerns over the worsening health conditions of their children because of emissions from a nearby industry, can provoke discussion about the importance of public involvement in supervision and prevention of pollution. The participants who play the roles of local authorities may demonstrate or develop their communication skills, as well as study ways to provide information. The participants who perform the roles of public representatives can demonstrate the significance of the issue for the local population, as well as their ability to express their concern and present good arguments to demonstrate the need for action. After having conducted a role-play, the trainer starts a discussion resulting in the participants’ defining the problem, its causes and different opinions on the matter, developing a potential strategy to enhance communication between the representatives of the authorities and the public on environmental matters and risks.

Plays are created using clearly defined (by law or by tradition), known roles and course of events, reproduced by the participants: hearings in court or in parliament, public hearings, assemblies, commission meetings, etc. They are built upon well-developed scripts and are used to acquire new knowledge that is hard to receive by traditional methods.

Any of the plays only presents the problem. Its interpretation and the conclusions of the participants are provided for by the structured discussion that follows afterwards and necessarily includes analysis of observations and experiences received during the exercise. In conclusion it is necessary to emphasise the main points, make conclusions and summarise [6].
practical advices

Plan work in advance!
Prepare the scenario and instructions for all the roles in written form. The description should be clear and concise so as to aid the participants play their roles accurately. Thoroughly plan the timing of the play. Explaining the rules of play should take up no more than 10 to 15% of the time, while preparation in small groups takes up 15-20%, presentation and discussion — another 20-50%, and the summary 15% of the time.

Establish a friendly and safe atmosphere!
Before beginning a role-play, arouse interest in the participants. Show the connection between this exercise and the previous and the next training sessions. Do not start the day with a role-play. Use it only after the participants get acquainted and establish good relationships.

Define the goals of the exercise!
Clearly describe the goals of the exercise. Give an example of what the participants will have learned as an outcome of the exercise.

Make the participants familiar with the context of the play!
Explain to the participants the previous history of the problem and the situation that has developed. Describe the characters and present all the necessary information.

When distributing roles, use volunteers!
The most effective way to distribute roles is through voluntary choice. Let all the volunteers choose for themselves the roles they like. If you are sure that certain participants will be able to receive the experience they need or will be able to successfully act out a particular role, invite them to take part in the play. It is important to make the exercise as effective as possible. Therefore if a participant refuses to take a role, don’t force the issue but offer it to volunteers.

Get the whole group involved, using observers!
Invite the rest of the participants to play the role of observers and give them a certain task. Connect the task with the goal of the role-play and put it on the whiteboard or place it in the handouts.

Give instructions to those performing roles and give them time to prepare!
Assist the participants in performing their roles. If the context of the play allows, it is desirable to arrange the participants in small groups or pairs in order for them to prepare their roles. Ask the performers to rehearse the roles in a different room.

Organise the stage!
Prepare everything necessary to conduct the role-play. Place the furniture in an appropriate manner and prepare equipment for the performers. Help the performers take their places on the ‘stage’. Present them as the characters of the role-play.

Watch the time!
During the role-play, watch the time. If time is up, tactfully stop the play at the most logically appropriate moment. In case several variants of the play are performed (with the help of different players and situations), control the process of transition from one group of performers to the next. Separately give observers a short while for their comments.

Conduct discussion and analysis of the role-play!
Help the participants to ‘come out’ of their roles. Discuss in detail the situation that was played out, first with the performers and then with the observers. Make use of the following questions:

- How did you feel whilst performing this or that role?
- What did you like during the course of the play, and what didn’t you like?
- Was the problem solved? Why? How was it solved?
- What was your plan? What did you try to achieve? How did your behavior influence the other characters?
- What other line of conduct could possibly have been chosen?
- Have you ever found yourself in similar situations?
- In what way will this experience influence your future behaviour in real-life situations?

Ask the observers, what moments corresponding to the goals of the play they noticed during the course of the role-play. Discussion is the time when the participants have the opportunity to formulate the knowledge they received as an outcome of the exercise, as well as to think about what behavioural models will be most appropriate in real life.

Make a summary!
This step ends the activity and allows participants to go on to the next activities. Emphasise the importance of the activity they have just conducted and how their doing it prepared them for the remaining part of the training programme.
Public hearings

Public hearings are carried out by bodies of legislative power in order to receive information about how laws and other decisions will affect the interests of citizens. Public hearings may also be organised by different stakeholders, non-governmental organisations or unions in order to study public opinion [8, p 45.]

The purpose of this technique is to simulate a public hearing. This allows the participants to understand the goals and the procedures for conducting the hearings, and to familiarise themselves with the responsibilities of the staff members of governmental bodies. The participants also receive practical experience in defining and presenting ideas, interests and values, related to the subject of hearings. Furthermore, participants have the opportunity to observe and evaluate lines of conduct by opposing and different sides.

How to organise work

1. Prepare the room. Set up the table for the ‘law-makers’ in the front part of the audience, as well as the table for the secretary and a table and a podium for the speakers.

2. Prepare name-cards with the participants’ names and positions, and place them on the tables. Explain the roles:

   - **Law-makers**
     The selected lawmakers conduct the hearings. They announce the presentations of the speakers and make decisions on the subjects discussed. A chairman should be selected from among the lawmakers.

   - **Stakeholders**
     Arrange a few groups of stakeholders (no more than five persons in each group). Each group presents to the committee its viewpoint regarding the matter. It is necessary to have an odd number of groups, because they speak ‘in favour’ or ‘against’ the issue under discussion. (The number and size of groups depends on the subject and the number of participants in the training session). It is necessary to present several points of view that correspond to the real points of view in a particular local community. Each group selects its own speaker who presents to the committee the point of view of the group.

   - **Secretary**
     It is necessary to choose a secretary who will document the meeting and take notes of all proposals that will be made.

   - **Timekeeper**
     It is necessary to choose a person who will keep the time of the presentations/interventions, so that each group has an opportunity to present their opinion.

3. Explain to the participants the goal of the public hearings and the rules for the meeting. If necessary, distribute the instructions for participation in the public hearings.

   - The chairman opens the hearings, announces the goal of the activity, the rules of work and the schedule of presentations.

   - The invited speaker presents his or her position during two minutes. Later, he or she answers questions from the committee in no more than three minutes.

   - First the chairman asks the presenter his or her questions, then the ‘members’ of the organisation or the representatives of the governmental structure, who carry out the hearing. The members of the presenter’s group may help him or her answer questions from the committee.

4. Arrange the participants into groups of five people or less:

   • One group will represent the lawmakers or the commission, who are carrying out the hearing. The number of the participants should be odd.

   • Other groups represent the citizens, the staff of the non-governmental organisation, interested in the subject under discussion.

5. Give the participants enough time to develop positions and prepare to conduct the hearing.

6. Conduct the hearing.

7. When all the presenters have been heard, the members of the governmental structure or the non-governmental organisation that initiated the hearing analyse the arguments, discuss the problems and make an announcement about their future actions.

8. Analyse the exercise in the following order:

   • Discuss the facts and arguments, related to the subject.

   • Discuss the opinion of the participants regarding the public hearings as a way of solving the problems of public importance and defining state policy.

   • Discuss how effectively the hearing has been, and in what way it can be made more effective in the future.

   • Discuss other matters that the participants came up with.
2.7. Prepare training materials

Well-prepared training materials help in conducting both the entire training and each individual session. For example, a short text with information on the subject will help keep the participants from getting distracted by having to take excessive notes. Specially prepared questionnaires and forms will assist greatly in the performance of certain exercises, and brief information will help the participants deepen their knowledge on an individual basis.

**practical advices**

Select corresponding information from the User Guide 'Implementing the Aarhus Convention' and print it in advance!

User Guides ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention’ contain information on all matters related to the implementation of the Convention. A specific extract of information will help the training participants to not only do exercises immediately in the process of training, but also to use the necessary information after the completion of the training in their working place.

Prepare all materials in advance!
Having prepared all the necessary slides, handouts and assignments in advance, you will be able to avoid any additional stress just before the start of the training.

2.8. Take care of logistics

Logistics is as important as a well-developed programme. Good organisation initially creates a favourable working atmosphere for the participants at the training venue [17].

The checklist for the trainer, presented below, will be useful to check preparation for the training.

**practical advices**

Before the training:
- Be sure to distribute invitations to the participants and get confirmation that they will attend.
- Reserve and prepare a room to conduct the training in. The room should not be too large, about three to five square meters per person, with good acoustics, ventilation, lighting and comfortable chairs etc. Arrange the furniture in such a way that the seating of the participants corresponds to your goals.
- Think in advance about necessary materials for training: pens, notebooks, handout materials and programme.
- Determine what equipment you will want to use: flip chart (white board with a large notebook), projector and computer, etc. Order it, if necessary. Take care of additional materials: markers, scotch tape, etc.
- Jot down small notes for yourself covering the course of each activity, which you may need with you during each session.

At the last minute
- Send out information about the place and time when the activity is to take place, along with instructions on how to get to the place, contact numbers, and materials that participants have to bring with them.
- Decide how you will organise meals and coffee breaks.
- Decide how you will evaluate the training or seminar and what will be necessary for the evaluation.

• Come early, check preparations and relax a bit.
• If the room where the training will take place is difficult to find, hang up direction signs.
• Check if the room is ready, equipment is in order and all materials are ready. Organise the materials in such a way that you will know where can you find what, including the training evaluation forms.
• Write the goals and objectives of the training clearly on the whiteboard or a slide. Also put on the whiteboard, flip chart or a slide the assignments that you will use to conduct exercises, as well as the time allocated for them.
**At the time when you conduct the activity**

- When participants start to gather, greet them, creating a favourable atmosphere. Distribute badges and handouts, if necessary.
- Start on time. Do not forget to introduce yourself and give participants an opportunity to do the same. After greeting participants and conducting an 'ice-breaker' exercise, present an overview of the entire training, including goals and programme. Stress when you have planned breaks.
- Stick to the break schedule and never continue training after the allocated time.
- Do not forget to incorporate into each session time to think over how the acquired knowledge can be applied in practice and to summarise the outcomes.
- If you are conducting a written training evaluation, give participants time to think it over and complete forms. Try to collect all the forms before the participants leave the room.
- At the beginning of a session ask participants to register, giving their personal details, such as full name and surname (and patronymic), address, telephone number and e-mail address.
- Before the training is over, allocate time to answer questions that may remain in the participants’ minds.
- If you work in a group of trainers, gather after conducting the training and conduct a short evaluation. Introduce modifications to the programme, if necessary.
- Tidy the room after the end of an activity.
Chapter 3. How to conduct effective and successful training

A well-developed programme and training materials only partly guarantee the success of the training. A more important role is played by the trainer’s ability to organise the process of education, i.e. to create a positive atmosphere, to be in touch with the level of interest and the development of relationships between the participants, to stimulate discussion and skilfully make transitions from one part of the training to another and so forth. In order to accomplish this task you need to pay attention to the following things:

- Watch and work with the group dynamics.
- Create a favourable atmosphere and establish a rapport with the participants.
- Maintain the interest of the participants and raise the degree of absorption of knowledge during training.
- Work with different target groups.
- Answer difficult questions.
- Be ready to extricate yourself from complicated situations and to deal with ‘difficult’ participants.

3.1. What to know about group dynamics?

In the work of any group there are three issues on the mental agenda of each participant. They can be symbolically called I, We and It [21].

Matters related to ‘I’ encompass the personal emotions and thoughts of a trainer and of every participant: Who am I and how do I feel? What am I concerned about? How do I experience my role in this group? How am I received by the group? They are also connected with the I — We relationships.

Matters related to ‘We’ are matters of behaviour of the participants toward each other. For instance, the culture of the meetings, politeness and everything that is related to our relationships with other members of the group. Who is allowed to speak? Who makes decisions within a group, and how are decisions arrived at? Whose opinions are important? Do we make room for different opinions?

Matters related to ‘It’ are those concerning the subject of a training or a meeting — the actual reason for coming together, no matter whether it is to do business or for educational or other purposes. What do we do together? What do we need to discuss, in order to reach a result?

German researchers Lahnmark and Braun compare the phenomenon of group activities to an iceberg (figure 5). The business aspect — discussions on the subject, working with texts, facilitation of receiving information — comes to the surface. The psychosocial aspects, consisting of the group’s emotional experiences as well as the unspoken contracts between them on what constitutes appropriate behaviour, often lay hidden under the surface of the water [3, p. 54-55].

Quite often the trainer tries to achieve the maximum effect from the very beginning of the meeting, resisting any deviations from ‘It’ — the business agenda. At the same time everyone has an ‘I’ and a ‘We’ lying waiting under the surface. These unexpected matters may ‘float to the surface’ and devour the time and energy of the group, restraining the effectiveness of work to the level it had in the beginning stage.

The task of every trainer is to maintain a balance between the business and psychosocial aspects, ‘I’ and ‘We’. If, instead of suppressing the ‘I’ and ‘We’, the trainer consciously pays attention to them and encourages them to ‘float to the surface’ with the help of exercises such as ‘Getting Acquainted’, ‘Expectations’ and ‘Icebreakers’, etc., then, having spent more time on them in the beginning, s/he will be able to save considerable time later on.

Therefore, pay special attention to the introductory part of training. If you are successful in giving sufficient space to the I and We, the balance of interest will soon shift and the group will become an effective working group, where people enjoy meetings, express their creative abilities and feel that they can discuss matters that are important to them. Establishing a balance between ‘Me, Us, It’, is called positive group dynamics (figure 6).

A group with a positive dynamic learns step by step how to satisfy its business and psychosocial
needs, both each person’s individual needs and the needs of the whole group as well as the need to achieve the goal of the session/training.

**What stages of group dynamics exist?**

As a trainer you have not only to observe and facilitate the work of the group, but also to evaluate the development of group dynamics, and effectively intervene, if the group dynamic hampers the effective implementation of the training. According to Tackman’s model, a group goes through five major stages in the development of a group process (group dynamics): formation, storm, getting normal, maximum output capacity, parting [1].

---

**practical advices**

**During each stage, change your actions in order to ensure positive group dynamics!**

The table below provides some advice on what activities to use at each stage.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Attributes</th>
<th>Main tasks for the trainer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Formation               | • The participants have not yet decided, what role they should accept, or don’t know what roles the others will accept  
                          | • On a non-verbal level the participants are communicating diffidence  
                          | • Nobody wants to ‘stick their neck out’, mediocrity is supported  
                          | • Explain the goals of the training, discover doubts  
                          | • Encourage participants to formulate their own goals  
                          | • If the participants are not acquainted — conduct an introduction session  
                          | • Establish norms and rules of work  
                          | • Carry out the first assignments of the work plan |
| Storm                   | • A leader or leaders appear within the group  
                          | • The participants start manifesting their attitude towards what’s going on  
                          | • Negative behaviour may emerge, i.e. such that could hinder or sabotage the work of the group  
                          | • Conflict arises  
                          | • ‘Difficult’ participants emerge  
                          | • Questions to the participants regarding their expectations (diary of wishes and remarks)  
                          | • Moderate the work  
                          | • Make sure aggressive behaviour is ‘de-fused’ and the energy used in a positive way  
                          | • Formation of goals |
| Getting normal          | • Acceptance of the training  
                          | • The participants clearly understand the assignment, take part in discussion, openly express their opinions, learn  
                          | • The group functions efficiently without trainer’s attention, a facilitator may arise from among the members of the group  
                          | • Cooperation, mutual support and mutual perception  
                          | • Secure an efficient workflow and the flow of the training process  
                          | • Summarise the work of the group, moderate the training  
                          | • Gather feedback information from the participants |
| Maximum output capacity  | • The group starts functioning as an effective group  
                          | • The members of the group take part in doing the assignments, bringing in their ideas, analysing the ideas of the others  
                          | • Compare the group’s activity with the goals and assess their capability to apply the knowledge they receive in exercises and assignments  
                          | • Evaluation of the work of the group against established criteria |
| Parting                 | • Summarising the results of the work  
                          | • Determining the prospects of cooperation  
                          | • Exchanging contact information  
                          | • Comparing the results of the group process with the tasks of the training  
                          | • Stimulating the preparation of individual plans  
                          | • Expressing gratitude for the creative worky |

---

**Note that all groups develop in different ways!**

It is worth noting that in reality the work of the group can have a wave-like character — the group can ‘back out’ of some stages or ‘jump into’ others.
3.2. How to create a positive atmosphere and establish rapport with participants

The first minutes of training are the most important ones, because it’s at that time when the basis for the future work, as well as for the success of the whole training, is laid.

The introductory part of training includes 4 main elements:

1. Presentation of the contents of the programme (what knowledge and skills will the participants obtain during the training) and of the schedule (what follows what, when does the work start and finish, when are the breaks) of the training.
2. Introducing participants to each other.
3. Development of rules for group work at the time of the training.
4. Discovering expectations and fears (concerns) of the participants.

The order of these elements may vary. The duration of the introductory part depends on the full duration of the training. Usually it’s one session, before the first break [5, 53].

practical advices

Be with the participants before the start of the training!
The trainer’s work starts a few minutes ahead of the time when the official programme starts. When people first arrive for the training they usually feel a bit diffident, and it is advisable that the trainer uses this time to greet the participants in an informal manner to get acquainted with them and receive useful information about their expectations.

Start with a short introduction!
Welcome the participants and announce the subject of the training and its goals. Present the programme of the training. Give information about its duration and the planned breaks. If necessary, explain the essence of the interactive training method and the need for active participation. Give an opportunity to ask questions about the goals and objectives as well as the opportunity to express ideas or concerns.

Briefly introduce yourself. If you took part in similar courses earlier, speak briefly about this as well as about your impressions. Ask the participants of the training about their experiences related to the subject of the seminar.

Be sure to carry out an interactive getting-acquainted session!
There are different methods to organise getting-acquainted sessions. The selection of the most appropriate one depends on the duration of the training, special characteristics of the participants and on how comfortable you feel whilst using one method or another.

To enable participants to get to know each other you can ask them to briefly introduce themselves or to introduce the person next to them, after a short conversation with him or her, asking them to talk about their job and hobbies, etc. To organise the getting-acquainted session you can use a tennis ball and ask the participants to pass it to each other at random. The one who catches the ball will introduce themselves. It is also possible to use various symbols (on postcards, for instance). After the participants have picked the symbols for themselves, they introduce themselves and explain why they picked those particular symbols.

Don’t be afraid to experiment and use more complex methods in order to get acquainted!
For instance, this method called ‘Profile’ was used during training on access to environmental information, conducted for representatives of different ministries and departments with representatives of the public and the mass media. (The number of participants ranged from 10 to more than 40, and the training lasted between two and three days, sometimes more). The duration of the exercise is 60 minutes.

The participants are arranged into groups of three persons. Each group receives a set of markers or pencils, flashlight, scotch tape and large sheets of paper. Then they are asked to draw a profile of each of the participants according to the following rules. A large sheet of paper is attached to the wall. One of the participants, whose profile will be drawn, stands with his side turned to the sheet of paper. The second participant, using the flashlight creates a shadow of the profile of the first participant on the wall. The third participant draws the profile of the first participant on the paper. After this the third participant carries out an interview with the first participant. The questions may be about the participant’s experience, their hobbies, why he or she decided to...
attend the training and what he or she expects from the training, etc. The responses are written on the paper beside the image of the first participant. Then the participants have to change roles and create profiles for everyone else. Finally, all the portraits and the results of the interviews are hung up on the walls, and the whole group studies the resulting profiles. The trainer can also participate in the exercise.

**Set up the rules of work inside the group!**

Discuss with the group the rules developed in advance, and include their proposals. Observing the rules in the course of training will help you organize a group and create the conditions for successful effective work (see some examples of an introductory part on the next page and in Annex 5). I recommend the inclusion of the following in the list of rules:

- be on time;
- speak in turn;
- speak on your own behalf;
- be positive;
- no-one can force anyone else to speak, people only speak when they are willing to do so.

**Evaluate the expectations of the participants!**

One possibility to begin a session is to evaluate participants’s expectations. Start by giving a few examples of answers, then ask the participants what they expect from the session, and put the most important things on the whiteboard or on the flip-chart. Then explain, in what way the course or session may help them reach their individual goals, expressed in the expectations. At the end of the session return to this list of expectations, evaluating the results.

This example of exercise ‘Expectations’ is very simple. Ask the participants what they expect from the training and put the main points on the whiteboard. This exercise can be combined with the getting-acquainted exercise.

**Use the exercises to create atmosphere!**

In order to break the ice and create a positive rapport between the participants and the trainer, both the previous and some other ‘ice-breaker’ exercises can help to create a good atmosphere. When training is conducted over many days, having an ice-breaker at the beginning of each day helps the participants tune in to the spirit of cooperation and stimulates them to actively participate.

---

**Introductory part of training**

Duration of training: 1.5 days
Duration of the introductory part: 90 minutes

1. **Introduction of the goal, tasks, and the training programme**  
   10 minutes

   Greet the audience and express your gratitude to all who have come to the training. Announce the goals and tasks of the training (you can use slides prepared in advance). Prepare the training programme, paying attention to the stages and schedule of work (it is advisable to prepare the programme in the form of handouts and put it in the participants’ folders).

   The training schedule can also be put on a big sheet of paper (A1 size) and placed on the wall.

2. **Introducing the trainers and experts**  
   5 minutes

   Briefly introduce yourself, other trainers, experts, representatives of the project, guests etc.

3. **Introduction**  
   15 minutes

   Select one of the variants of interactive introduction, which you like the most. (Other methods of how to organise a ‘Getting acquainted’ session can be found in Annex 1).

   You can use the method ‘Snow ball’, as follows.

   - All the participants stand in a circle.
   - The first volunteer says his or her own name as well as an adjective that corresponds to some trait of his or her character and starts with the same letter as the name.
   - The next participant in the circle repeats the name and adjective that he or she heard from the previous participant, then gives their own.
   - The next participant repeats the names and adjectives of the two previous participants — and so it goes on until the circle comes to an end.

4. **Accepting the rules of group work**  
   15 minutes

   Ask the participants why rules necessary in life. Ask those present to set the rules for work at the training, which are typical rules.

   Announce each rule separately and ask how the participants understand it, and if the audience agrees with it, and then put it on the whiteboard/ blackboard or on the flip-chart. Then once again draw the participants’ attention to the list and ask them if they are ready to work according to...
3.3. How to maintain participants’ interest and raise the level of knowledge absorption during training

While conducting a session the trainer needs to assist students to work fruitfully in the group in order to achieve the set goals. An important tool is the organisation of a discussion among all group members seated in a circle. In order to stimulate the absorption of complex aspects of the content, to facilitate the creation by the participants of their own understanding and the development of their own opinions on the subject of the session, the trainer needs to be capable of asking the right questions and giving right answers to the questions of the group, capable of paraphrasing the statements of the participants, capable of summarising information, encouraging participants and applying strategies of work to different groups of students [17, 14, 5].

These rules. Carry out a democratic procedure to adopt the rules.

We recommend including the following rules in the list of rules:

- come on time;
- speak in turn;
- speak on behalf of yourself;
- be positive;
- no one can force anyone else to speak, people only speak when they are willing to do so.

When listing the rules, you can assign numbers (1, 2, 3, …) so that in case a rule is violated it would be possible to say: ‘Sergei, you are violating rule number 2’.

Ask the participants if they have anything to add to the list of rules. Remind them that the rules should be realistic and possible to implement. Put on the list all the additional rules that the participants agree on. Agree on a gesture (for example, open palms on the face level) or a word (for example, the word ‘rules’), that you will use in case the rules are violated. Put the list of rules somewhere in the audience so that you can return to it if needed.

5. Expectations and anxieties 20 minutes

In order to assess expectations you can use the method of ‘unfinished sentence’. Ask every participant to think of and complete two sentences: ‘I expect from the seminar …’ and ‘At this seminar I would like to avoid …’. These can be expressed by the participants verbally in a circle or can be put on sticky notes (post-it notes) of different colours.

Thereafter the participants can explain their expectations and anxieties in groups of 6. Simultaneously they will stick their notes on large sheets of paper, classifying them by colour.

You can also ask the participants to ‘write a question that you would like answered during the training’. These questions can be written on separate coloured cards and discussed together with the expectations and anxieties (other ideas about how to carry out this part are presented in Annex 2).

6. Ice breaker 25 minutes

In order to create a favourable atmosphere and to overcome any psychological discomfort, the ‘Coat of Arms’ method can be used. In order to use it, you will need a handout with a picture of coat of arms (see Annex 6).

Ask the participants to answer the questions you ask by filling in the ‘windows’ in the schematically drawn coat of arms. Emphasise, that the answer should be given in the form of a drawing, chart or an icon, or a symbolic sign. There is a ‘window’ for every question, and the last question should be answered in the line beneath the coat of arms.

Ask the participants to answer the following questions:

- what are the two things that I do best of all;
- what is my greatest success in life;
- what do I look like in the eyes of my colleagues;
- what do I look like in the eyes of my subordinates;
- what is my professional dream;
- what are the three words that I would like to hear in my address;
- what is my credo in life (in profession).

Invite someone to open one ‘window’ and say what is pictured there and what he or she wanted to express by means of this picture. All who are present take turns to speak. If there is not enough time, you can ask every participant to choose and open just one ‘window’, whichever they like, instead of opening all of them.

Ask the participants how they liked the exercise and what thoughts and ideas it provoked. Suggest that they keep their coats of arms, since people’s thoughts about themselves may change with time.
Ask open questions!
In order to successfully carry out a discussion in groups of any size, the right way of putting questions is very important. It is best of all to ask open questions, for example: ‘What do you think about…?’, ‘In what cases can we speak of…?’, ‘How, in what way…?’, ‘What ways to solve the problem can you see…?’. The answers to such questions cannot be reduced to ‘Yes’ or ‘No’. They help the participants to think about the core meaning of what is going on, stimulate thinking and help make the discussion deeper.

Closed questions have one specific correct answer. For instance, ‘How many articles related to environmental matters are contained in the Ukrainian constitution?’ While using such questions, the trainers may feel more comfortable, because the right answer is indisputable. But such questions are only useful to assess the participants’ knowledge of certain facts. They should be used when you want to make sure that the participants have a basic level of knowledge of certain facts, before moving to a deeper analysis or other cognitive activities of a higher level.

The second type of questions are open questions. Open questions either do not have right answers or have many right answers (that may possibly contradict each other). The following are examples of open questions:

• In what situations can you use the procedure of public participation in your work?
• How does the process of public participation help the authorities protect the environment?
• In what way can you influence a decision about constructing a new industrial facility in your region, that is to be adopted by the local administration?

Asking such questions at the time of the training is more difficult, because the participants will give answers that contradict each other, and the trainer’s idea of the right answer may be challenged by the participants, who may have their own ideas on this matter.

Prepare the questions in advance!
While conducting a discussion or other exercise, prepare the questions on separate cards in advance. This will help you focus the discussion on the problem and avoid any need to improvise while you watch the process.

The questions can be distributed to the participants in advance in order to reduce the time that needs to be allocated for them to think over their answers.

Paraphrase the statements of the participants in order to make understanding easier!
The ability to paraphrase helps verify whether you have been understood correctly, allows you to emphasise an important question or a valuable remark. To paraphrase is to repeat an already expressed thought in other words. For example, you can say: ‘As far as I understand, you mean the following…’ or ‘Did I get you right…’ In this way you invoke a positive or negative response, focusing attention on the question.

Paraphrasing also helps quiet down a talkative participant. For example, ‘Natalia Vladimirovna, as far as I understand it, you are saying that …, now, what do others think about this?’

Remember, that even though paraphrasing is important to stimulate the discussion, it is important not to get excessively zealous in doing it, either. Participants may get tired of frequent repetition.

Summarise expressed ideas, when you conclude each logical part of training!
The ability to summarise is one of the main skills necessary to carry out any form of training, especially discussion. It helps highlight key points, go from one subject to another and summarise the outcome. Summarising is also used to check to what extent the material is clear, and to give an overview of the achievements so far. For example, if you see that participants are confused, you may say: ‘It seems to me that the most important points that we have come up with so far are the following: …’, and then list the points and ask: ‘Do you agree? Does anyone want to add anything?’

If you have enough time, get several participants involved in summarising the key outcomes of an exercise or a part of the training.

Encourage the participants!
There are many ways to stimulate the learning process and make it easier:

• Establishing eye-contact.
• Nodding your head in agreement, or the use of other gestures to demonstrate your attention.
• The use of body language to encourage the participants, moving closer to him or her, or by turning your body to face him or her.
• Calling participants by their names, especially when paraphrasing their words.
• Using compliments.
• Watch your words! When reacting to participants’ creative ideas beware of the constricting effect that the following phrases may have: ‘Good an-
develop the trainings for Officials. A Manual for Trainers

PART 1: How to develop and deliver training

If the participants behave with suspicion and distrust toward the trainer...

In the introductory speech let them understand that you respect the values of the participants and understand their problems.

Conduct an exercise to create a favourable atmosphere — an ‘icebreaker’.

Take into account that certain people cannot take in information before they find an answer to the question ‘what for?’ They need to be motivated in order to take in information. There are people who are not interested in knowing the answer to this question. They need to know in what way they will be able to apply the received information. Discuss this together with the group.

If the energy of the group declines during the course of work...

If the reason for this is excessive physical tiredness, have a break, get some fresh air into the room. Try to interchange different methods of giving information, change your place in the circle of participants more often. Use special exercises to raise the energy of the group (see Annex 4).

If the reason lies in the information that is being fed to the participants, it is advisable that the plan be corrected in accordance with the particular characteristics of the group, and that the volumes of the blocks of information and the comprehensiveness of the material be revised.

3.4. How to resolve a difficult situation

In the process of group development, questions of ‘I and Us’ may begin to dominate, which lead to the development of difficult situations. This may be an emotional tension between the group and the trainer, between individual participants, the beginning or growth of a conflict, undesirable model of behaviour exhibited by some participants, etc. It is important for the trainer to see the possibility of development of such a situation in time, and to choose the right strategy for his or her own behaviour [10, p. 66-69].
If the group expects the trainers to solve all the assigned tasks and to give answers to all questions...

Focus the participants’ attention on the goals and objectives of the training — pay attention to the individual abilities of the participants, stir up their inner potential, raise their motivation, give the basic knowledge, show the reality of organisation of their work in the given conditions. Point at other possible sources from which one can get answers to specific questions.

If it is difficult for you to establish a good rapport with the group...

Try to determine the reason for this in the process of interaction with the participants. If the participants’ expectations do not match the contents of the training, bring their attention once again to the goals and objectives of the training.

Organise the work in small groups, constantly changing the membership of these groups. At the same time assignments must be short and precise.

Try entering the circle and establishing contact on a non-verbal level. Use inspiring words, make use of the rules, give an example from your own experience related to the training subject.

Ask more open questions. Do not answer your own questions yourself.

Remember to utilise the principle of getting the participants involved: stimulate an exchange of opinion, listen to the opinions of all the participants, treat them with respect and never forget to thank those who offer an opinion.

If you don’t have feedback from the group...

During the training, after completion of one or another of its parts the trainer should receive information from the participants about to what extent they have digested the material and what they think and feel about the given content. This information is called feedback.

Various methods exist for a trainer to receive feedback. For instance, when finishing an exercise you can ask the group to draw conclusions. Sometimes it is appropriate to ask the participants to talk in pairs or small groups about the exercise they completed, and then to present the information in the big circle of participants in a synthesised form: in this exercise we learned three important things...today I understood...etc.

If the group loses interest...

Loss of interest is observed in situations when the information is too obscure, too general, or too detailed.

The interactive method allows the trainers to change the fashion in which the information is presented within the framework of a subject, for example switching the audience from one method to another.

Our goal should be to explain the knowledge and skills that are necessary in order to implement the provisions of the Aarhus Convention and establish what knowledge and skills the participants possess already.

If the group does the exercises reluctantly

The reason may be that the group did not understand the terms of the assignment. Repeat the terms of the assignment, and then ask the group if everything is clear.

If the type of assignment implies work in small groups, then divide the participants into the small groups first, and then hand out the assignment.

Try to make logical transitions from one exercise to the next.

If the group is performing a roleplay for the first time, make sure you talk to the participants and explain what a roleplay is and why they are doing it at this point.

If you deviated from the programme during the training...

Always think about alternative exercises — the ‘Plan B’. Prepare more materials and exercises than there are in the programme, so that you can change it around and, if necessary, choose an alternative way of reaching the goals of the training.
In order to prevent the development of difficult situations and to eliminate them, several strategies shown below can be used:

**Coordinate your actions and your statements**
- Invest maximum effort in order to make each of your statements clear and easy to understand. Try to avoid contradicting your own words.
- Be prepared to accept alternative ways to conduct the training, suggested by the group.

**Act as a mediator, harmonising the work of the group, preventing the development of conflicts**
- Facilitate reconciliation and invest all possible effort to solve the moot points in a non-conflict manner. Smooth out any conflicts.
- Bring the participants’ attention to similar opinions and opinions that complement each other, not to the contradictory opinions of the participants.
- Intervene when the group becomes bogged down in contradictions and disagreements (sometimes even without reason). Try to put off the questions of the participants or the moot points of the program that lead to a dead end, in order to tackle them later.
- Use the technique of ‘quitting the discussion’: become absorbed in silence, or start ‘daydreaming’ and doing something very different from what the audience expects from you, or start talking very quietly to one of the participants.
- If necessary, you can step aside from the subject of the discussion, talk about something from your own experience or something on a different subject, not related to the subject of the discussion.

**Support the participants**
- Express your approval when someone from the group offers a proposal and treat the ideas of the group members in an open and friendly way.

**Follow the flow**
- Follow the development of the ideas in the group, analysing them tactfully.

### 3.5. How to deal with ‘difficult’ participants

Sometimes during training we can observe undesirable behavioural patterns of particular participants that cause damage to the learning process and may even bring to nought the work of the group. Dealing with ‘difficult’ participants is an essential part of the work during the training. Bear this in mind, viewing the ‘difficult’ participants as an opportunity to raise your own professionalism. Manifesting patience, politeness, avoiding arguments with them, etc., will enable you to have control at all times over the real situation of the training [12, p. 23-74; 7, p. 100-101].

### practical advices

**If the participants are late…**
Sometimes it is not possible to avoid late arrivals but at the same time this should be treated as a misuse of time of those who did arrive on time. Here are a few ways to overcome this problem:

- Help the group to adopt the corresponding rule about being punctual. If the group members choose to establish this rule on their own, they will most probably observe it.
- Be an example for others: don’t let yourself be
late. Your own behaviour will be viewed as reflecting the degree of your seriousness about providing the group with good training.

- Make it important to be present at the beginning of a session. If the participants understand that they will miss something important during the first minutes of a session, they will make more effort to come on time. For example, distribute the handouts that present the subject of the forthcoming session.

If the participants don’t show up at all...

Sometimes the participants who were invited do not show up at the training or at a part of it. The absence of participants may seriously affect the work of the group. This problem can be solved with the help of several methods (or techniques):

- Make it so that there is a real need to attend the sessions. If the participants receive little benefit from the training, it is only natural that its value falls, reducing its importance on their list of priorities.
- Distribute some materials during each session. Participants do not like to miss the handouts and instructions on how to do an assignment.
- Make an agreement in advance with the administration of the organisations where the participants work. Often the participants excuse themselves from attending the training, referring to the fact that they are urgently summoned to their work. While talking to their boss, point out that the participation of their subordinate in the training for the whole period of its planned duration will significantly increase the effectiveness of the training and will bring greater benefit to the organisation.

If inappropriate conversations take place in the group...

While organising work in small groups, you give the participants an opportunity to communicate with each other, exchange knowledge and experience, training each other. This significantly reduces the participants’ need to have conversations outside the subject.

The possibility of inappropriate conversations occurring may be reduced by other means too:

- Come closer to the participants who are talking to each other. If the conversation is inappropriate indeed, it usually stops. If it’s something useful, then you may join in and provide assistance.
- Discover the reason why the conversation took place. Sometimes you may discover some sound reasons. For instance, the participants may be explaining to each other the material that is not clear or helping to catch up with material one or more of them missed.

If the participants leave the session early...

As a rule, only a few participants dare leave a session before it finishes. Sometimes during work in small groups situations arise when the participants leave early or don’t come back to a session after a break. The following advice will help reduce such behaviour to a minimum:

- Maintain activity during the session. One of the most widespread reasons why participants leave early from joint sessions, is that they get the feeling that nothing important will happen there. It is better to give the groups more assignments at a certain point, than too few. But provide for some time in order to ‘finish what was started’ during the next sessions.
- Be careful with breaks. If you have quite a long session and need to have a lunch or coffee break, make an agreement about the exact time when the session will resume. Write it on a flipchart, a slide or a whiteboard/blackboard in such a manner that everyone not only hears it, but also sees this information. An ‘unrounded’ time is remembered best, for example ‘10.43’, and not ‘quarter to eleven’.
- Leave something very important for the participants for the end of a session. For example, ask the participants to make, with your help, a summary of the accomplished work. The resulting discussions should not be as important as the introductory ones. Sometimes distribute an especially important handout at the very end of a session.

If the participants don’t work on their assignments...

Much time is wasted when the members of the group get distracted from working on their assignments or don’t hurry to move to the next stage of work. The following methods will help you maintain the participants’ focus on the fulfilment of their assignment:

- Explain clearly what needs to be done. It is better to give an assignment to every participant in a printed form. Verbal explanations are quickly forgotten, which makes it more difficult to fulfil the given task.
- Make the first part of the group exercise short and simple. This will give the group an opportunity to accumulate the energy faster and to move on to doing more complex assignments without unnecessary delay.
- Define the training goals clearly. When the participants know what benefit they will receive from doing a specific exercise, they will get involved in it more actively.
- Use the method of step-by-step implementation of an assignment and set up a time frame for completion of each of the stages. The more the
participants approach the time limit, the more effort they invest. If you want to help the group work, watch the time: softly remind ‘there is six minutes left’ — this helps significantly increase the amount of work that gets completed.

**If the behaviour of particular participants distracts the group from the work...**

Group work sometimes is less effective due to the behaviour of one or two participants who slow down the training process, distracting the focus from the subject of the training or session. Sometimes it is quite difficult to find a simple solution to prevent such behaviour, but the following advice should help you cope with such situations:

- Make sure the participant is really impeding the work. It is possible that while observing the work of several groups you approached a group at the very moment when one of its members was expressing his or her opinion quite emotionally, or arguing too passionately. The other members of the group may take it as normal, but the trainer may incorrectly interpret the situation, by assuming the worst.
- Learn why this person creates obstacles. Sometimes the reason behind this is the fact that the group as a whole loses the ability to function, or that the members of the group understand the meaning of the assignment in different ways.
- Watch the difficult participant, keep track of him or her in order to see whether or not he or she continues to influence the group in a destructive way. As a rule, it only takes a talk with such a person to discover the reason for such behaviour. If the situation does not improve, change the composition of the group between different assignments. In this way it is possible to reduce the influence of the difficult participant on a particular small group.
- Always use the support and help of the group when the situation permits. Often they are capable of coping with the difficult situation better than yourself.
- It may be useful to think over the tactics and strategy to tackle the ‘unruly’ participants before the beginning of a session (a seminar).
- In extreme cases you may resort to such measures as:
  1) **Group criticism.** Allocate time for analysis of the participant’s behavior in the group, pointing it out as an obstacle to the group dynamics;
  2) **Confrontation.** During the break talk to the ‘difficult’ participant privately: ‘I think we have a good group with a high growth potential. It would be easier to work for both the group and myself, if you restrained yourself more and gave the others more opportunity to express themselves. Can I rely upon your support in this?’;
  3) **Expulsion.** ‘May I be honest with you?’ You have disrupted several sessions of the seminar and no one, including myself, knows what to do with this. But it is not my intention to jeopardize the success and the achievements of the whole group. If you cannot abstain from arguing, wrangling and misusing our limited time, I will have to ask you to leave the seminar.

---

**participants who create problems**

The majority of participants in seminars do not create problems, but willingly participate in the training, fully investing themselves. Nonetheless, in practically any group one may come across at least one participant who will make the work of the group difficult in one way or another. The most widespread types of ‘problem’ participants can be described as 'Doubting', 'Monopolist', 'Experienced', ‘Squabbler’, ‘Clown’, ‘Show off’, etc.

There are no universal or simple answers to all questions, that arise in relation to problem participants, but the recommendations that follow below can be useful in some situations.

**Doubting**

This type of person, humble, shy, and for the most part, quiet, can be encountered in virtually every group. Participant Sonia The Doubting is shy and does not like to speak before an audience. It is necessary to think over the ways to get Sonia involved in active work. Work in pairs or in groups of three can be used for this purpose, as everyone’s participation is virtually guaranteed there. While working in groups, try to give such assignments that require every person to give a small report before the whole group after the exercise is completed. You can also use the method of ‘chain’ and ask one and the same question to several participants, automatically including Sonia in their number. It is useful to address Sonia directly from time to time: ‘It seems to me that Sonia has not yet spoken on this subject’ or ‘You seem to have wanted to add something’ or ‘If I am not mistaken, you have quite broad experience in this area. I am sure everyone will be grateful if you could share it with us’. Ask her a lot of ‘simple’ questions, especially the ones that relate to her everyday activities and everyday life. Some mod-
Developing and delivering trainings for Officials. A Manual for Trainers
PART 1: How to develop and deliver training

Constructive objection helps the work, but constant rea0
agree both with other participants and with the trainer.
Slava The Squabbler constantly seeks reasons to dis0
move ahead', or: 'Thank you for the interesting story. 
will help: 'This is all very interesting, but we have to 
relevance to the business. The best advice for handling 
gressive or pushy, but they are rather long and have little 
enthusiasm — his interventions are not necessarily ag0
past' all the time. It is not that easy to cut down Boris'
used to receive and therefore he tends to remember 'the 
bosses (authori0
ties) will never endorse this. The theory is not bad, but 
it can hardly be implemented in real life.' Her interven0
tions often start with ‘yes, but…’. Possibly, Nina’s 
behaviour is dictated by a certain bias towards those 
who can successfully generate new ideas. The danger of 
Nina’s behaviour is that her criticism can reduce the 
others’ desire to offer their proposals.

When working with Nina, support the idea, expressed 
by someone that she criticises: ‘I think this in essence is 
a reasonable idea. Can anyone present arguments in
defence of this idea?’, ‘How do the others see this problem? What other sides of the problems can you identify?’ Ask Nina to express her ideas. If a constructive proposal does not follow, offer the following: ‘Since we have not come up with any better ideas, let’s return to Victor’s idea and review it in greater detail’.

**Complaining person**

Zhenia The Complaining often expresses dissatisfaction and has a lot of complaints about his colleagues, the trainer, the organisers, the authorities, the politicians, the press, etc. He very often summarises everything he sees in a negative light and uses such expressions like ‘How terrible it is that…’ and ‘If not for the…’. ‘It’s always like this…’, ‘Never…’ He has difficulty finding a solution to the problem, but he is very capable of exaggerating its dimensions.

When working with Zhenia you can ask him to make a proposal on how to improve the situation that he does not like. Ask him to request help from the group if necessary. You can stimulate him to view the problem from a positive perspective: ‘You have just told us how terrible things are with… Now, could you please mention at least one positive detail?’ Ask the group to draw a few more positive expressions, channelling the conversation into a constructive direction.

It is possible to prevent the ‘complaining syndrome’ from appearing by directing the conversation into another plane from the very beginning: ‘We all know how bad the situation is around… We gathered here in order to try to find possible ways to improve the situation. If we all focus on finding these ways, our joint work will become fruitful. How can we achieve this?’

**Aggressive**

Anatoli The Aggressive usually likes to use any occasion whatsoever to attack the trainer. Anatoli asks questions in a pushy manner and inserts his remarks in order to confuse and provoke the trainer. The best way to fight Anatoli is to simply paraphrase his questions and remarks in a softer and more objective form. It is also possible to answer him: ‘I see that this question arouses very keen emotions in you. Would you like to hear my opinion (opinion of the group) on this issue?’ It is best of all if you, when answering, do so to the whole group, not personally to Anatoli. This usually reduces, albeit possibly only temporarily, the aggressiveness of Anatoli.

**Embittered**

The behaviour of the embittered participant, Oleg, is variable — from complete, silent, non-participation and complaints (about the hard chairs, cold coffee, cold room) to negative and provocative, by their nature, questions. He seeks a weak point in the very material of the training or in the way it is being presented. Usually, Oleg doesn’t have anything against the trainer. He is rather resentful towards the whole world, and, in particular, toward the boss who sent him to this training for whatever reason.

Sandra Weintraub, management trainer, recommends considering the following questions when dealing with Oleg The Embittered:

- How professionally am I capable of acting in this difficult situation?
- Did I do all I could in order to lift the participants’ potential feelings of danger and discomfort?
- Was I able to create such an atmosphere at the seminar that the participants could quietly and without fear express their critical remarks concerning the training?
- Have I considered the possibility of using the types of activities (exercises, games), which facilitate the relief of the rising dissatisfaction? For instance, the feedback, received by Oleg in the course of a role play, can quite possibly shake his negative orientation.
- Have I taken into account the possibility of open discussion of the problem with the group? It will possibly be useful for Oleg to hear how the other participants evaluate his behaviour. Quite often a person like him does not have a clue that his actions may make the other participants feel uncomfortable.

**Clown**

The main distinctive trait of a Clown is an inappropriate and often annoying humour. Humour is useful, but if Kostya The Clown puts the brakes on the progress of the group work and causes irritation in many of the participants, it is necessary to curb his sense of humour a bit. From time to time try to get Kostya involved in a ‘serious’ dialogue. Let him understand that he may be heard (which is his true goal), but on a higher level. Praise his timely and serious input. Also, on the contrary, do not encourage his attempts to joke. Sometimes it is useful to ask him to repeat the joke once again: ‘I am sorry, I am afraid I didn’t catch the point here. Could you explain the same thing in other words, in a simpler way?’

Sometimes the problem is more difficult because some participants loudly support Kostya by their reaction to his ‘humour’. But in this situation the best way is also to try to open the serious part of his character and work directly with it.

* The above is an adaptation of information material of the training centre ‘Golubka’.
3.6. How to work with the audio and visual materials

Audio-visual aids, such as the whiteboard (blackboard), flip-chart, slide film, slides and videotapes are effective to convey new knowledge, raise interest levels and promote understanding by the students [18, p. 13].

practical advices

If you are using a multimedia or a slide projector…

While preparing the slides try not to overload them. Use the rule ‘seven by seven’: not more then seven lines, and not more than seven words in each line.

• Put a title on each slide.
• Place the information on the slide in such a way as to make it perfectly legible for those sitting in the last row.
• Before the beginning of a presentation make sure that the multimedia projector or the slide projector is placed in the correct way, in front of the audience, and is focused on the screen. When using a multimedia projector make sure it is plugged into the computer and the presentation is ready in time for the session to start.
• Prepare the slides in advance and review them before the presentation, in order to avoid the embarrassment of the text on the slides being illegible because of too small a font size, or of slides being turned upside down (in case of using a slide projector).
• Try not to obstruct the screen. Talk in the direction of the audience, and not in the direction of audio-visual aids. Keep your shoulders straight and face the audience at all times.
• When using a pointer, point at the screen, rather than at the projector, when you explain the contents of the slides. If you stand near the projector, you often obstruct the screen for some of the listeners. Hold the pointer in the hand that is closer to the screen.
• Try not to read the slide to the audience word-for-word, but use it as a starting point or a brief summary of the main points.
• Switch off the multimedia projector or the slide projector when not in use, in order to prolong the life span of the bulb and to avoid distracting the attention of the participants.
• Try to have spare bulbs and an extension cord for both types of projectors.
• You have to have an alternative to the projectors in case of failure of the equipment. In this case flip-charts are both cheaper and more easily available.
• If there is a possibility to do so, distribute printed copies of the presentation to the participants. This will allow them to concentrate on discussion rather than taking notes of the text from the slides/transparencies.
• Transparent films sheets (transparencies) can also be used as an alternative to flip-charts in order to put the opinions and ideas of the participants on them at the time of brainstorming and discussions.

If you are using slides…

• Review them in advance. In order to show the slide-shows and videos, prepare the questions for discussion and give the students very specific assignments for the time of the show, in order to help them concentrate.
• Use the slides as a means of focusing the attention at the beginning of a discussion in order to make the process of analysis of the problem more active, or as a source of information instead of a lecture. Ask the participants of the group to comment on what they see on the slide, or to define the positive and negative sides in what they see on the picture.
• Do not plan an uninterrupted slide show for more than 20 minutes.

If you are using a flip-chart or a whiteboard (blackboard)…

• Stand on one side of the flip-chart in order for the audience to see what is already written on the sheet of paper.
• When you speak, stand facing the audience, rather than facing the flip-chart. Do not try to speak and write simultaneously.
• Use the flip-chart to take notes of ideas, expressed by the group. The sheets can be put on the wall and used anytime in the process of the work. It is also possible to prepare flip-chart sheets in advance in order to use them at the time of presentation.
• When the training participants see a visual image of the main points of the lecture, they receive the presented material in a more effective way.
Chapter 4. Evaluation of training

Evaluation of training is one of the main components of a training programme. It will not only provide the trainer with useful information in order to further improve the training course, but also creates an impression of completeness.

Usually the trainer can determine how well the training process goes by observing the group dynamic, the activity of the audience, by analysing spontaneous comments, etc. Nevertheless, evaluation as a component of a programme gives the trainer the opportunity to validate his or her observations, as well as to the participants an opportunity to express their opinions and feel satisfaction from the fact that they have been heard. Evaluation should be carried out throughout the whole time of a training activity, after each working day, and sometimes after a series of sessions also. This type of evaluation is called feedback.

The evaluation of the whole training gives the participants an opportunity to analyse previous experience and discuss future changes, make a decision about the need to continue training after some time, and it emotionally and logically concludes the training [17].

**practical advices**

**Carry out the training evaluation during the final part of the training!**

The evaluation procedure should be planned for the final part of a training session. If the training is several hours long, then at least 15 minutes should be allocated for this purpose. If the meeting is one day or several days long, then it will be necessary to allocate more time for the final evaluation (from 30 minutes to 1 hour), and in the process of conducting the training it is appropriate to have short intermediate evaluations at the conclusion of each day. (Some methods for receiving feedback from participants are presented in Annex 7)

**Before the beginning of an evaluation procedure, explain what it is!**

Do not expect the participants to know what evaluation is. Apart from this, many — even those who often attend training — do not see evaluation as a part of the training process. Explain before carrying out an evaluation, why it is necessary.

**Use different forms of evaluation!**

Training evaluations can take place spontaneously, in the form of reaction of the participants to what is happening. The trainer should encourage the participants to evaluate the content or the process after the completion of an exercise, a discussion or a part of training. It is most important to receive evaluations of specific activities, exercises or roles, conducted by different participants.

If this does not happen spontaneously, you can use special questions like: ‘How useful was this exercise for you? Perhaps, it would be good to do some additional work on this? Do you think that we need to change the way we work (the work order)? What exercise did you like the most? What would you have added if you were a trainer? What was well done? What parts of the programme have to be improved and in what way? How do you evaluate the role of the trainer — did he render assistance or did he prevent you from absorbing the material? What special knowledge have you received from this seminar?’

Among the advantages of such a discussion is the possibility to clarify and elaborate on certain comments. The most important remarks can be determined judging by how frequently they were expressed. And finally the participants of the group are offered an opportunity to talk to each other when giving personal evaluations, and the trainer is given an opportunity to make concluding remarks and give the group his or her comments.

**Conduct a written evaluation!**

A written evaluation gives an opportunity to receive answers from almost all of the participants. Among its advantages is a standard form, which makes it easier for trainers to perform final processing of the results, if that is necessary. During the course of the written evaluation it is also possible to receive comments that the participants did not want to express verbally.

In order to conduct written evaluations, special evaluation forms or questionnaires are developed. (An example of such evaluation form is presented in Annex 8)
For many years Kirkpatrick’s model has been used in international training practice. This describes 5 steps (and, correspondingly, levels) of evaluation of results of training:

- **reaction**: to what extent did the participants like the training,
- **understanding**: what facts, techniques, methods of work were mastered as an outcome of the training,
- **behaviour**: how did the participants’ behaviour and actions in the work environment change as an outcome of the training,
- **result**: which of the obtained results of the training are important for the future work of the participants,
- **recoupment of expenses**: to what extent is the training justifiable in financial terms.

**Level 1: Reaction**
All those who have ever asked the participants to give written or verbal response to questions at the end of training, are very familiar with evaluation at this level. It’s about the perception of training by the participants and about their satisfaction levels. When evaluating reactions, you work with the after-effects of the emotional perception of training, you determine what impressions it has left. At this point you should not forget that you are conducting evaluations exactly on the basis of feelings, and not on the basis of mastered knowledge and skills, changes in behaviour or work results.

**Level 2: Understanding**
During training practice, understanding is comprised of the sum of following results:
- Change of attitude.
- Development of abilities and skills.
- Obtained knowledge.

An approving mark does not yet guarantee that the course was properly absorbed. The difficulty is that usually the content of the training cannot be reduced to the information, and the objective is not just about the transfer of this information. There are other approaches too:
- Individual evaluation.
- Comparison of a preliminary and a final evaluation.
- Using a control group for comparison.

In each of these approaches different methods are used to conduct the evaluations, including performing standard tests, doing test assignments and answering questions to be later evaluated by experts.

**Level 3: Behaviour**
This level of evaluation is related to the use of knowledge and skills in the work environment. The training participants can speak highly of the training or do the test assignment well, but still… Training will not have any meaning if it does not result in changes in behaviour in the work place. Changes can be secured by:
- The desire to introduce changes in one’s own work.
- The readiness to use the obtained skills.
- The support or direct help from the side of the leadership.
- The support of the positive changes in the behaviour of staff members.

**Level 4: Results**
Evaluation at this level means looking at the indicators of the effectiveness of the training in practice, in routine activities; the contribution that training has made to the work of an organisation. Some examples of such results include: a reduced number of complaints, reduced fluctuation of personnel, observance of safety rules, a better attitude towards work and higher morale. The fact that the results do not improve can be an indicator of ineffectiveness of the training or reflect the influence of external factors.

How can one find out what is the reason? It will be easier to find the answer, if the evaluation at the previous level was conducted — at the level of understanding. If the results at the level of understanding are not particularly high, you should not expect an increase in results at the level of behaviour. If, on the contrary, the results at the level of understanding are high, but the results at the level of behaviour are low, then, as the practice indicates, there can be two main reasons:

- The special work, aimed at transfer of knowledge and skills into the real working environment, was not conducted for the audience.
- There are factors in the work places that make it difficult to apply the results of the training, or that prevent the personnel from using them (for example, the factors of motivation, organisation of work, conditions inside the organisation, etc.).
PART 2

Training modules on the Aarhus Convention
Model Programmes

Training on Access to Environmental Information

The Aarhus Convention is comprised of three main elements — access to information, public participation and access to justice. Access to information is an important part of the Convention, as it gives the public the right to receive environmental information and establishes the responsibility of public officials to provide this information. This training is dedicated to educating public officials about the basics of proactive and passive dissemination of information. This requires them to possess certain knowledge and skills. First it is necessary to know what environmental information is, who has the right to collect, store and disseminate environmental information, how to respond to requests for information, establish an effective service for collecting and disseminating information, and to provide support to the public in receiving it. It is also necessary to know the legal limits set on access to environmental information.

Training goal
Based on learning the main provisions of the Aarhus Convention, to train the participants to apply the principles of accessing environmental information and to develop skills on organising the work of an environmental information service.

Training objectives
Following the training participants will be able to:

- Operate under the main provisions of the Aarhus Convention and national legislation regarding the provision and dissemination of environmental information
- Analyse their own duties related to the implementation of the Aarhus Convention
- Respond to requests for information, and support the public in writing such requests
- Devise solutions in difficult situations related to the confidentiality of information
- Determine the types of proactively disseminated information
- Apply some principles of service organisation for the collection and dissemination of information to make public access to information easier (processing, systematisation, effective dissemination and unhindered issuance of information)

Example of a training programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Day 1</th>
<th>Session 1 (S1)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.30 – 11.00</td>
<td>Opening of training, getting acquainted, introduction of training programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.00 – 12.00</td>
<td>Our right to a healthy environment General information regarding the Aarhus Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.00 – 12.30</td>
<td>Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.30 – 14.00</td>
<td>General principles of access to information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.00 – 15.00</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.00 – 16.30</td>
<td>Passive dissemination of information, or how to respond to requests of the public</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.30 – 17.00</td>
<td>Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.00 – 18.30</td>
<td>Main principles of public participation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

S2
S3
S4
S7
Use national or regional User Guides for officials ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention’

The User Guides provides practical information and approaches to the implementation of the Aarhus Convention in your country. They will be very useful in the preparation and delivery of the trainings. You can use it as a source of information and as handouts for different sessions.

Don’t forget to analyse the training needs of the target group

This variant of the programme is only an example of the possible logic and content of training.

The training content should always be focused on the needs of your target audience. Therefore, do not take the programme presented here as a dogma. You can use various parts of exercises from various sessions, creating your own combinations and developing your own exercises.

Before the training and after the selection of participants, when studying the training needs of the target group, it is advisable to provide them with some preliminary information about the Aarhus Convention and the training, and leave your contact information.

### Day 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Material</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.00 – 10.30</td>
<td>Methods of public participation</td>
<td>$S8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.30 – 11.00</td>
<td>Break</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.00 – 12.30</td>
<td>Proactive dissemination of information</td>
<td>$S5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.30 – 13.30</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.30 – 15.00</td>
<td>Possibilities of access to justice, provided by the Aarhus Convention and national legislation</td>
<td>$S12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.00 – 15.30</td>
<td>Break</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.30 – 17.00</td>
<td>Search for ways to solve the problem of creating a service to collect and provide environmental information</td>
<td>$S6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.00 – 18.00</td>
<td>Concluding the training Evaluation Conclusions Handing out of certificates</td>
<td>$S14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Training on Public Participation in Decision-making

Democracy in the 21st century means more than just citizens taking part in elections. It also means that governments should consult with the people regarding the projects involving specific activities, as well as plans, policies, or draft laws. This is for securing the “participatory democracy” in areas related to the issues of protecting the environment.

According to the Aarhus Convention (articles 6, 7, 8), the authorities are obliged to consult with representatives of civil society regarding their own activities and decision-making if the decisions can in any way affect the lives, health, well-being and environmental safety of the latter. Public participation improves the quality of political and administrative decisions.

Training goal

Based on learning the main provisions of the Aarhus Convention, to train participants to apply the principles of public participation in environmentally important decision-making.*

Training objectives

Following the training the participants will be able to:

- Determine the advantages and benefits of involving the public in environmentally important decision-making;
- Explain what the principles of public participation are based on the provisions of the Aarhus Convention and national legislation;
- Determine the types of decisions that absolutely require the public’s involvement; that is, decisions involving specific activities, strategic issues (EIA, environmental expertise, strategic environmental assessment) and development of legislation;
- Apply methods, procedures and instruments to organise effective public participation;
- Develop model plans for public participation in decision-making;
- Discuss the draft plan and procedure for public participation.

Example of a training programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Day 1</th>
<th>Session 1</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.00 – 10.00 Opening of training, becoming acquainted</td>
<td>$1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.30 – 12.00 Our right to a healthy environment</td>
<td>$2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General information about the Aarhus Convention</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examples of applying the Aarhus Convention</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Possibilities for public participation in environmentally important decision-making provided by national legislation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.00 – 12.20 Break</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.20 – 13.00 Main principles of public participation</td>
<td>$7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What public participation in decision-making means?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What is public?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In what decisions can the public take part in making?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What benefits does public participation in decision-making bring?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* On the basis of the presented materials you will be able to independently develop similar trainings on the subject of public participation in decision-making regarding the specific activities, strategic issues (EIA, environmental expertise, strategic environmental assessment), and the development of legislation.
Use national or regional User Guides for officials ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention’

The User Guides present practical information and approaches to implementing the Aarhus Convention in your country. They will be very useful in the preparation and delivery of the trainings. You can use it as a source of information and as handouts for different sessions.

Don’t forget to analyse the training needs of the target group

This variant of the programme is only an example of the possible logic and content of training. If you are a beginning trainer, also use this logic in cases related to public participation in specific activities, and the development of legislation.

But the content of training should always be focused on the needs of your target audience. Therefore, do not take the programme presented here as a dogma. You can use various parts of exercises from various sessions, creating your own combinations and developing your own exercises.
How to adapt the training for representatives of local authorities?

When conducting trainings on the Aarhus Convention for local public authorities, special attention should be paid to adapting the content and methods of training to the needs of the audience. As a result, the participants should understand how the Convention should be applied at the local level for purposes of democratising the society and to get the public involved in solving local problems.

After analysing the training needs it is discovered that the participants have never dealt with issues related to the environment, it is recommended to use exercises to clarify and explain basic terms.

It is also possible to use the exercises with the goal of solving local environmental problems.

Definition of the terms ‘Environment’ and ‘Protection of the Environment’

✔ Expected results

After completing the exercise the participants will be able to:

• Explain what the terms ‘environment’ and ‘protection of the environment’ mean based on concrete examples from their own region (community);
• Identify environmental problems, their reasons, consequences and the possible response actions by the public.

⏰ Time: 90 minutes

🔍 How to organise the work

1. Conduct a brainstorming session on the following question (10 minutes):

   ? What is the environment?

   Write all the answers on a flip-chart or on a whiteboard.
   
   Summarise the results, providing the definition of ‘environment’ according to the national law on the environment (Slide 1).

   Ask the participants the following question (Slide 2):

   ? What are the components of the natural environment?

---

**Slide 1. The term ‘environment’**

Environment — a family of components of the natural environment, natural and natural-manmade objects, and manmade objects.

**Slide 2. The term ‘components of the natural environment’**

Components of the natural environment — land, mineral resources, soils, surface and underground waters, atmospheric air, flora, fauna and other organisms, as well as the ozone layer of the atmosphere and the near-earth space that together comprise favourable conditions for life to exist on Earth.
2. Arrange the participants into small groups and give them the following assignment:

Assignments for the groups

Do the following in 10 minutes:
1) Use a short brainstorming in order to create a list of problems, related to the environment, that exist, according to your opinion, in your locality (town, region or village).
2) Select a priority problem and back up your choice with the arguments.
3) Select a presenter who will take 1-2 minutes to present the results of your work to the larger group.

Give the groups no more than 10 minutes to conduct this exercise. Place the problems proposed by the groups on a flipchart. After all the groups have presented the results of their work (10 minutes), ask the larger group to identify the priority problem by using a ranking method (or ask the participants to simply use markers to put dots near the problem that they think is the most critical one. (3 minutes).

3. In the 10 minutes, conduct a discussion of the problem that has been selected in this manner by using the following questions:

- Why does this problem exist?
- What influence does it have on the environment and on the local inhabitants?
- What is being done to solve this problem?
- What can be done to solve it?

4. Conduct a brainstorming session on the following questions (5 minutes):

? What is ‘protection of the environment’?

Provide a definition that corresponds to national legislation. For example:

Slide 3. Environmental protection

Environmental Protection — activities of public authorities, local self-public authorities, non-governmental and other non-commercial organisations, legal and natural persons, aimed at preserving and restoring the natural environment, the rational use and reproduction of natural resources, preventing a negative impact to the environment caused by economic or other activities, and liquidating the consequences of such activities (further also — nature-protection activities).

Emphasise that the concept ‘protection of the environment’ includes examining the existing situation, as well as identifying the reasons that caused it. On the basis of all this, corresponding response measures are developed.

5. Ask the participants to perform an exercise aimed at identifying the reasons, consequences and response actions in the event that environmental problems emerge (25 minutes). Prior to the exercise, demonstrate the example as shown on Slides 4 and 5.
Ask the participants to go back to their initial groups and do the following assignment:

Assignments for the groups

For the problem you have selected earlier, compile a chart ‘source — influence — condition — result — response action’, according to the clarifications presented on the slides. The time for this exercise is 10 minutes.

After completion of the exercise, select a presenter who will present the results of your work to the larger group. The time for the presentation is 1-2 minutes.

After completion of work in small groups, ask the participants to present their results (10 minutes).

6. In conclusion, conduct a group discussion on the following questions (10 minutes).
   - How do the environmental problems of a settlement influence the social and economic conditions of its inhabitants?
   - How can the local inhabitants help solve such problems?
   - What should be the position of the local public authorities when getting the population involved in solving local environmental problems?
## Getting started

### Introductory part (Session 1)

**Time:** 90 minutes

**Expected results**

During this session the participants will be able to (only for the trainer):

- Learn the goals and objectives of the training;
- Become acquainted with the trainer and each other;
- Become familiar with the work and more comfortable with themselves.

### Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to use</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>Introduction of goal, objectives and training programme</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer Slide 1.1, 1.2</td>
<td>10 min</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>Introduction of trainers and experts</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer</td>
<td>5 min</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>Organisational issues</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer</td>
<td>5 min</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>Becoming acquainted</td>
<td>Snowball, etc.</td>
<td>15 min</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>Adopting the rules of work for the group</td>
<td>Discussing in a circle typical rules and voting</td>
<td>10 min</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>Expectations and fears</td>
<td>Unfinished sentence</td>
<td>15 min</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>Icebreaker</td>
<td>Coat of arms, or work in pairs, etc.</td>
<td>5 min</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Training tips

This session is described in detail in Part 1 of the Trainer’s Manual: Chapter 3.2. How to create a favourable atmosphere and establish a connection with participants at the start of training? Advice is given and exercises are demonstrated, which can be used to organise work during one session. Because of this, the introductory session is presented here in a simplified way.

### 1.1. Presentation of the goal, objectives and programme of the training

**Time:** 10 minutes

Present the goal and objectives of the training to participants using Slides 1.1 or 1.2, depending on the subject of the training. (Goals and objectives, presented on Slide 1.1 should be adjusted according to the results of the analysis of the training needs of the target group). Introduce the programme to the participants.
1.2. Introduction of trainers and experts

Time: 5 minutes

Briefly introduce yourself, other trainers, experts, representatives of the project, invited guests, etc.

1.3. Logistics

Time: 5 minutes

Discuss organisational issues with the group:

- Which trainers can be contacted on what issues by a participant, for example, regarding tickets, meals, etc.
- How and when will the materials be handed out, whether it is possible to make copies of them, etc.
- The possibility of having additional breaks, consultations, etc.

1.4. Becoming acquainted

Time: 15 minutes

Select and conduct one of the variants of an interactive acquaintance session, the one that you like the most.

1.5. Setting the rules for group work

Time: 15 minutes

Ask the participants why rules are necessary in life. Ask those present to set rules for work at the training that are usually considered to be typical.
1.6. Expectations and fears

Time: 20 minutes

In order to evaluate expectations, you can use the method of the ‘unfinished sentence’. Ask each participant to think and finish two sentences: ‘From this seminar I expect…’, ‘At this seminar I would like to avoid…’.

1.7. Icebreaker

Time: 5 minutes

If you consider it necessary, to create a favourable atmosphere and overcome psychological discomfort, you can use the method ‘Coat of arms’, or carry out a short group discussion (in pairs or trios, later presenting their thoughts in the common circle) on the following question: Have you ever previously encountered the Aarhus Convention in your work, when, and on what occasion. Comment on participants’ lack of information on this matter, and that it’s a good start for the upcoming work. If some of the participants have such information — direct them to increase and structure it.
General information about the Aarhus Convention (Session 2)


📌 Time: 60 minutes

✔️ Expected results

After participating in this session, the participants will be able to:

• Explain the history of the Aarhus Convention;
• Explain the three main pillars of the Convention and their main point;
• Explain the meaning of the basic terms of the Convention (public authority and the public), apply them in practice, and draw examples.

🔍 Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to use</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>Aarhus Convention: main concepts.</td>
<td>Interactive lecture Slides 2.3-2.14</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1/ Short history of the Aarhus Convention</td>
<td></td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2/ Components of the Aarhus Convention and the uniqueness</td>
<td></td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>of the Convention.</td>
<td></td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3/ Definition of the terms: ‘public authority’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Definitions of the terms ‘he public’ and ‘public</td>
<td>Brainstorming</td>
<td>30 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>concerned’ according to the Aarhus Convention and national legislation.</td>
<td>Work in small groups, discussion</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a large group</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.1. Introduction

📌 Time: 5 minutes

Tell the participants that very specific knowledge and skills will be the results of their participation in each of the training sessions. Present the goals and objectives of this session using Slide 2.1, and familiarize participants with the plan of the session.

🔍 Slide 2.1. Expected results

After having participated in this session, you will be able to:

✔️ Tell about the history of the Aarhus Convention;
✔️ Explain the three main pillars of the Convention;
✔️ Explain the meaning of the basic terms of the Convention (public authority and the public), apply them in practice and draw examples.

🔍 Slide 2.2. History of the Aarhus Convention

The Aarhus Convention was adopted at the fourth Conference of Ministers ‘Environment for Europe’ in Aarhus, Denmark, 25th of June 1998.

The Aarhus Convention entered into force on the 30th of October, 2001 after being ratified by 16 countries.
2.2. Interactive lecture: Aarhus Convention — main concepts

_time: 15 minutes

Plan of the lecture

1/ Short history of the Aarhus Convention

2/ Components of the Aarhus Convention and the uniqueness of the Convention

3/ Definition of the term: ‘public authority’

Slide 2.3. History of the Aarhus Convention

- Azerbaijan
- Albania
- Armenia
- Belarus
- Belgium
- Bulgaria
- Hungary
- Georgia
- Denmark
- Estonia
- Kazakhstan
- Cyprus
- Kyrgyzstan
- Latvia
- Lithuania
- Macedonia
- Malta
- Moldova
- Norway
- Poland
- Portugal
- Romania
- Tajikistan
- Turkmenistan
- Ukraine
- France

27 parties in total

- Our country signed the Aarhus Convention in the year ___ and ratified it on the ___ month of the year 1

Slide 2.4. History of the Aarhus Convention

The broadest definition of the term ‘environmental information’ (Art. 2.3).

- Condition of the components of the environment: the condition of the atmosphere, underground waters, soil, biodiversity, etc.
- Factors that can influence the condition of the environment: emissions of matter or energy, noise, radiation, etc.
- Types of activities that can influence the condition of the environment: Specific types of activities, administrative measures, plans, laws, etc.
- Possible damages: the health and living conditions of the people, cultural facilities.

Slide 2.5. Goal of the Aarhus Convention

- Contribute to the protection of the right of every person of present and future generations to live in an environment adequate to his or her health and well-being,
- Guarantee the rights of access to information, public participation in decision-making, and access to justice in environmental matters.

Slide 2.6. Main components of the Aarhus Convention

- Access to environmental information (Art. 4-5);
- Public participation in the decision-making process (Art. 6-8);
- Access to justice (Art. 9).

Slide 2.7. Main components of the Aarhus Convention and human rights

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component of the Convention</th>
<th>Right</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Access to environmental information</td>
<td>To know</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation in the decision-making process</td>
<td>To participate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to justice</td>
<td>To protect the right to a healthy environment</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Aarhus Convention is an outstanding achievement not only in the field of environmental protection, but it is also extremely important for the further development and securing of human rights. This Convention carries in itself the fundamental provisions of democracy, the human right to protect one’s well-being and the future of one’s children.

Kofi Annan. Secretary General of the UN.
Developing and delivering trainings for Officials. A Manual for Trainers

PART 2: Model Programmes

Slide 2.9. Access to information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Government's duties</th>
<th>Rights of the public</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To collect (Art. 4)</td>
<td>To request information without having to justify the request (Art. 4.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To provide (Art. 5, 4.1)</td>
<td>To use information (Art. 4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To proactively disseminate (Art. 5)</td>
<td>To pay ‘reasonable’ fees (Art. 4.8)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Slide 2.10. Public participation

- The Convention demands that minimal procedures for public participation are in place (Art. 6).

Types of Environmentally Important Decisions:
- Decisions on specific types of activities
- Development of plans, programmes and policies related to the environment
- Development of legislation related to the environment

Slide 2.11. Access to justice

Guarantees that citizens have the possibility to implement without limitations their rights to:
- ✖ Access information (Art. 9.1)
- ✖ Participate in decision-making (Art. 9.2)
- ✖ According to environmental protection laws (Art. 9.3)
Special position for the NGOs.

Slide 2.12. Main actors

Public authorities (Art. 2.2)
- ✖ Administration on the local, regional and other levels;
- ✖ Natural and legal persons implementing governmental administrative functions in line with national legislation, including the specific duties, activities and services, related to the environment;
- ✖ Any other natural or legal persons implementing governmental duties, functions or providing services to the population that are related to the environment.

Slide 2.13. Main actors

The following belong to ‘public authorities’ in accordance with the common administrative code of the country:
- …all governmental or local authorities, as well as natural persons, performing who, on the basis of the law or an agreement, conduct statutory duties;
- …legal or natural persons financed from the state budget.

training tips

Using Slide 2.13, do not forget to draw examples of organizations or natural persons financed by the government to which the provisions of the Convention apply. For example, Joint Stock Company ‘Gabidzhan Metallurgical Works’; Joint Stock Company ‘Company of Glass and Mineral Water’; Chief Sanitary Inspector of the City of Tbilisi.
2.3. Exercise: Definition of the term ‘the public’ according to the Aarhus Convention and national legislation

 تخوف nội dung

Expected results
After having participated in the exercise, the participants will be able to:

• Provide definitions for the terms ‘the public’ and ‘public concerned’;
• Draw examples, explaining the term ‘public concerned’;
• Explain what the rights and the role of environmental non-governmental organisations are regarding the implementation of the Aarhus Convention.

ecessary materials
Assignments for the groups, flip-charts, markers, paper.

How to organise the work
1. Explain the goal of this exercise to the participants.
2. Conduct a small brainstorming session on the following question:
   * Who can we call ‘the public’?
3. Place all ideas on a flip-chart or whiteboard (blackboard).
4. Define the term ‘the public’ according to the Aarhus Convention (Slide 2.14) and national legislation. If necessary, comment on the results of the brainstorming session in relation to these definitions.
5. Ask 1-2 participants to explain how they interpret the term ‘public concerned’.
6. Ask the participants to ponder the following examples.

Assignments for the groups

In the provincial town of Merryville, located 450 km away from the capital, the issue of constructing a new plastic manufacturing plant is being discussed. Who would you consider ‘public concerned’ in the decision-making process regarding this issue?

A) the non-governmental organisation ‘Culture and Peace’, registered in the town of Merryville, and dealing with issues of culture and the arts;
B) the non-governmental organisation ‘Ecomir’ (‘Eco-world’), registered in the capital, whose main area of activities is protection of the environment;
C) a tourist who regularly comes to the town of Merryville for vacations;
D) inhabitants of the town of Merryville, whose houses are located in immediate proximity to the proposed construction site;
E) inhabitants of the village located 15 km from the town;
F) representatives of the association of businessmen of the town;
G) inhabitants of a neighbouring country located 40 km away from the proposed construction site.
7. Bring to the participants’ attention the fact that NGOs contributing to environmental protection always belong to the public concerned group.

8. Ask the participants to consider the role of NGOs in the process of implementing the Convention using the method ‘Take a Position’, and in order to organise it, do the following:

   • Arrange the participants into four small groups.
   • Give each group an assignment containing the statement reflecting the widespread opinion regarding NGOs and the instructions regarding the position they should consider (see H 2.1.). Give the groups 5 minutes to do the assignment.

Assignments for the groups

Groups 1 and 2. Assignment

Non-governmental organisations are radical and unorganised. They are only interested in causing unrest and distracting public authorities from their work, or they classify themselves as non-governmental organisations to avoid taxation. They cannot realistically contribute to environmental protection.

You have 5 minutes. Prepare no less than 2 arguments to defend this position and prepare to present them before the group.

Groups 3 and 4. Assignment

Non-governmental organisations are radical and unorganised. They are only interested in causing unrest and distracting public authorities from their work, or they classify themselves as non-governmental organisations to avoid taxation. They cannot realistically contribute to environmental protection.

You have 5 minutes. Prepare no less than 2 arguments to refute this position and prepare to present them before the group.
The groups should select 1-2 speakers who will present prepared arguments to the group. Each group will have 1 minute to put forth their arguments.

Let the groups exchange their arguments, taking turns, starting from the opinion supporting the statement. Watch the time strictly and tactfully stop the presenter if he or she exceeds this time.

After the presentations are over, carry out a discussion of the following issues:

- What argument was most convincing?
- What is the positive role of NGOs in the area of environmental protection?
- How is it possible to cooperate with them?

**training tips**

Positive NGO role: providing a connection between the public at large and public authorities; this cooperation can be used to safeguard environmental interests and counter the industrial lobby; disseminating important environmental information; conducting direct actions aimed at cleaning-up certain polluted territories; providing expert support to adopted decisions, etc.

Do not forget that even though NGOs can contribute to disseminating information and increasing the awareness of public, public authorities cannot hand over these responsibilities to them. The Aarhus Convention designates the creation of governmental systems to inform and increase awareness among the public at large.

There can be the following forms of cooperation: a common mailing list, voluntary agreements, round tables, joint companies, working groups, etc.

After the end of the discussion, carry out a common reflection on the exercise using the following questions (3 minutes):

- Try to recollect the exercise. What thoughts have you had during this exercise?
- Have you discovered something new for yourself?
- Why do you think we have included this exercise into the training programme for?

### 2.4. Conclusion

**Time: 10 minutes**

**How to organise the work**

To summarise the results of the session, conduct a discussion about the session together with the participants in the large circle using the following questions:

- When was the Aarhus Convention adopted and ratified in our country?
- What definition of the term ‘the public’ does the Convention provide?
- What definition of the term ‘public authority’ does the Convention provide?
- What are the three main pillars of the Convention?
- What is the uniqueness of the Convention about?

If you do not have time for discussion, briefly repeat the main points of the content of the session yourself. Definitely make the link to the next session, emphasising what its focus will be.
Adapt the session!
Slide 2.13: Insert the definition of the term 'public authority' based on the national legislation of your country.
Exercise 1. Explain the definition of ‘the public’ in line with the national legislation.

Use the handout materials!
- Text of the Aarhus Convention.
- A list of the national legislation that provides for the implementation of the Convention in a country. For example, in Ukraine implementation of Aarhus Convention provisions is regulated by: the Constitution of Ukraine, the Ukrainian Law on Information, the Ukrainian Law 'On the Protection of the Natural Environment'; the Ukrainian Law 'On Citizen’s Applications (Requests, Appeals)'; the Ukrainian Law 'On Protection of the Population and Territories'; the Ukrainian Law 'On Provision of the Sanitary and Epidemiological Well-being of the Population', etc.
- Slides for the lecture.

When conducting the lecture, maintain the participants’ interest!
To do this you can use the Aarhus Convention questionnaire, which can be handed out to the participants immediately at the start of the session, providing 10-15 minutes for filling it out. The list of questions covers all the main provisions of the Convention. While filling out the questionnaire, the participants will be able to pay attention to the provisions of the Aarhus Convention and to those questions that are difficult to answer. This can help hold the attention of the audience during the lecture and at the same time give you additional information about the level of their knowledge.

When handing out the questionnaire to the participants, definitely emphasise that this is not an examination paper, and there is no need to put their names on it. This is the way to carry out the analysis of the training needs of the group, and based on the results of this analysis you will be able to correct the programme of the training, if necessary. This explanation will lower the group’s resistance to filling out the questionnaire. Collect the questionnaires and analyse them during the break.

After you analyse the questionnaires, return them to the participants — it is not necessary that each questionnaire returns to the person who filled it out, you can give them back in a random order — and refer to the questionnaires during the training, when you review one or another issue. It is also possible to distribute the questionnaires at the end of the training and invite the participants to comment on the answers. A variant of the questionnaire is presented in Annex 1.
Annex 2.1.

Questionnaire on the Aarhus Convention

1. Has your country ratified the Aarhus Convention?
   - yes
   - no

2. Who are public concerned?
   - a/ Each citizen who can be affected as a result of a decision;
   - b/ Environmental NGOs;
   - c/ Any citizen interested in the subject.

3. Is a cleaning facility for sewage water run by the municipal authorities a ‘public authority’ according to the Aarhus Convention?
   - yes
   - no

4. Who can receive environmental information regarding the factory polluting the environment in the northern part of the country?
   (Check all options you consider appropriate)
   - a/ local inhabitants living in the immediate proximity of the factory;
   - b/ an ever-complaining local inhabitant living on the other side of town;
   - c/ representatives of local authorities;
   - d/ politician from the capital;
   - e/ a local non-governmental organisation;
   - f/ a non-governmental organisation from the neighbouring country;
   - g/ a chief competitor of the company located in the neighbouring town;
   - e/ a Russian tourist who came for one day.

5. Should the person requesting information state the reason for doing so?
   - yes
   - no

6. Can a representative of a public authority request the name and address of the person who requested environmental information?
   - yes
   - no

7. When must the representative of the public authority provide the requested (not complex) environmental information? As soon as possible but not later than:
   - a/ one day;
   - b/ within the same week;
   - c/ within 10 working days;
   - d/ within one month;
   - e/ within two months.
8. Can the Regional department of the Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources (or other relevant public authorities) refuse to provide the requested information regarding the spawning sites of a rare species of fish?

☐ yes  
☐ no

9. If the Regional department of the Ministry of the Environment and Natural Resources (RD MENR) does not have the information (but knows that another governmental office in charge may have it), how must the representatives of the RD MENR respond to the information request?

☐ a/ simply refuse to satisfy the request;  
☐ b/ tell the person that he or she should contact another governmental office in charge, and provide the name of that office;  
☐ c/ tell the person (respectfully) that the information is not available in the RD MENR;  
☐ d/ receive the information from another governmental office in charge and forward it to the person who requested the information.

10. A journalist heard that the RD MENR is working on a ‘new plan regarding some issue related to water, or perhaps air’. He or she would like to become familiar with this work. Should the representatives of the RD MENR satisfy this request for information?

☐ yes  
☐ no

11. A local non-governmental organisation learned that the RD MENR is taking samples of water in the local river. The non-governmental organisation is told that the samples are taken in order to compile a report regarding the condition of the environment. The report will be completed within several months. The non-governmental organisation would like to know what work has been done so far, including any reports. Should access to the information be granted?

☐ yes  
☐ no

12. A local employment agency would like to see reports regarding the health conditions of all RD MENR personnel. Should access to the information be granted?

☐ yes  
☐ no

13. A company wants to receive access to data describing the chemical composition and the structure of a competitor’s product (a part of the environmental permits).

Should access to the information be granted?

☐ yes  
☐ no

14. A company wants to receive access to data describing emissions into the atmosphere of a competing business (a part of the environmental permits). Should access to the information be granted?

☐ yes  
☐ no

15. A non-governmental organisation wants to receive copies of all files in (regarding some current case) (those to which it may have access). Should the non-governmental organisation pay for these copies?

☐ yes  
☐ no
16. What must the RD MENR do when responding that they refuse to satisfy the information request?

- a/ ignore the request and do nothing;
- b/ call the person who requested the information and tell him or her that it is not possible to access the information;
- c/ write a letter saying that access to the information is not possible;
- d/ write a letter — refusal to provide the information, explaining the reason for the refusal.

17. What types of information should be actively disseminated by a public authority?

- a/ national reports regarding the condition of the environment;
- b/ information regarding emergency situations;
- c/ relevant facts and their analysis, which are considered important when putting forward suggestions in the area of environmental policy;
- d/ information about products;
- e/ information about rare species and their condition;
- f/ laws and draft laws.

18. What are the general principles of public participation?

- a/ getting the public involved at an early stage when it is possible to influence the decision;
- b/ establishing a reasonable time frame for participation;
- c/ providing factual information about the possibilities of participation;
- d/ providing background information;
- e/ availability of all information used in making the decision for expertise;
- f/ providing an opportunity to submit comments;
- g/ publishing the decision of public authorities regarding the comments submitted by the public;
- h/ providing information about the final decision.

19. What does the NIMBY syndrome mean ('Not in my back yard')?

- a/ emotional resistance to some new development plans that appears when people feel that the projects, plans or construction may affect their property or safety;
- b/ people refuse to take part in the process of decision-making because they feel that the decision has already been made and their participation will not change the final decision;

20. Is it true that Aarhus is a town in Sweden?

- yes
- no
**Topic 1:**

**Access to Environmental Information**

The sessions for this topic are prepared based on the publication: 'Implementing the Aarhus Convention. A User Guide for Officials.' Chapter 1: Access to Environmental Information.

**General principles of access to environmental information (Session 3)**

- **Time:** 90 minutes
- **Expected results**
  After participating in this session, the participants will be able to:
  - Identify the rights of the public and those responsibilities that the Aarhus Convention gives to public authorities from the viewpoint of access to information;
  - Determine the requirements of the Aarhus Convention regarding access to information and compare them with national legislation;
  - Define the term 'environmental information';
  - Define the terms 'passive' and 'active' dissemination of information.

- **Plan of the session**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Element of the session</th>
<th>Method to use</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer Slides 3.1, 3.2</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Access to information</td>
<td>Interactive lecture Slides 3.3-3.7 Slides 3.8-3.10</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Environmental information and its forms The difference between the terms 'environmental information' and 'information regarding the condition of the environment'</td>
<td>Brainstorming Interactive lecture Slides 3.11-3.14</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Holders of environmental information</td>
<td>'Metaplan' Discussion in a large group Slides 3.15, 3.16</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Systems to collect, process and coordinate information</td>
<td>Interactive lecture Slides 3.17-3.21</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Forms of disseminating information: • active dissemination of information • passive dissemination of information</td>
<td>Discussion Slide 3.22</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Conclusion: Responsibilities of governmental institutions regarding disseminating information</td>
<td>The trainer summarises</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.1. Introduction

**Time: 5 minutes**

Remind the participants what the previous session was dedicated to and present the objectives and the plan of the session (Slide 3.1). Bring the participants’ attention to the fact that receiving information about the environment is the first step on the way to providing the possibility for the public to take part in the decision-making process (Slide 3.2).

**Slide 3.1. Expected results**

After having participated in this session, you will be able to:

- Review the rights of the public and those responsibilities that the Aarhus Convention gives to public authorities from the viewpoint of access to information.
- Determine the requirements of the Aarhus Convention regarding access to information and compare them to national legislation.
- Define the term ‘environmental information’.
- Define the terms ‘passive’ and ‘active’ dissemination of information.

**Slide 3.2. Right to information**

Environmental issues are solved in the most effective way when public concerned participate — on the relevant level. On a national level, each person should have relevant access to information related to the environment, which exists and is at the disposal of public authorities, including information regarding hazardous materials and activities in their communities, and the possibility to take part in the decision-making process. Governments develop and encourage public awareness and participation through the broad dissemination of information. An effective possibility to use the judicial and administrative procedures is provided, including reimbursement and the means of defence in a court of law.

*Principle 10, Rio de Janeiro Declaration on environment and development*

3.2. Interactive lecture: Access to information

**Time: 15 minutes**

**Plan of the lecture**

| 1/ right of the public and public authorities | Slides 3.3-3.7 |
| 2/ clarification of the terms: ‘information subject to disclosure’ and ‘official document’, and their compliance with national legislation. | Slides 3.8-3.10 |

**Slide 3.3. Right to information**

Access to information — one fundamental human right. Each individual, regardless of nationality, citizenship, residence, age and gender, has the right to environmental information.

**Slide 3.4. Right to environmental information**

Citizens have the right to receive information that:

- Concerns them directly or indirectly;
- Concerns issues that constitute public interest;
- In some way affects or may affect human life and health; family, region, or environment.

**Slide 3.5. Provisions about access to information**

Article 4 of the Aarhus Convention considers:

- The responsibility of public authorities, which guarantees that public representatives will be able to receive access to environmental information in response to their requests for it;
- The right of the public to receive the necessary environmental information in due time, in a proper form and in a proper place.

**Slide 3.6. Provisions about access to information**

Article 5 contains other aspects of information provision:

- The responsibilities of public authorities to provide information on their own initiative, without waiting for a request;
- The possibility of providing the public with access to all this information with the help of various means, including information centres, public registers, databases, websites, etc.
In general, the Aarhus Convention gives public authorities the following responsibilities:
- To provide free access to environmental information
- To collect environmental information
- To disseminate in active way certain kinds of environmental information

**Slide 3.8. Official document**

For example:

An official document is information located in governmental institutions, as well as information that has been received, processed, created and sent on behalf of a governmental institution or its official.

*General administrative code of Georgia, art. 21*

**Slide 3.9. Forms of information**

- written (text, drawing, model, plan, chart, etc.);
- visual (photograph, video film, DVD, etc.);
- audio (recording on a tape, CD);
- electronic information (databases, CDs, diskettes, etc.);
- any other forms (informational media of future generations).

**Slide 3.10. Forms of information**

If possible, information located in public authorities offices, apart from its material media, should have indications of the following aspects:
- what does the information concern;
- who compiled it; (who is responsible for the content — a person or an organisation);
- when;
- with what purpose (addressee).

### 3.3. Exercise: Environmental information and its forms

**Time: 15 minutes**

**Expected results**

After this exercise is conducted, participants will be able to:
- define the term ‘environmental information’;
- determine what environmental information they possess.
Necessary materials
Whiteboard or flip-chart, markers. Handout H 3.1.

How to organise the work
1. Conduct a brainstorming session on the following question:
   ‘What information, in your opinion, is environmental information?’
   Take notes of all the participants’ ideas on a flip-chart or whiteboard. If the participants start becoming less active, ask ‘Who else has any ideas on this subject’. After all the ideas are expressed, propose to see what the Aarhus Convention and national legislation say regarding the term ‘environmental information’.

2. Conduct a mini-lecture — Clarify the terms ‘environmental information’ and ‘information about the environment’ Slides 3.11-3.14. To illustrate possible environmental information by categories, distribute to the participants a fragment of an indicative list of environmental information (H 3.1.).

3. After explaining ‘Environmental information’, ask the participants to add to the list created during the brainstorming session.

   After explaining ‘Environmental information’, ask, what changes should be made to the list of ‘environmental information’?
3.4. Exercise: Holders of environmental information

Time: 20 minutes

Expected results
After the exercise is conducted participants will be able to:
• Determine the sources and holders of environmental information;
• Determine what environmental information is in the possession of the governmental institution where they work.

Necessary materials
Whiteboard or large sheets of paper, markers.

How to organise the work

1. Hand out to the participants coloured sticky notes (Post-it® notes) prepared in advance and ask them to write the names of their organisations on them. If the representatives of only one organisation are present at the seminar, prepare in advance the sticky notes with the names of various governmental institutions written on them.

2. Bring to the participants’ attention the list of ‘environmental information’ that was compiled earlier and ask them to stick their Post-it® notes near the information that, in their opinion, is in the possession of the institution that they represent.

Training tips
Various public authorities can have environmental information, even if those activities are not directly connected to environmental protection. Such environmental information can be filed with different public authorities. The list below will help you while conducting the exercise, even though in each case the result can be slightly different.
**Environmental information possessed by different public authorities, demonstrated using Hungary as an example.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public authorities</th>
<th>Type of information that they possess</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Environmental inspections | Data regarding users of the environment, such as reports about environmental inspections, environmental impact assessments, assessments of environmental indicators.  
Data regarding the protection of groundwater.  
Data regarding the pollution of water, soil, groundwater, the dumping of sewage water (waste water).  
Data regarding pollution that threatens the quality of water.  
Fines for pollution with sewage water (waste water).  
Data regarding surface water, etc. |
| Department of water economy | Data regarding water supply stations, water supply enterprises and users (Registration books of water services).  
An information system for water services management, with data regarding water supply stations, construction and use of water services management facilities, water use, protection of water use systems, use of water use systems, and prevention of damages caused as a result of water use.  
A hydrographic database, including quantitative and qualitative characteristics of surface and groundwater, their condition and change.  
A registry of water services, including quantitative and qualitative data of research of water resources, taking into account the waters, banks/coasts, other natural water objects, resources, connected with them, quantitative and qualitative data about water use and about the facilities that use water resources. |
| Local government bodies | Local action plans for the protection of the environment (APPE).  
Territorial development plans.  
Use of local environmental funds.  
Data regarding water resources and objects for the management of these resources.  
Data regarding the management of solid and liquid waste; plans for the treatment of sewage water (waste water), water-treatment facilities.  
Fines and payment for use. |
| Department of national natural reserves | Data regarding zones under protection, natural reserves, decisions regarding the work on environmental protection.  
Territorial system of monitoring and information. |
| State sanitary and hygiene departments | Health care data on soils, liquid and solid wastes and hazardous materials.  
Health care data on drinking water, technical water, surface water. |
| Ministry of the Environment and Water Services | The national system of environmental information.  
The national environmental fund. |
| Ministry of Industry and the Economy | The national energy programme.  
Transport network plans.  
The programme for the use of alternative energy sources. |
| Ministry of Agriculture and the Forest/ Timber Industry | Data on the protection of soils.  
Forest economy development plans.  
Data regarding the use of pesticides and chemicals. |
| Ministry of Education and Culture | The national programme for education in the field of the environment.  
Information regarding the network of environmental education structures. |
| Ministry of Finance, etc. | Data on the allocation of resources to be invested in environmental programmes.  
Budget assignments for the construction of roads. |

---

* Environmental democracy in practice — The handbook for environmental authorities and water services authorities, 2002, REC.  
See the example of information flow and the holders of environmental information in Estonia — Annex IIIa.
3. After completing the exercise, discuss the following questions:
   - Look at the list compiled as a result of the exercise — what can you say about the holders of environmental information?
   - What do you think regarding whether or not the holders of environmental information are always its owners? Draw examples.
   - Why do you think we have included this exercise in the training programme?

4. Make a summary with the help of Slide 3.15. Pay special attention to the fact that the information can be in the possession of commercial companies, and the government must provide for the coordination of this information too (Slide 3.16).

Emphasise that public authorities possess the information even in cases when it is physically located or stored in another place. Just as any other environmental information, it is subject to periodic updates to ensure the availability of the latest and most up-to-date information, and also the proper flow of relevant information.

3.5. Interactive lecture: systems for collecting, processing and coordinating information

Time: 10 minutes

Plan of the lecture

| 1/ Reasons for the creation of information systems | Slides 3.17, 3.18 |
| 2/ Data that the information systems should contain | Slides 3.19, 3.20 |
| 3/ Mechanisms for the coordination and effective access to information | Slide 3.21 |

3.15. Owners of environmental information

Various nature protection authorities, having governmental administrative functions with concretely specified responsibilities, works or services in relation to the environment.

Any other public authorities, institutions or private companies that are not the environmental authorities and were given the responsibilities or functions related to the environment, or provide services related to the environment. (Companies that have the information or conduct activities that impact the environment; specialised agencies; laboratories; universities and various semi-governmental structures to which the public authorities have delegated, for example, the responsibilities for reporting and monitoring.)

Public authorities should ensure:

- the registration of records and reports by the operators;
- regular research of emissions into the atmosphere and water, as well as into the soil and groundwater;
- the transfer and burial of wastes and information regarding emergency situations.

The government should encourage that companies regularly provide information regarding the emissions and dumping produced by their industries to local inhabitants and wider public circles, even though this may not be required under the legal provisions of this country.

3.16. Information from business structures

Public authorities should ensure:

- the registration of records and reports by the operators;
- regular research of emissions into the atmosphere and water, as well as into the soil and groundwater;
- the transfer and burial of wastes and information regarding emergency situations.

The government should encourage that companies regularly provide information regarding the emissions and dumping produced by their industries to local inhabitants and wider public circles, even though this may not be required under the legal provisions of this country.

3.17. Access to information: the requirements of the Convention

- Possess environmental information relevant to its own functions. (Art. 5.1)
- Regularly collect and update this information. (Art. 5.1)
- Disseminate in active way the environmental information. (Art. 5)
- Provide information on request. (Art. 4.1)

3.18. Mandatory information systems

In order to collect information, have it and update it, public authorities should have a reliable system and mechanisms for:

- Collecting and updating environmental information;
- Storing environmental information;
- Immediately notifying;
- Proactively disseminating information.
Slide 3.19. Mandatory information systems

Information systems should have information regarding the potential positive or negative effects and influences on human health, and, equally, on the environment; information that is necessary for decision-making.

- Use of natural resources
- Emissions into the atmosphere, water, soil, land
- Transfer and burial of wastes
- Information regarding emergency situations, etc.

Sometimes such information is kept at commercial companies.

Slide 3.20. Mandatory information systems

Public authorities should organise the systems that would secure the proper flow of information from enterprises to public authorities (Art. 5.1.b);

The Convention establishes the minimal requirements of the systems for:

- The regularity of the inflow of environmental information;
- The relevant processing and placement of environmental information.

Slide 3.21. Mechanisms of coordination and effective access to information

- Lists, registers or archives accessible to public
- Responsibility of the public authorities to provide support to the public in accessing information in line with the Convention
- Assignment of contact points (contact persons), etc.

Discuss the following questions:

- Why should a system for the collection, processing and coordination of information be created?
- What principal components are these systems required to have according to the Aarhus Convention?

In conclusion, emphasise that the resulting list is a sort of meta-information system or a register of the holders of environmental information that, if created, will make the implementation of the Aarhus Convention in the country significantly easier. Such a system will make it possible to avoid duplicating the functions of collecting information and organising its effective coordination and dissemination. These questions will be examined in a separate session.

3.6. Exercise: Forms of disseminating information

Time: 15 minutes

Expected results

After the discussion participants will be able to:

- Operate with the concepts of ‘passive’ and ‘active’ dissemination of information.

How to organise the work

1. Conduct a group discussion regarding the ways to disseminate information. Ask the participants: ‘In what way do you disseminate environmental information’? Ask them to take turns to speak in the circle.

2. Write the different variants on a whiteboard or a flip-chart, divided in two parts. On one side note the active ways of disseminating information, and on the other — all expressions related to the answers to the requests or letters of the public.

3. After all of those who wished to speak have done so, make a summary with the help of Slide 3.22.
3.7. Conclusion

Time: 10 minutes

How to organise the work

In order to summarise the results of the session, conduct a discussion in a large circle, keeping to the following questions:

– What is the difference between ‘environmental information’ and ‘information about the condition of the environment’?
– What rights does the Convention give to the public regarding receiving environmental information and what responsibilities does it give to public authorities?
– Why are the systems for collecting and coordinating information necessary?
– What types of dissemination of information does the Aarhus Convention provide for?

Adapt the session

• Use quotations from the national legislation that regulates access to information in general and access to environmental information in particular.
• Slide 3.8. Make a copy of a quotation from the national legislation regarding what is considered an ‘official document’.
• Slide 3.9. Adapt the list of forms according to the national legislation.
• Exercise 3.4. Make a list of the holders of environmental information according to the reality of the country.

Use handouts

• If a list of holders of environmental information has been created in your country, you can use it as one of the handouts. If not — it is possible to use a similar list from another country as an example in order to stimulate the creation of such a list.
• Slides for the lectures.

Use visual aids

To illustrate what you will talk about during this session or during the training in general, as well as to illustrate the importance of the issue being examined, hang up a poster with a suitable quotation from the Constitution of the country. For example:

“Any person has the right to receive full, objective and up-to-date information about his or her environment.”*

Constitution of Georgia, Art. 37

* Use a quotation from the National Constitution of your country.
Passive dissemination of information, or how to respond to requests of the public
(Session 4)

Time: 90 minutes

Expected results

After participating in this session, the participants will be able to:

- Define the main requirements of the Convention and national legislation regarding the provision of environmental information on request;
- Establish procedures, forms and time frames for responses to the requests to be delivered to organize an effective process of working with the requests and draft responses to them;
- Define the types of limitations for information to be provided on request;
- Name the methods to extract environmental information from a classified (confidential) document.

Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Element of the session</th>
<th>Method to use</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.1.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer Slides 4.1, 4.2</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.</td>
<td>Passive dissemination of information</td>
<td>Interactive lecture Slides 4.3-4.13</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.</td>
<td>Work with requests for information</td>
<td>Work in small groups Assignments to the groups</td>
<td>30 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4.</td>
<td>Exercise. Confidentiality of information: writing requests and responses to requests</td>
<td>Work with case studies</td>
<td>40 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a large group</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.1. Introduction

Time: 5 minutes

In order to open a session, discuss the following questions in a group:

- Do you often/have to work with requests for information from the public? (hear 2-4 responses using the ‘microphone’ method)
- What is a request for information?

Getting the participants involved in the process of work make them focus their answers on the given questions only, without transforming it into a broad discussion. After all the participants have spoken, explain what a ‘request’ means according to the Convention, and present the participants with the expected results and the plan of the session.
Slide 4.1. What is a ‘request’ for information?

The Convention does not offer a specific definition for the term ‘request’. Therefore it should be understood as follows:
✓ Any request made by a representative of the public to a public authority asking to provide information in a verbal form (by telephone or in person), or in written form (by letter, fax or e-mail). (Art. 4)

Slide 4.2. Expected results

After participating in this session, the participants will be able to:
✓ Define the main requirements of the Convention and national legislation regarding providing environmental information on request;
✓ Establish procedures, forms and time frames for responding to the requests to organise an effective process of working with requests and draft responses to them;
✓ Define the types of limitations for information to be provided on request;
✓ Name the methods of extracting environmental information from a classified (confidential) document.

4.2. Interactive lecture: Passive dissemination of information

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Sed do eiusmod tempor incididunt ut labore et dolore magna aliqua. Ut enim ad minim veniam, quis nostrud exercitation ullamco laboris nisi ut aliquip ex ea commodo consequat. Duis aute irure dolor in reprehenderit in voluptate velit esse cillum dolore eu fugiat nulla pariatur. Excepteur sint occaecat cupidatat non proident, sunt in culpa qui officia deserunt mollit anim id est laborum.

Exercise: Repetition of the main principles of access to information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exercise</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Plan of the lecture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Principles of access to information: Time frames, refusals and fee for information</td>
<td>15 minutes</td>
<td>Slide 4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Order of registration and control of a request for information</td>
<td>Slide 4.3, 4.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grounds for refusal</td>
<td>Slides 4.5, 4.6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Archives:

Exercise: Refreshing the main principles of access to information

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Sed do eiusmod tempor incididunt ut labore et dolore magna aliqua. Ut enim ad minim veniam, quis nostrud exercitation ullamco laboris nisi ut aliquip ex ea commodo consequat. Duis aute irure dolor in reprehenderit in voluptate velit esse cillum dolore eu fugiat nulla pariatur. Excepteur sint occaecat cupidatat non proident, sunt in culpa qui officia deserunt mollit anim id est laborum.

How to organise the work

Lorem ipsum dolor sit amet, consectetur adipiscing elit. Sed do eiusmod tempor incididunt ut labore et dolore magna aliqua. Ut enim ad minim veniam, quis nostrud exercitation ullamco laboris nisi ut aliquip ex ea commodo consequat. Duis aute irure dolor in reprehenderit in voluptate velit esse cillum dolore eu fugiat nulla pariatur. Excepteur sint occaecat cupidatat non proident, sunt in culpa qui officia deserunt mollit anim id est laborum.

Assignments for the test

1) The right to have information belongs to … regardless of …
2) All information is accessible, except …
3) Information should be provided without the requirement to state …
4) Information should be provided in the very form …
5) … should ensure that the requests for information are received by those authorities, …
Slide 4.3. Right to have information

- Any person regardless of nationality, citizenship, gender, age, etc., has the right to have information.

Slide 4.4. Principles of access to information

- All information is accessible except information to which the provisions regarding confidentiality apply.
- Information should be provided without having to state the reasons for interest in the information.
- In the very form in which it was requested.
- Public authorities should ensure that only the appropriate authority receives requests.

Slide 4.5. Time frames for providing information

Information should be provided:

- In the shortest possible time, no later than in one month;
- There is the possibility of extending the time frame (+1 month).

If the information cannot be provided during this time frame:

- It is necessary to inform the person who submitted the request that the time frame for preparing the response to his or her request has been extended (by one month).

Slide 4.6. Form of refusal and fee for information

- Refusals should be given in writing indicating the specific reasons for the refusal.
- If confidential information has elements related to the environment. They should be extracted and provided to the public.
- It is possible to charge a reasonable fee for providing environmental information.

Slide 4.7. Order of registration and control of requests for information

Registration and control of processing of requests for information require the existence of:

- corresponding systems for registration of requests and registration of work with them;
- clear distribution of responsibilities;
- special information services/points;
- registers of owners of environmental information (what information is located where) and the established contacts with these organisations.

Apart from this,

- the responsible public authorities should regularly undergo training;
- the existence of standard response forms helps to increase the efficiency of work.

Slide 4.8. Grounds for refusal

Refusals are the exception not the rule!

The reasons for refusing a request can be divided into two categories:

a) Conditions preventing the public official from providing information.

b) Interests that can be infringed as a result of releasing the information.

Restrictive interpretation: this is not a responsibility, but a right.

There should be clear rules, procedures and instructions. Legal consultations/support.

Slide 4.9. Grounds for refusal: conditions preventing a public authority from responding to the public

- A public authority does not possess information.
- The request is clearly not grounded or is formulated in too general a form.
- The material is in the final stage of preparation.
- The request is related to the internal documents of public authorities (protocols of meetings, internal letters sent within the boundaries of the same governmental office, internal correspondence between the Ministry and its employees).

Slide 4.10. Grounds for refusal: Interests that can be infringed as a result of releasing the information

- Releasing the information can negatively affect someone’s interests.
- Test for public interest: it should be made clear whether or not public interest outweighs private considerations.
Slide 4.11. Grounds for refusal: Interests that can be infringed as a result of releasing information (2)

- Confidentiality of internal paper work.
- International relations, national security, public security (clear criteria of classification are necessary).
- Information used by the judicial authorities (the case is being reviewed by a court).
- Commercial or industrial secrets (should be regulated by the law, this is where legitimate economic interests are concerned, and not, for example, the emissions).

Slide 4.12. Main elements of the Aarhus Convention. Grounds for refusal: Interests that can be infringed as a result of releasing information (3)

- Intellectual property rights (not applicable to documents or data financed from the state budget).
- Personal data (not applicable to legal persons).
- Interests of third parties (for example, voluntarily submitted information).
- Information concerning rare species (protection of rare species).

Excluded from list of exceptions: information regarding emissions!

Slide 4.13. The following information should definitely be extracted from confidential documents*

Based on national legislation it is impossible for the following types of information to be kept confidential:

- Information regarding the environment;
- Emissions into the environment;
- The health and safety of the population;
- Occupational and housing conditions;
- Data regarding danger to human health and life;
- Regarding disasters and other emergency situations that took place or may take place and threaten the health of the population.

* It is necessary to adapt slide No 13 to your national legislation.

4.3. Exercise: Work with requests for information

Time: 30 minutes

Expected results

After the exercise participants will be able to:

- Determine in practice the variants of answers to requests related to environmental information.

Necessary materials

Slides for the session, (it is advisable to hand them out to the participants), assignments for the participants, answers to the assignments, (for the trainer), a set of red, green and yellow cards for each of the participants.

How to organise the work

1. The content work is conducted using a method called, ‘Traffic lights’. Hand out to each participant all the variants of letters from the public, as well as a set of different coloured cards.

2. Explain the procedure of the exercise to the participants:

   Each letter is analysed by participants within one minute with the purpose of selecting a way to respond:

   a) immediate response to this request,
   b) a letter communicating a delay in providing information because the document is under development,
c) refusal to provide the information to confidentiality.

According to his or her choice, the participant selects a coloured card matching the context (green — provide information immediately, yellow — delayed provision, red — refusal).

3. Ask the participants to read letter No 1 and then raise the coloured card according to the selected type of action.

4. After everyone has raised their card, select one or two participants who had successfully completed the exercise, and ask them to briefly present arguments in support of their choice.

5. Move on to the next letters, repeating steps 3 and 4.

6. After the exercise, briefly reflect on the following questions:

- What can be the grounds for refusing information?
- What can help determine the correctness of identifying information as confidential?

Assignments for the groups*

LETTER 1

REQUEST

The Ministry of Environmental and Natural Resource Protection of this country has conducted a competition for those seeking a license for use of bentonite clay deposits from the Karasiovo region.

We request that you give us the financial part of the management plan of development of the open pit submitted by the company that won the competition.

Information is requested according to the General administrative code, articles 37, 38 and 40.

Georgi Petrov

To the Regional Department of Environmental and Natural Resource Protection of the Ivanovsk Region
From Georgi Petrov, Journalist from the newspaper Tribuna

Comments for trainer: The financial part of a company's management plan is a company's secret.

LETTER 2

REQUEST

In accordance with the norms of the Administrative code of this country I request to be provided the following information:

- A copy of the fishing license issued to Neptun JSC in the Mangalski Region;
- A copy of the contract (agreement) between Neptun JSC and the Turkish company KAMAL;
- A copy of protocol No 5-V of the interdepartmental council of experts in the area of the use of elements of the national fauna.

Maria Golovliova

To the Department of the Ministry of Internal Affairs of Ivanovsk Region
To the Environmental Police Service of the Ivanovsk Region
From citizen Maria Golovliova.

Comments for trainer: the requested information should be provided (the national Ministry of Protection of Environmental and Natural Resources is the holder of the information).

* It is necessary to adapt the links in the comments for the trainer according to the legislation of your countries. It is also recommended to adapt the names and the names of the settlements in such a manner that they correspond to your national laws.
LETTER 3

REQUEST

The inhabitants of the region have learned that the Regional development plan is being prepared. The public demands that the draft plan be brought forward for public discussion and the possibility of taking part in it.

We ask you to provide the information about the aforementioned draft plan.

Respectfully, Semion Petrov
Representative of the Community

Comments for trainer: since the Development plan is still under development, its public review is not possible yet, though public inclusion at the beginning stage of the development of the draft plan is possible.

LETTER 4

REQUEST

I am curing the sick with the use of medicinal herbs, and by doing this I help people. In order to treat one of the diseases I need a plant called ‘Convallaria majalis L.’, which was placed in the ‘Red Book.’

I request to be provided with information about where this plant widespread in order to help many people overcome the disease.

Alexander Chumak
Popular Healer

Comments for trainer: since the Development plan is still under development, its public review is not possible yet, though public inclusion at the beginning stage of the development of the draft plan is possible.

LETTER 5

REQUEST

As the public has learned, in the period from 1996 to 1997 at the military training ground in the village N… of the State Department of Border Defence, radioactive wastes have been unlawfully dumped. As a consequence, five soldiers who performed their military service in 1998-2000 at this training ground received a high dose of radiation and are at the moment receiving treatment in hospital. (The list of victims is attached)

We request to be provided with information about the current health condition of the soldiers who were exposed to radiation, as well information about the radiation doses and the results of the cytogenetic analysis.

Comments for trainer: it is impossible to provide information about a patient without his or her consent (The National Law on the Rights of the Patient, chapter __, Article __).

LETTER 6

REQUEST

I ask you to provide information about the condition of the seawater in the littoral area of the town of Ivanovo regarding whether or not it is possible to swim in it.

Tamara Gruzinskaya,
inhabitant of Goloseevka

Comments for trainer: the sanitary-epidemiology station possesses the information.
4.4. Exercise: Confidential information — drawing up requests and responses to them

📧 Time: 40 minutes

✔️ Expected results

After the exercise participants will be able to:

• Write a request to receive environmental information;
• Following the Aarhus Convention and national legislation, find ways out of difficult situations related to decisions concerning confidential information;
• Determine what support public authorities can provide to the public regarding receiving information.

📝 Necessary materials

Slides for the session, (it is advisable to hand them out to the participants), assignments for the participants, correct answers to the questions, (for the trainer).

🔍 How to organise the work

1. Arrange the participants into small groups. Explain to the participants the goals of the exercise and the order of work:

   **Stage I:** the participants familiarise themselves with the proposed situation in small groups and write the request for information (10 minutes).

   **Stage II:** the groups exchange requests, after which they give a substantiated response to the request they receive (10 minutes).

   **Stage III:** group discussion of the exercise (15 minutes).

2. Give the participants the assignment and ask them to work on it for 10 minutes.

3. Ask the participants (the groups) who worked with the first case to present the case and read the drafted requests. Discuss with the large group the structure and the content of a request. (See tips for the trainer explaining what information should be included in a request). After the discussion is finished, hand over the request to the groups that are working with case No. 2 (7 minutes).

4. Ask each group to formulate the response to the requests they received. Use assignment 2 presented at the end of the description of each case.
5. Following completion of the work in groups, ask the representative of one of the groups to read the response to the request and present the arguments to back his or her position. Ask the participants from other groups working on the same problem to present their response and arguments. Discuss in a large circle which of the variants seems to be the most accurate for this case.

6. Before moving on to the second case work through the first one completely. (7 minutes).

7. In a similar way present and discuss the response to the request in the second case (7 minutes).

7. In order to complete the exercise discuss the following questions:

- Why do representatives of the public turn to public authorities with requests for environmental information?
- What is important to remember when drafting a request?
- What provisions are necessary to follow when responding to a request?
- How are issues regarding commercial secrets being resolved?
- What support can public authorities provide to the public in the area of work with requests?

Again emphasise the provision stating that a request doesn’t have to indicate the reason for requesting the information.

Assignments for the groups
(handout material 1)

Case study No. 1
Selling the Overkill brand pesticide

The American company, Chemical Inc., manufactures a pesticide called Overkill and wants to start marketing the product in our country. The product must be approved by the Ministry of Environmental and Natural Resources*. Chemical Inc. has sent the appropriate application to the Ministry of the Environment to receive permission to sell the pesticide. In this request it has explained that the product is in use by Christmas tree farmers. Conifers are very sensitive to the larvae of the Coldorme bee. The bee lays eggs in the soil on the tree roots, and the larvae eat up the roots. The Overkill brand pesticide kills the larvae. The detailed description of the product and its composition is attached to the request.

A journalist learns about this request. He has recently returned from the USA where he had met with environmentalists who mentioned that this product is unsafe. In their opinion, Overkill is harmful to the environment. The research, conducted by students of Washington State University, has shown that birds that eat larvae treated with this pesticide have fallen ill and died. In the areas where this chemical has been used the number of some rare species of birds has decreased. The journalist is concerned with the possibility that the public authorities could give permission to use this chemical substance, and sends in a request to provide access to the information about the product. The officials of the Ministry of the Environment are not sure if they have the right to provide access to the description of the product that was attached to the request to be granted permission. Such information can be a commercial secret.

In such a way, the ministry faced a problem related to the possibility of providing access to information that is contained in the description of the chemical substance Overkill. If it is made accessible, the interests of Chemical Inc. may be infringed. The Ministry of the Environment sent a letter to Chemical Inc. asking whether it is possible to disclose the information regarding the chemical substance Overkill. In response, the company insisted on strict confidentiality of information pertaining to the contents and description of the product, since disclosing such information could lead to the chemical substance being copied. If another company reconstructs the chemical substance according to its description and starts selling it, Chemical Inc. would suffer significant economic damage.

Documents related to the current request

1. The Law on Polluting Agents and Products. Article 3: ‘Sales, import or utilisation of certain polluting agents and products is prohibited if prior permission from the Ministry of the Environment is not obtained. Products and substances subject to approval are such products and substances that contain one or more agents listed in the Annex I to the Law’.

2. The application from Chemical Inc. to the Ministry of the Environment to receive permission to sell Overkill. The detailed description of the product and its composition is attached to the application.

* Insert the name of the public authority responsible for giving permissions for these types of activities.
3. The letter of the journalist to the Ministry of the Environment (stage 1).
4. The letter from the Ministry of the Environment addressed to Chemical Inc. regarding providing information containing a description of the product.
5. The letter from Chemical Inc. to the Ministry of the Environment regarding the confidentiality of the product’s description.

(handout material 2)

Stage 1: Group 1. Assignment
Read the description of the case.
You are the journalist and concerned about how the public authorities will give permission to manufacture and utilise this product. Please prepare a request for providing information regarding the potential danger of this product to the environment. Refer to specific information and documents that should be made available to you.
You have 10 minutes to do the assignment.

(handout material 3 ⬇️ to be handed out only at stage 2)

Stage 2: Group 2. Assignment
Read the description of the case.
You work at the Ministry of the Environment and are responsible for providing information upon request. The ministry is not sure whether it may provide access to the product description that was attached to the application for approval to manufacture and apply the chemical agent. Such information can be a commercial secret. Please decide how to respond to the request of the journalist about providing the information.
Be prepared to present arguments to defend your decision.
You have 7 minutes to do this assignment.

The journalist can request the information based on the laws that regulate access to public information in the country and the Aarhus Convention*. For instance, in Estonia these issues are subject to the Law on Information:

Art. 3: Definition of public information.
Art. 4: Everyone has the right to receive public information.
Art. 9: The possessor of information must provide access to the information.
Art. 28: The description of the information that its possessor is obliged to make accessible.

The issue concerning commercial secrets is resolved on the basis of the Aarhus Convention, Art. 4.1. Information that should necessarily be provided on request from the public, and Art. 4.4. Commercial secrets.

When formulating the response of the Ministry of the Environment to the request of the journalist, make use of such questions as:
– What information does the public authority have?
– What information is public? Is the information in the public authority’s possession public?
– What information should the public have access to?
– What part of the public information is confidential?

The response should be based on national legislation, but when determining whether or not the information is confidential, the following general recommendations will be useful.

Information may be considered confidential if:

1) disclosure of all information can cause damage to the company or can give an advantage to other parties.
2) the holder of the information is certain that the information is not public domain.
3) the existing legal or other practice in a certain field of industry considers it to be such. (Notice that this information should be in line with the Aarhus Convention).

Answer: The journalist should be provided access to all documents, excluding any information that may be a commercial secret. Such information includes the full composition of the manufactured products, the description of a manufacturing technology, etc.

Information about emissions and the possible impact on environmental and human health must be provided without fail.

* Cite the quotations from national legislation regulating access to public information.
Case study No. 2

Environmental permission for the Ukrainian-Russian Steelworks

A Ukrainian enterprise, Ukrainian-Russian Steelworks, applied to the Ministry of the Environment for permission to manufacture steel products in a small settlement (not far from the town of Lviv, Ukraine).

Ukrainian-Russian Steelworks is a manufacturer of steel products. The enterprise intends to manufacture products that are utilised in the construction industry. These products contain heavy metals, including lead and cadmium. The output of foundry products containing lead and cadmium reaches 4500 kg a day. This means that, according to the Law on Protection of the Environment, the company must obtain permission from the Ministry of the Environment for such manufacturing.

The population of the village, located in the proximity of the planned industrial facility, is concerned over the prospect of pollution due to the emissions of the future industrial plant. Despite the fact that the company has promised jobs at the new industrial enterprise, residents are worried over the way its emissions will affect their health. Local inhabitants are especially concerned about the health of their children. They are familiar with the articles in the Russian press about the diseases of people caused by the functioning of similar industries. There is information as well about cases when children with disabilities were born in the settlements located near such industrial facilities.

Ukrainian-Russian Steelworks received permission to build a factory on condition that certain requirements would be met. The Ministry of the Environment was especially concerned about emissions of lead and cadmium. Therefore, detailed and very strict conditions regarding the norms for such emissions were stated in the permit. Apart from that, the company has pledged to undergo periodic monitoring and submit reports on these emissions.

Four years after the factory had been built, one of its employees approached the Ministry of the Environment. He confessed that he cannot conceal the truth anymore. Being responsible for compiling reports for the corresponding authorities on emissions containing lead and cadmium, he regularly falsified them. In reality, the emissions of lead and cadmium significantly exceeded the permissible norms. The monitoring results were constantly falsified as well at the instruction of the boss of Ukrainian-Russian Steelworks. The real level of pollution presents a serious threat to the health of humans and animals. The monitoring, conducted by the State Inspection, has also proven the information received from the employee of the industrial enterprise.

In the family of Mr. Ivanenko, one of the local inhabitants, the youngest child showed symptoms of lead poisoning after eating fish caught in the river that flows nearby. The family that became a victim wants to know what the public authorities know about the emissions that take place due to the functioning of Ukrainian-Russian Steelworks. Mr. Ivanenko sends a request to receive information.

Documents related to this case

1. The application sent by Ukrainian-Russian Steelworks to the Ministry of the Environment to receive permission contains information about the factory; about the products and the planned emissions of heavy metals.

2. Permission from the Ministry of the Environment includes information about the manufacturing and the products, the planned emissions of heavy metals, working conditions, permissible norms of emissions of lead and cadmium, the report on the environmental impact assessment (EIA) with all the necessary documents.

3. Various documents on monitoring of emissions, as well as the correspondence between the Ministry of the Environment and the state inspections.

Stage 1: Group 1. Assignment

Read the description of the case.

You are Mr. Ivanenko. Your son Vasya has fallen ill, he has suspicious symptoms, and you are very worried about his health and that of the entire family. You want to determine what factors that negatively affect health have emerged as a result of the functioning of the factory. Please indicate the type of document and type of information that you would like to have. What will you write in the request?

You have 10 minutes for this assignment.

Stage 2: Group 2. Assignment

You work at the Ministry of the Environment and are responsible for providing information in response to the request from Mr. Ivanenko. You are also concerned over the impact of the factory’s emissions on the health of the people, but at the same time you are not sure whether the requested information is a commercial secret or not. How will you respond to Mr. Ivanenko?

Be prepared to present arguments to defend your decision.

You have 7 minutes for this assignment.
4.5. Conclusion

Time: 5 minutes

To summarise the session, carry out the discussion of the session in a large circle, keeping to the following questions:

- What are the principal requirements of the Aarhus Convention and national legislation regarding the provision of environmental information on request?
- What are the terms for providing information?
- What are the procedures for providing information?
- What main recommendations can you use when determining whether or not information is confidential?

Thank the participants for their active work. Remind them that when more information is disseminated proactively, then fewer requests will arrive — this will result in saving the time of public authority and stimulate raising the level of environmental awareness among people. Prepare them for the next session by announcing that it will be dedicated to proactive dissemination of information.

Proposals on how to solve case No. 2

The request of Mr. Ivanenko contains two parts:

a. access to the existing information;
b. continuous access to information as it is being received.

The response from the Ministry of the Environment

Questions that are useful to answer when drafting a response:

- What information does the public authority have?
- What information is public? Is the information possessed by the public authority public?
- What information should the public have access to?
- What part of the public information is confidential?

Basis for the response:

Information can be obtained on the basis of the national law on public information and other laws. It is necessary to have quotations from the corresponding laws when working with case studies. For instance, the following articles in the Law on Information regulate access to information in Estonia:

Art. 3: Definition of public information.
Art. 4: Everyone has the right to receive public information.
Art. 9: The possessor of information must provide access to the information.
Art. 28: The description of the information that its possessor is obliged to make accessible.
Art. 2: A definition of environmental information.

The issue concerning commercial secrets is resolved based on the Aarhus Convention, Art. 4. Information that should necessarily be provided on request from the public, and Art. 4. Commercial secrets.

Response:

A. Mr. Ivanenko should be provided access to information related to all documents, excluding any information that may be a commercial secret. Such information includes the full composition of the manufactured products, a description of the manufacturing technology, etc.

B. Providing continuous access to information (as it is being received) is not guaranteed by the Aarhus Convention. If it is also not guaranteed by national legislation, then the only option that remains is following plain logic. The Danish experience is worth attention.

The public authority considers many cases; it is overloaded. The single request from Mr. Ivanenko about providing continuous access to information does not constitute a problem, but the public authority is not capable of fulfilling many requests. Its main task is to implement control over all information and check whether it is relevant to the reality so that it can be subsequently provided to one or another applicant. Furthermore, Mr. Ivanenko’s interest in this specific issue, according to the opinion of the public authority, does not require continuous access to information. However, access to existing information is open for him at any time.
Adapt the session

- Present the list of national laws that regulate access to ‘public information’.
- Prepare quotations from specific articles related to the confidentiality of information. Adapt Slide 4.13 by entering the provisions of national legislation related to the extraction of environmental information from classified documents.
- In Exercise 4.3, adapt the comments for the trainer in line with the national legislation of your countries.
- In order to adapt Exercise 4.4, cite quotations from the national legislation that regulate access to public information, the definition of public information, explain who can request this information and how, what is considered a commercial secret. In the description of the case it is necessary to indicate the name of the public authority that is responsible for issuing permits in your country.

Use your own examples

Do not be afraid of creating your own case studies.
Active dissemination of information (Session 5)

Time: 90 minutes

Expected results
After completing the session the participants will be able to:

- Define active dissemination of information;
- Define types of environmental information that is necessary to disseminate actively;
- Identify the ways of actively disseminating information;
- Identify the ways of supporting the public in receiving access to information;
- Develop criteria for effective dissemination of information;
- Use the methods of developing ideas to create a service of collecting and disseminating information.

Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1.</td>
<td>Introduction&lt;br&gt;1/ Expected results and the programme of the session&lt;br&gt;2/ Exercise on the effectiveness of transmitting information</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer, Slide 5.1 'Energiser' (if necessary)</td>
<td>5 min.  15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.</td>
<td>Proactive dissemination of information — types of information&lt;br&gt;1/ Definition&lt;br&gt;2/ The reasons for active dissemination of information&lt;br&gt;3/ Exercise: types of information that are subject to proactive dissemination&lt;br&gt;4/ The Aarhus Convention on the types of information that are subject to proactive dissemination</td>
<td>Interactive lecture Ranking Interactive lecture Slides 5.2-5.12</td>
<td>25 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.</td>
<td>The forms of active dissemination of information&lt;br&gt;1/ The forms of active dissemination of information — the requirements of the Aarhus Convention on access to information&lt;br&gt;2/ Meta-databases&lt;br&gt;3/ Access to information in electronic form&lt;br&gt;4/ Registers&lt;br&gt;5/ Ways to support the public in their search for information</td>
<td>Discussion Exercise Interactive lecture Slides 5.13-5.22</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.</td>
<td>Creation of an effective service for collecting and disseminating information&lt;br&gt;1/ Development of the criteria for an effective service&lt;br&gt;2/ Definition of goals, functions, structure and necessary resources&lt;br&gt;3/ Presentation of group work&lt;br&gt;4/ Discussion</td>
<td>Case studies Slide 5.23</td>
<td>35 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a large group</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.1. Introduction

Time: 5 minutes

How to organise the work

1. This session continues familiarising the participants with the main provisions of the Aarhus Convention. Present the objectives of the session using the slide. Introduce the session programme to participants (5 minutes).
Slide 5.1. Expected results

After participation in this session you will be able to:
- Define active dissemination of information and its types;
- Identify the means of active dissemination of information;
- Identify ways to support the public in receiving access to information;
- Evaluate the effectiveness of providing information in electronic form;
- Determine the strategy of effective dissemination of information for a case.

training tips

To make a transition to the subject of active dissemination of information, it will be useful to conduct one of the exercises on the effective communication of information at the beginning of the session. Such an exercise will help raise the energies of the group and will demonstrate that to communicate any information, including environmental, it is necessary to observe certain principles: precision, purposefulness, knowledge of the target audience to create a corresponding message, and select effective information channels, etc. You will find examples of exercises on effective communication in Annex 1 to this session. You will need 10–15 minutes.

The Aarhus Convention establishes minimum requirements for disseminating environmental information. But before looking at these requirements it is necessary to determine what active dissemination of information is and what information in particular should be disseminated in an active way.

5.2. Interactive lecture: Active dissemination of information, types of information subject to active dissemination

Time: 25 minutes

Necessary materials

Results obtained after conducting exercise 3.3. Whiteboard or flip-chart, markers.

Plan of the lecture

1/ Define active dissemination of information
   Slides 5.2, 5.3
2/ Reasons for active dissemination of information
   Slides 5.4, 5.5
3/ Exercise: types of information subject to active dissemination
4/ Aarhus Convention regarding the types of information subject to active dissemination
   Slides 5.6-5.12

Slide 5.2. Active dissemination of information: definition

The active dissemination of information is understood as the obligation given to a public authority to disseminate information on its own initiative (proactively).

Slide 5.3. Active dissemination of information — main requirements (Art. 5)

Each Party provides, within the framework of national legislation, for the procedures of providing environmental information by the public authorities to the public to be clear, and for environmental information to be easily accessible. (Art. 5.2)
After presenting the term ‘active dissemination of information’, ask the participants to identify the goals of active dissemination of environmental information. To do this, discuss the following question:

**Why is active dissemination of information necessary?**

Make a summary using Slides 5.4. and 5.5.

Ask the participants to go back to the results of the brainstorming session on the definition of environmental information that was carried out during Session 3 (Exercise 3.3). Allow the participants to select through multi-voting the type of information that should be disseminated proactively. The selected types of information can be marked with the help of coloured markers. Write the results on a separate sheet of paper.

Afterwards, briefly explain the type of information that should be disseminated proactively according to Article 5 of the Aarhus Convention (Slides 5.6-5.12).
The report should be published 3-4 times a year. The report should contain information regarding the condition of the environment and about the pressure on it. The report should be:

- interesting;
- attractive;
- informative;
- structured (to make it easier to search the necessary information);
- written so that it is easy to understand.

A public official is obliged to:

- act quickly;
- inform the part of the population that could find themselves in danger;
- provide all information necessary to prevent damages.

Art. 5.1 (c)

Emphasise that in many countries there is a well-organised system of communicating urgent information regarding emergency situations within the ministries. However, this information reaches the population slowly — for instance, such a situation developed after the breakdown at the Chernobyl nuclear power plant. The Aarhus Convention provides for the availability of a system for urgently dispensing information to the population in emergency situations.

Information regarding a product — is information about the environmental and biological properties of the product, as well as about its impact on human health. Each party develops mechanisms to provide the public with enough information about the products in a way that gives consumers an opportunity to make a substantiated choice, taking into consideration the interests of environmental protection.

(Art. 5.8)

** Provide the information in accordance with your national legislation.

For instance, on products that are found in the retail network of Georgia the following information is mandatory:

- name;
- manufacturer, company or country;
- consume before date;
- weight/volume;
- properties and composition (including additional substances);
- conditions of use/storage.

The Georgian Law on the Rights of Consumers, Art. 6

** Adapt slide 5.12. according to your national legislation.

Summarise the mini-lecture by asking participants several questions. For example:

- Are these provisions of the Aarhus Convention implemented in your country?
- What are the special features of national legislation regarding the active dissemination of information in comparison with the Aarhus Convention?
5.3. Interactive lecture: Forms of active dissemination of information

Time: 25 minutes

Plan of the lecture

| 1/ Requirements of the Aarhus Convention on access to information, forms of active dissemination of information | Slides 5.13, 5.14 |
| 2/ Meta-databases | Slide 5.15 |
| 3/ Access to information in electronic form | Slides 5.16-5.18 |
| 4/ Registers | Slides 5.19, 5.20 |
| 5/ Ways to support the public in their efforts to find information | Slides 5.21, 5.22 |

If in the beginning of the session you were carrying out exercises on effective communication, remind the participants about their results. Emphasise that the Convention provides for establishing certain mandatory measures aimed at securing effective communication (Slide 5.13).

Each Party provides, within the framework of national legislation, for the procedures of providing environmental information by public authorities to the public to be clear, and for environmental information to be easily accessible. (Art. 5.2)

Remind the participants about the results of the discussion regarding the forms of dissemination of information in Session 3 (Exercise 3.6). Dissemination of information can only be effective if it achieves the goal that was set, for example, ensures the participation of citizens, or timely informs them about an environmental threat. According to these goals the forms of dissemination of information are selected.

training tips

There can be various forms of dissemination of information. The participants may identify them during the discussion. Lead them to the conclusion that, depending on the goal of disseminating information, different forms with different effectiveness may be chosen.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WRITTEN</th>
<th>VERBAL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Letters</td>
<td>Direct communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Memoranda</td>
<td>• Conversations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reports</td>
<td>• Meetings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic mail</td>
<td>• Speeches (presentations)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tele-faxes</td>
<td>Indirect communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulletin boards</td>
<td>• Telephone conversations/Tele-conferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mass media</td>
<td>• Tape recordings/Answering machine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Newspapers</td>
<td>• Video-conferences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Magazines</td>
<td>Mass media</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Brochures</td>
<td>• Radio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Publications in the Internet</td>
<td>• Television</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Perform a mini-lecture detailing the Convention’s requirements for disseminating information and supporting the public in receiving information.
Slide 5.14. Requirements of the Convention for the dissemination of information

The public should be provided information with the help of the following mandatory systems:

- Information about the type and amount of information that is held by various public authorities, as well as ways to access it — meta-databases;
- Electronic databases;
- Publicly accessible lists and registers;
- Contact points/services.

Apart from that the public should also be given support in receiving information (certain information should be provided free of charge).

Slide 5.15. Information regarding information — meta-databases*

The Aarhus Convention puts forward a requirement that the public should be provided with environmental information free of charge.

Environmental information that is in the possession of the relevant public authority.

Access to lists, registers and archives containing information regarding:

- the type;
- amount;
- terms;
- conditions;
- and procedure for receiving information.

* Present information about the existence of such systems in your country; if such systems do not exist, emphasise the importance of their creation.

Slide 5.16. Providing information in electronic form

The Convention provides that the amount of environmental information in electronic databases be increased step by step:

- State of the environment report;
- Texts of legislative acts on issues related to the environment;
- Policies, plans and programmes;
- Agreements in the area of protecting nature;
- Other information.

Slide 5.17. Examples of access to information in electronic form*

* Examples are described in Annex 2.

Slide 5.18. Examples of access to information in electronic form

* Examples are described in Annex 2.
The Aarhus Convention obliges the Parties to take measures to conduct nationwide inventory-taking, to compile registers and establishes that a register should be:

- Nationwide and consistent;
- Structured;
- Universally accessible;
- Based on standard report systems. (Art. 5.9)

The Pollutants Release and Transfer Register (PRTR) is a common database containing information about potentially dangerous emissions and their transfer. On the 21st of May 2003 in Kyiv, the Parties signed the Protocol on ‘Pollutants Release and Transfer Registers’.

Ask the participants to think how they can support the public in receiving information. Ask a few people to express their opinions. Then present the information from the Aarhus Convention (Slides 5.21, 5.22).

A public authority is obliged to:

- Provide information regarding the types and amount of information possessed by his or other public authorities, the main conditions and procedure for providing information, etc.;
- Help formulate a request, for example, give consultations regarding the openness of the information;
- Provide other useful information.

5.4. Exercise: Creation of an effective service for collecting and disseminating information and/or an information centre

Time: 35 minutes

Expected results

After completing the exercise the participants will be able to:

- Define the criteria of effective service for collecting and disseminating information and/or an information centre;
- Set the goals, functions and structure of such a service/centre;
- Determine what resources are necessary to create a service/centre on the governmental level (on the level of the region or the organisation where the participants work), depending on the target group.

Training tips

It is possible to give this assignment to the groups for independent work. It is advisable to allocate somewhat more time for it.
**Necessary materials**
A whiteboard or flip-chart, markers, handout materials for groups H 5.1., H 5.2. Slides 9.9-9.22 from Session 9.

**How to organise the work**
1. Before the start of the exercise announce that when implementing this exercise it is possible to apply in practice the knowledge gained during this session, and think about the ways that the provision of the Convention about proactive dissemination of information, presented on Slide 5.23, should be implemented.

The way to implement these provisions is to create a service for collecting and disseminating environmental information, as well as contact points to simplify public access to environmental information.

The exercise presented below is designed to teach participants to apply these provisions in practice, and contemplate the possibility of creating such a service (centre). This consists of several stages:

- **Stage 1. Development of an effective service criteria.**
- **Stage 2. Definition of the goals, functions, structure and necessary resources.**
- **Stage 3. Presentation of results.**
- **Stage 4. Discussion.**

**Stage 1. Development of an effective service criteria**

Together with the participants conduct a brainstorming session on the following question:

*What criteria should an effective service for collecting and disseminating environmental information meet?*

Write all proposed answers on a flipchart, conduct an analysis and summarize the proposed criteria if it is necessary, arrange them in their order of significance.

**training tips**

Criteria may include:

- The existence of precise, regularly updated and reliable information;
- Good communication between operators who create the information and the information service;
- The possibility of conducting a fast and effective search for information;
- Accessibility of information to the public;
- A quick system of disseminating information;
- Quick answers to requests;
- And others.

Give the participants some information on the theory of communication with the help of slides presented in Session 9.

Ask the participants to move on to creating an information service or centre ‘in practice’.
Stage 2. Definition of goals, functions, structure and necessary resources

Arrange the participants into 2-4 small groups and explain the assignment: the first group(s) create a project of effective service for collecting and disseminating information; the second group(s) — a project for an information centre with the goal of making access to environmental information easier.

Emphasise that each group may work individually and turn to the trainer for consultation. Remind them that when developing a project for information service/centre, the participants should follow the criteria that have just been developed. After the allocated time runs out, each group will have to present the results of their work at a plenary session.

Assignments for the groups

Group 1. Assignment

You have 20 minutes to create a project of an effective service for collecting and disseminating of information.

To do this, determine step-by-step:

• The purpose for the existence of this service (what information and to whom will you be proactively disseminating, what channels will you be using for this)
• The function and structure of the service
• The resources necessary for creating the service and its effective work
• Arrange the results of your work on a large sheet of paper. Select one or more presenters who will present the results of the work to the larger group

Time for presentation — 5 minutes.

To present the results you may use charts, diagrams, descriptions and other means of communicating information.

Assignments for the groups

Group 2. Assignment

You have 20 minutes to create a project for an information centre, the purpose of which is to make access to environmental information easier.

To create it you should determine:

• The purpose for the existence of the centre (what information and to whom will you be proactively disseminating; what channels will you be using for this)
• The functions and structure of such a centre
• The resources necessary for the creation of the centre, and for it to work effectively
• Arrange the results of your work on a large sheet of paper. Select one or more presenters who will present the results of work to the larger group

Time for presentation — 5 minutes

In order to present the results you may use charts, diagrams, descriptions and other means of communicating information.

Stage 3. Presentation of results

Ask the groups to present the results of their work taking turns. Stipulate that the time for presentations is 5 minutes for each of the groups. Give 2-3 minutes for questions to the presenting group and for comments on enhancing the project.

You can ask the groups to vote and select the best project for a service and a centre.
Stage 4. Discussion

Discuss the following questions with the groups:

- What are the main elements of an effective information service?
- Were you successful in reflecting in your project the requirements of the Convention regarding proactive dissemination of information?
- How can you use the results of this exercise in your practical activities?

5.5. Conclusion

**Time: 10 minutes**

To summarise the results of the session, discuss the session in a large circle on the following questions:

- Why is it necessary to disseminate information actively?
- What forms of active dissemination of information exist?
- How does the Aarhus Convention describe measures for the effective dissemination of information?
- What new practical ideas on active dissemination of information in your workplace (in your organisation) came to your mind?

**practical advice**

Adapt the session

- Slides 5.10-5.12. Use the provisions of national legislation to present a system of information regarding the products in your country.
- Slide 5.15. Present the information regarding the existence of a system of meta-databases in your country. If such systems do not exist, emphasise the importance of their creation.
- Exercise 5.4. If the goal of the training is to create a model for an information service and centre, there is a reason to allocate more time for this exercise.

Use the following handout materials

- Slides for the lectures
- Handout materials for Exercise 5.4
- Slides 9.2 and 9.9-9.22 of Session 9
Annex 5.1. Exercises on effective communication

Exercise 1. ‘Paraphrasing’

✔️ Expected results
The exercise will provide an opportunity for understanding that in the process of communication, information could change, therefore, it is important to communicate information with precision.

✈️ How to organise the work
1. Prepare sheets of paper with certain phrases (proverbs, common sayings, quotations of famous people), for example: ‘you will reap as you have sown’.
2. Arrange the participants into small groups equal in number (4-5 persons).
3. Explain the assignment:
   • Read the phrase, fold the part of the paper containing the writing so that the latter is concealed, reproduce the meaning of the phrase in your own words close to the original text on the blank part of the paper;
   • Hand over the paper to the next participant;
   • Each consecutive participant must be able to see only the last writing (made by the previous participant);
   • The exercise must be performed by all participants.
4. When the exercise is completed, ask the last person who wrote on the piece of paper in each of the groups to read the first and the last phrase.
5. Ask them to unfold the piece of paper and read all phrases in the order of their appearance.
6. Together discuss the following questions:
   – What conclusion can be drawn after having conducted this exercise?
   – What can happen if information is not communicated correctly?
   – How can this be prevented?

If you conduct this session during the second part of the day, it is advisable that the exercise you select also serves as an energizer. We suggest the exercise ‘Drawing on the back’.

Exercise 2. ‘Drawing on the back’

✔️ Expected results
The exercise will give an opportunity to understand that information may transform in the process of its communication, therefore it is important to communicate information with precision.

✈️ How to organise the work
1. On sheets of A4 format paper prepare two simple sketch-type drawings. For example, a drawing of a house and a car.
2. Invite two volunteers who will agree to participate in the exercise that will demonstrate communication of information.
3. Ask the rest of the participants to assist in the exercise, arrange them in two groups and ask them to stand in columns (where the participants stand one behind the other facing the back of the person in front of them).
4. Ask the two volunteers to stand at the back of each of the columns and show them the different drawings.
5. Ask the volunteers to ‘communicate’ the drawing to the person who stands in front of them by drawing it on their back. Instruct participants who have received the drawing to ‘communicate’ it to the person standing in front of them.

6. Ask the participants at the other ends of the columns to draw on a flip-chart what they have ‘received’.

7. Ask the volunteers to show what drawings they had received in the very beginning.

8. Together discuss the following questions:
   - What have we demonstrated just now?
   - Is it similar to what happens to information in our life?
   - What conditions are necessary to communicate information effectively?

Annex 2. Explanations to the slides 5.17, 5.18

Today I make the decision (Slide 5.17)

One of the best achievements in Estonia in the field of use of electronic tools for public participation is the portal for the population, called ‘Today I make the decision’ [http://tom.riik.ee](http://tom.riik.ee).

The purpose of the web-site, located on the governmental electronic portal, named TOM, or ‘Täna Otsustan Mina’ (which in English means ‘today I make a decision’), is to stimulate public participation in the process of state decision making. All ministries place their draft laws on this web-portal for comment within a certain time frame. Additionally, anyone may present their own ideas, suggestions or thoughts, as well as submit comments to the draft laws presented by others or amended by the ministries during the preliminary stage. Ideas that found support among the users, by the decision of the Prime Minister, are sent for implementation to the corresponding public authority. In this way the public can constantly monitor what happens to the proposed ideas. One only needs to register before presenting for review, or commenting on, or voting and giving one’s ‘signature’ to, certain ideas.

The popularity of the TOM is demonstrated by the fact that for the two years of its existence 430 of the proposals that had been submitted on the portal have been entered into the legislative provisions of various governmental organisations. In the state of ‘collecting signatures’ (each proposal should collect a certain number of ‘signatures’, and only then will it be possible to send it for revision and modification to the ministries) there are about ten legislative acts based on the proposals that have been submitted on the portal.

The TOM was given an award by the European Commission during an electronic conference that took place in Brussels in 2001.

Internet-forum on lawmaking for the third sector (Slide 5.18)

Another solution based on electronic technologies and aimed at supporting the joint activities on creating legislation by the Estonian public and the third sector is offered by the non-governmental organisation the ‘Estonian Law Centre’.

The Centre cooperates with the ministries to present draft laws together with clarifications and prepared lists of the most critical problems) on the internet-forum. Simultaneously the centre informs the organisations of representatives of the third sector that are concerned with one or another draft law, and invites them to express their ideas.

There is a time limitation on the procedure for creating each draft law, and when the time for discussion comes ends, the forum is closed and the summary is made, which, in the form of an official document, is submitted to the relevant ministry for a response.

If the ministry refuses to present a draft law on the forum in order to send it for co-ordination to other ministries, the forum sends the suggestions and remarks directly to Parliament.

The purpose of the forum is to provide access to the draft laws at the earliest possible stages of their development, because the terms of coordination are not long and no one except the forum has the time to review the suggestions that are submitted by the public.
Establishment of a service for collecting and providing environmental information: Analysing problems and finding solutions (Session 6)

Time: 80 minutes

Expected results
After completing the session, participants will be able to:
• Outline ways to solve a concrete problem;
• Determine how they can participate in solving this problem at their work place;
• Determine the first steps to solve the problem.

Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>Introduction. Exercise ‘Understanding of…’</td>
<td>‘Energiser’</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 6.2 | Exercise ‘Carpet of ideas’
  1. Definition of the problem
  2. Determining the causes of the problem
  3. Finding the solutions
  4. Individualisation of actions
  5. Evaluation of ideas |                  | 55 min. |
| 6.3 | Conclusion                                                   | Discussion in a larger group | 20 min. |

6.1. Introduction
Present the expected results of this session with the help of Slide 6.1.

Slide 6.1. Expected results
After completion of this session, the participants will be able to:
✘ Outline ways to solve a concrete problem;
✘ Determine how they can participate in solving this problem at their work place;
✘ Determine the first steps to solve the problem.

training tips
In this session the method ‘Carpet of Ideas’ will be used, which is effective for finding ways to solve problems. Conducting such an exercise will allow the participants to apply their knowledge and skills obtained as a result of training to a real situation. Each participant will receive an opportunity to think what he or she in particular can do to implement the provision regarding active dissemination of information at his or her own work place.

This method can be used to solve various kinds of problems. Nevertheless, it is better to select a problem that would be related to the subject of the entire training. For example, ‘Creating a service for collecting and disseminating environmental information is difficult’.

In this session the method ‘Carpet of Ideas’ will be used, which is effective for finding ways to solve problems. Conducting such an exercise will allow the participants to apply their knowledge and skills obtained as a result of training to a real situation. Each participant will receive an opportunity to think what he or she in particular can do to implement the provision regarding active dissemination of information at his or her own work place.

This method can be used to solve various kinds of problems. Nevertheless, it is better to select a problem that would be related to the subject of the entire training. For example, ‘Creating a service for collecting and disseminating environmental information is difficult’.
Exercise: Understanding of...

Small items are placed in a non-transparent bag (a handkerchief, a hair comb, a shoe, etc.). After that everyone pulls out one of the objects and describes how he or she associates the object in his or her mind with the concept of ‘Effective service for collecting and disseminating information’ or the concept of ‘Effective information access point’.

These associations can become a good basis for discussion of the subject.

6.2. Exercise: Carpet of Ideas

Necessary materials

Before beginning the exercise prepare the following: Strips of paper (in three colours, 30-40 strips of each colour); 4 flip-charts; glue; post-it® notes of two colours (two post-it® notes of each colour for each of the participants).

How to organise the work

1. Announce that we have a problem with implementing the provisions of the Aarhus Convention, namely: the creation of a service for collecting and disseminating environmental information on all levels is difficult. Arrange the participants into four groups. Sit the groups at separate tables.

2. Announce that the first stage of the work will be dedicated to understanding the problem, and an analysis of what caused the problem to appear. Ask the participants to answer the following questions: Why does this problem exist? Why is it difficult to create a service for collecting and disseminating environmental information? Write the questions on a flip-chart so that the participants remember it during the work.

• Each group receives 10 coloured post-it® notes and a flip-chart.
• The task of a group is to answer the question that has been posed, write the answers on the post-it® notes (one answer per post-it® notes, and it is not necessary to use all of them), and after that to make a ‘carpet’ on a flip-chart by pasting the strips in a way that makes it possible to read what was written.
• Allocate 10 minutes for the groups to do this work.

Afterwards, for 2 minutes the groups present their ‘carpets’ and read their answers.

3. Announce that now we know the reason and therefore can move on to the second stage — finding solutions. Suggest contemplating: what can be done to change the existing situation? Write this question on the flipchart too.

• Each group receives 10 coloured strips of paper (of another colour) and, keeping in mind the reasons, writes their ideas on how to solve this problem on the colour strips (one answer per strip, and just as in the previous stage, it is not necessary to use all the strips), and then paste these strips, adding them to their ‘carpet’.
• Allocate 15 minutes for this work
• After the groups finish, they present their ‘carpets’ and read their ideas for 2 minutes.

4. Announce that the reasons for the problem are clear; the ways to solve it are determined. It is possible to move on to the third stage — individualisation of actions. At this stage each of the participants will answer the following questions: what will I personally do this year to bring about a change to the existing situation? What concrete actions will I take? Write the answers to these questions on a flipchart.

• Each of the participants, having received 3-5 post-it® notes, writes their actions on them (one action per post-it® notes, if someone decides that they can do more — they can take another post-it® notes).
• Everyone ‘plaits’ their post-it® notes into the group’s ‘carpet’.
• Allocate **10 minutes** for this work.

5. Tell the participants that you may move on to the fourth stage — to evaluate ideas by the multi-voting method. This is the point when participants evaluate how realistic their intentions are.

• Every participant receives two red and two green post-it® notes. The red colour stands for: ‘I will absolutely do this during the current year’, the green colour post-it® notes for: ‘I will try to do this during the current year’.

• All participants walk around the room, re-read their own ideas, as well as the ideas of the others once again, and place their post-it® notes on the ideas that they would select (it is not necessary to use all the post-it® notes). Allocate **10 minutes** for this work.

• In conclusion, briefly (for no longer than 3 minutes) present the most popular ideas that received the most votes during the multi-voting.

### 6.3. Conclusion

**Time: 20 minutes**

Summarise the results using the following questions:

– What new things have you learned during this exercise?
– How many ideas has your group proposed to solve the problem?
– What ideas from other groups seemed most interesting to you?
– What steps has your group taken to solve the problem?
– At what stage of the problem solving did you face difficulties?
– What will happen if one of the steps is omitted?
– If all the steps were taken, can the problem be considered solved?
– What have you remembered the most from this work?
– Can we say that we have done a useful job? Why?
– What else needs to be done to solve this problem?
– What was everyone’s role in solving this problem?

Concluding the session, emphasise that this was an opportunity for us to think what each of us does to solve a problem.

---

**practical advice**

### Choose the right time to conduct this exercise

It is advisable to conduct this exercise at the end of a training, since it transfers the theoretical information to the personal level — ‘how will I apply what I have learned?’

### Correct the exercise so that it matches the subject of the training

Depending on the goal of your training you can use the following statements:

- ‘It is difficult to create a point for public access to environmental information in a governmental institution’.
- ‘Public participation in decision-making on environmental matters in our country is not effective’.
- ‘The provisions of the Aarhus Convention are not implemented in our country’.

You can similarly formulate other problems that correspond to the subject of the training or to the needs of a target group.
**Topic II. Public Participation in Decision-making**

The sessions for this topic are prepared based on the publication: ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention. A User Guide for Officials.’ Chapter 2: Public Participation.

**Main principles of public participation (Session 7)**

- **Time: 90 minutes**

- **Expected results**
  
  After completing this session the participants will be able to:
  
  - Define the terms ‘the public’ and ‘public concerned’;
  - Identify the main advantages of public participation for various stakeholders;
  - Determine the reasons for ineffective public participation in decision-making;
  - Clarify the main principles of public participation presented in the Aarhus Convention.

- **Plan of the session**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer Slide 7.1</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Public participation, main concepts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– ‘the public’</td>
<td>Interactive lecture Slides 7.2-7.10</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– ‘public concerned’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>– ‘public participation’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Advantages of public participation</td>
<td>Work in groups of three Presentation of results Assignments for the groups H 7.1., H 7.2.</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Reasons for ineffective public participation in decision-making</td>
<td>Individual work with working sheets Discussion in a joint group Assignments for the groups H 7.3.</td>
<td>35 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>Main principles of public participation</td>
<td>Interactive lecture Slides 7.11-7.19</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a larger group</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**7.1. Introduction**

- **Time: 5 minutes**

  Tell the participants that the result of their participation in each session of the training will be very specific knowledge and skills. Formulate the goal of the session and present its results with the help of Slide 7.1, familiarize the participants with the plan of the session.
Slide 7.1. Expected results

After completing this session the participants will be able to:
✘ define the terms ‘the public’ and ‘public concerned’;
✘ identify the main advantages of public participation for various stakeholders;
✘ determine the reasons for ineffective public participation in decision-making;
✘ clarify the main principles of public participation presented in the Aarhus Convention.

7.2. Interactive lecture: Public participation: main concepts

Time: 10 minutes

Plan of the lecture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1/ What is ‘the public’?*</th>
<th>2/ Definition of the terms ‘the pub’ and ‘public concerned’ according to the Aarhus Convention</th>
<th>Slides 7.2, 7.3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3/ Public participation: definition and general concept</td>
<td>Slides 7.4-7.10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Before starting the lecture ask the participants to answer the following questions:

– Who, in their opinion, is meant by the term ‘the public’?
– What are ‘ublic concerned’?

Listening to the answers, write the main points on a flip-chart or a whiteboard in a way that would allow the participants to formulate the definition themselves. After having heard 2-3 participants, comment using Slides 7.2. and 7.3.

Slide 7.2. Main concepts: ‘the public’

Public — means any natural persons without limitations in terms of age, nationality, place of residence or citizenship. In addition, the public also include NGOs and other associations and groups created in line with national legislation.

Slide 7.3. Main concepts: ‘public concerned’

Public concerned — is a group of citizens or their associations, whom given decisions concern or may concern, as well as those who are interested in the process of preparing a decision but are not responsible for this decision by virtue of their duties.

Whom may adopted decisions concern: local inhabitants, representatives of local businesses, municipal organisations, NGOs, etc.

Who is interested in the process of decision-making: any NGO, with one of its goals, according to their Statutes, being the protection of the environment; societies of consumers, scientific and technical circles that have a professional interest in a project, etc.

* If the definitions of ‘the public’ and ‘public stakeholders’ have already been discussed in the previous sessions, skip the discussion and simply remind the participants of the definitions using the slides.
Slide 7.4. Main concepts: ‘public participation’

Public participation — is a process of interaction between organisations responsible for making environmentally important decisions on the one hand, and the public on the other. Due to this process, the points of view, positions, opinions of the public are integrated and taken into consideration when official decisions are made.

* This term is not provided by Aarhus Convention, but in the same time it is used in the East European and Caucasian Region for cases when planned activities may cause a significant impact on the environment.

Slide 7.5. Environmentally important decisions*

Environmentally important decisions — are decisions in the area of economic activities and all projects and programmes that may have a significant environmental impact.

**TYPES OF ENVIRONMENTALLY IMPORTANT DECISIONS**

- Development of legal acts, related to the environment
- Development of plans, programmes and policies, related to the environment
- Decisions on specific types of activities

*This term is not provided by Aarhus Convention, but in the same time it is used in the East European and Caucasian Region for cases when planned activities may cause a significant impact on the environment.

Slide 7.6. Decisions, related to specific types of activities

- Location of landfills where over 10 tonnes of waste is being delivered daily;
- Construction of facilities for the production of bricks and ceramic tiles in order to burn and bury the dangerous waste products;
- Construction of motorways and high speed roads, dams; other types of activities, indicated in Annex 1 to the Aarhus Convention;
- Any type of activity for which it is necessary to conduct an environmental impact assessment.

Slide 7.7. Decisions concerning the development of plans, programmes and policies, related to the environment

- Development plans of towns and settlements, projects and outlines of detailed planning;
- Plans for the integrated use and protection of natural resources;
- Plans for the development of branches of industry and plans for the social-economic development of territories…

Slide 7.8. Decisions related to the development of legal acts, the application of which will significantly affect the environment

- Draft laws developed by public authorities before they are sent to the Parliament;
- Other legal documents, including decisions of regional executive committees.

Slide 7.9. Principles of public participation

The concept of public participation is built on two principal assumptions:

- People have the right to participate in the development of principal decisions that will influence their lives;
- Due to the active involvement of interested groups of the population, the quality of political and administrative decisions can be increased.

Establishing interaction with the public — is the task of public authorities and communal services structures that plan one or another type of decision.
Slide 7.10. National legislation*

According to national legislation, everyone has a right:

✘ To participate in the development of the laws and resolutions on the protection of nature and the control of their implementation (‘Basics of the legislation ______ about the protection of the nature’, Art.____);

✘ In the established order participate in the development, discussion and adoption of decisions on securing sanitary-epidemiological safety (The Law on ‘Securing the sanitary-epidemiological safety of the population ______, Art.____);

✘ Participate in the process of decision-making by means of public hearings (The Law on ‘Environmental Impact Assessment’, Art.____).


* Adapt Slide 7.9 according to your national legislation.

7.3. Exercise: Benefits of public participation

Time: 20 minutes

Expected results

After completing the exercise the participants will be able to:
• Determine the benefits of public participation for public authorities that make decisions for representatives of the public and for business structures.

Necessary materials

Workbook sheets to be filled out ‘Benefits of public participation’ for every group (H 7.1.), handout materials ‘Answers: Benefits of public participation’ (H 7.2.), flip-chart or a whiteboard, markers.

How to organise the work

1. Arrange the participants into groups of three (or in pairs — depending on the size of the group). Hand out to each group the working sheets ‘Benefits of public participation’, working sheet 7.1.

2. Explain the assignment to the groups.

In 10 minutes the groups should fill out the working sheets that contain the following question:

¿ What benefits do various social groups receive from public participation?

The participants should write at least three possible options for each of the stated social groups: public authorities that make decisions, businesses, NGOs/citizens.

3. After all the participants fill out their sheets, ask them to read the results. Organise the work in the following way:

a/ First, ask volunteers to read the benefits of public participation for public authorities that make decisions. Write all the ideas on a flip-chart entitled ‘Benefits of public participation for public authorities that make decisions’.

b/ Then ask the other groups to read their ideas, adding to the resulting list. Announce to the participants the additional benefits listed in the handout material ‘Answers’ and suggest adding them to the list. Having received the group’s consent, add your suggestions.
Developing and delivering trainings for Officials. A Manual for Trainers
PART 2: Model Programmes

Assignments for the groups

H 7.1. Benefits of public participation in decision-making

What benefits do various groups receive from public participation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits for public authorities that make decisions</th>
<th>Benefits for businesses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

c/ After all groups have spoken on this subject, invite another group to read the benefits for businesses. Write the results on a flip-chart entitled ‘Benefits for businesses of public participation’, and add to the list with the help of the other groups. Present to the participants the additional benefits listed in the handout material ‘Answers’ and ask if they may also be added to this list. Having received the group’s consent, add your suggestions.

d/ Together also fill out the flip-chart entitled ‘Benefits for NGOs and citizens of public participation’. Present to the participants the additional advantages that are listed in the handout material ‘Answers’ and ask if they may also be added to this list. Having received the group’s consent, add your suggestions.

4. Make a summary of the exercise, bringing the participants’ attention to the number of benefits that public participation provides the various groups, and distribute to the participants the handout material H 7.2. ‘Answers: Benefits of public participation’.

---

Environmental Information, Education and Public Awareness
EuropeAid 02-0114 — Implemented by Royal Haskoning and REC
## H 7.2. Benefits of public participation

Public participation is beneficial for:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NGOs/citizens, because:</th>
<th>Businesses, because:</th>
<th>Public authorities that make decisions, because:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• It gives the citizens an opportunity to influence the process of decision-making related to issues of the environment;</td>
<td>• It increases awareness regarding the influence of industrial activities on the environment and human health;</td>
<td>• Better quality decisions are made based on larger amounts of information, taking into account more various opinions and ideas, as well as information regarding environmental conditions received immediately from the members of a community;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• It gives the citizens an opportunity to acquire knowledge about environmental risks and impacts that they themselves, their families and their communities are subject to;</td>
<td>• It discovers the ineffective parts in industrial processes, the use of raw materials and consumption of energy; the work aimed at increasing the effectiveness of the use of raw materials and energy leads to a reduction of production expenditures and to elimination of the need to install expensive equipment to control and clean industrial waste products;</td>
<td>• It increases the awareness of the public regarding projects and adopted decisions, creating the conditions necessary for the functioning of a democratic system and trust in public authorities;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• It increases public awareness regarding the work related to decision making; who makes a decision, on what basis it helps the citizens participate in the process of decision-making in the future and contributes to the development of participatory democracy);</td>
<td>• It enhances understanding the needs of customers, and allows for improved marketing of products;</td>
<td>• It supplements governmental resources, which are not very large, for monitoring the implementation of legislation; and helps save time and money because citizens work as the 'eyes' and 'ears' of the government;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• It increases the purposefulness of the social actions of citizens, their social responsibility and solidarity;</td>
<td>• It increases access to the process of adopting governmental decisions that immediately influence businesses by legal and other instruments;</td>
<td>• It strengthens the positions of the Ministry of the Environment in relation to other public authorities and ministries by means of public support for the point of view of the Ministry of the Environment; it brings the attention of the government to issues of the environment;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• It contributes to the development of a feeling of confidence in the achievement of a positive effect and the possibility of influencing specific conditions in their community/country;</td>
<td>• It reduces the possibility of conflicts and legal suits brought by the public caused by different understandings of a situation;</td>
<td>• It dissolves conflicts, softens opposition, allows the development of environmental programmes based on consensus;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• It guarantees the possibility of considering local conditions and experience when developing and implementing a decision that has been made.</td>
<td>• It reduces the probability of delays in implementing a project and the possibility of increasing expenditures, because the opinion of local inhabitants at an early stage of the project’s planning have been taken into account;</td>
<td>• It saves resources and time at an early stage, allows preventing unforeseen changes in the future when financial decisions are taken and money is spent;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• It raises trust and increases solvency, showing financial structures that procedures and recommendations of public participation required by the law have been observed;</td>
<td>• It creates an opportunity for developing creative decisions that take into account local conditions;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>• It creates an opportunity for developing creative decisions that take local conditions into account;</td>
<td>• It contributes to establishing partnerships and trust relationships with local authorities, consumers, the public, NGOs and mass media.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
7.4. Exercise: Reasons for ineffective public participation in decision-making

Time: 35 minutes

Expected results
After completing this exercise participants will be able to:

- Understand what arguments can be made against public participation in decision-making, and to present to opponents well-grounded counter-arguments on this subject;
- Determine the reasons for ineffective participation.

Necessary materials
Working sheets to be filled out: H 7.3. ‘Negative opinions regarding public participation in decision-making’, a flip-chart or a whiteboard and markers.

How to organise the work
1. Sometimes people, in particular, public officials, speak negatively on the issue of public participation. Ask the participants to determine whether they share this opinion or not, and why. Pass out to every participant a working sheet ‘Negative opinions regarding public participation in decision-making’ (H 7.3.).

2. Explain the assignment to the groups.

During the next 10-15 minutes each participant must read the statements that are presented on the working sheet and determine his or her position (‘I agree’ or ‘I disagree’) and come up with 2-3 arguments in support of their position.

3. Prepare a whiteboard or a flip-chart to record the discussion, splitting it in two in the following way:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. of the statement</th>
<th>Arguments ‘in favour’</th>
<th>Arguments ‘against’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. After all the participants have decided their positions and have filled out their working sheets, hold a discussion using the following plan:

a/ Read the first statement and ask those participants who agree to raise their hands. Ask several participants to present arguments supporting their choice and write their statements in the column ‘Arguments “in favour”’. After this invite several participants who disagree with the statement to present their arguments and write them in the column ‘Arguments “against”’.

b/ In the same way study all the quotations that have been written.

5. After filling out the table, reflect on the following questions:

- What conclusion can be drawn from this exercise?
- If there are that many arguments against public participation in decision-making, is it worth involving it?
- What can be the reasons for ineffective public participation?

When concluding the discussion, emphasise that the use of correct mechanisms of public participation can significantly increase the effectiveness of participation and the quality of decisions that are being made.
H 7.3. Negative opinions regarding public participation in decision-making

Presented below are widespread negative opinions regarding public participation. Do you agree with them? Explain why.

1. Public participation is not effective.
   It contradicts the principles of effective management. The process of decision-making with participation of fewer people would be more effective.
   - I agree  [ ] I disagree [ ]
   Why?

2. Participation is a waste of precious time.
   - I agree  [ ] I disagree [ ]
   Why?

3. Public participation costs a lot and is a waste of already limited resources.
   Participation requires expenses, for example, for the salaries of staff, for printing, mass media, etc. These resources can be more effectively spent on other activities.
   - I agree  [ ] I disagree [ ]
   Why?

4. Public participation does not bring concrete results.
   Getting the public involved is a complex task that requires proper distribution of time and other resources. It brings insignificant results, or none at all. It allows the people to feel comfortable, but does not bring economic benefits.
   - I agree  [ ] I disagree [ ]
   Why?

5. Public participation leads to the appearance of ungrounded expectations.
   - I agree  [ ] I disagree [ ]
   Why?

6. The process of decision-making that incorporates public participation is not rational!
   The process of decision-making should rest upon concrete and factual information collected by highly educated and well-informed experts. Public participation is not rational because it is based on consensus, on personal problems and priorities, rather than on the results of scientific research.
   - I agree  [ ] I disagree [ ]
   Why?

7. Participation in decision-making is only accessible by the elite.
   Public participation is the concept of the elite, an idea only for rich and powerful citizens. It is inaccessible for ordinary people.
   - I agree  [ ] I disagree [ ]
   Why?

8. Public participation contradicts the interests of corrupt public officials, whose resistance makes it impossible.
   - I agree  [ ] I disagree [ ]
   Why?
7.5. Interactive lecture: Main principles of public participation

**Time:** 15 minutes

**Plan of the lecture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>General principles of public participation</th>
<th>Slides 7.11-7.18</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2/</td>
<td>Concluding part: reinforcing knowledge of the 8 main principles of public participation</td>
<td>Slide 7.19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1) The public is involved at an early stage, when there is a possibility to influence the decision to be made, which means at the stage of preparation of the draft decision.

2) A reasonable time frame is set up for public participation.

3) Providing effective information for the public regarding the opportunities of its participation.

4) The public is provided with background information.

5) The accessibility of all information used during the process of decision-making is ensured.

6) An opportunity to submit remarks and suggestions is provided.

7) The development of decisions is made taking into account remarks and suggestions that have been expressed.

8) The public is provided with information about the final decision and how it can be appealed.

Make a summary of the lecture by asking the participants to reproduce the principles of effective public participation, the implementation of which is required by the Aarhus Convention. Use the interactive Slide 7.19. When the participants correctly reproduce a principle, the trainer points at the figure that illustrates it.
7.6. Conclusion

Time: 5 minutes

How to organise the work

To summarize the session, carry out a discussion with the participants in a large circle on the following questions:

- What is an effective decision?
- Why is public participation necessary?
- What sort of decisions, according to the Aarhus Convention, should be made with public participation required?

If you don’t have time for the discussion, briefly repeat the main points of the session yourself. Definitely make a transition to the next session by emphasising what its aim will be.

practical advice

Adapt the session

If the definitions for ‘the public’ and ‘public concerned’ have already been discussed in the other sessions, skip the discussion of these terms by simply reminding the participants of the definitions with the help of Slides 7.2 and 7.3.

Slide 7.9 adjust the contents of the slide and make additions to it based on the national legislation of your country that regulates public participation.

Use the following handout materials

- The text of the Aarhus Convention
- The quotations from the text of the national legislation of your country that is related to the provision of public participation in decision-making
- Slides for the lecture
- Handout materials for the exercises should be distributed in advance. The handout materials that contain the answers should only be given to the participants after the corresponding exercise is completed

Encourage the participants

When using the summary Slide 7.19 you can encourage the participants by giving a small award to the most active participant who answered the most questions. This can be, for example, a notebook, or a box of chocolates.

Other methods can also be used to achieve similar goals

Use the ‘brainstorming’ method or the one called ‘four corners’ to determine the benefits of public participation.
Methods of public participation* (Session 8)

Time: 80 minutes

Expected results
After completing this session the participants will be able to:

- Identify the different methods of public participation and explain their particular features: meetings with key people, questionnaires, public opinion polls, focus groups, meetings of the public, methods to solve problems, etc.;
- Determine the level of involvement of the public when using different methods;
- Discuss what methods can be used for different types of decisions.

Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8.1.</td>
<td>Introduction: Examples of decisions made with public participation and the methods used in these cases — a study of the experience of the participants</td>
<td>Individual work, work in a larger group, brainstorming, ranking Brief information from the trainer. Slide 8.1</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2.</td>
<td>Levels of public participation</td>
<td>Lecture, discussion</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3.</td>
<td>Methods of public participation</td>
<td>Work with the text using the Mosaic method or a lecture</td>
<td>40 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4.</td>
<td>Conclusion: Levels of public participation, methods of public participation and types of ‘environmentally important’ decisions</td>
<td>Discussion in a larger group</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

8.1. Introduction: Examples of decisions made with public participation and the methods used in these cases — a study of the experience of the participants

Time: 20 minutes

Expected results
After completing this exercise the participants will be able to:

- Provide examples of decisions that were made with public participation based on their own personal experience;
- Identify various methods of public participation.

Necessary materials
Flip-chart or a whiteboard, markers and three colours of post-it® notes.

How to organise the work
1. Ask the participants to think and write in their own notebooks the following (within 2 minutes):
   - 2-3 examples of solutions made in your organisation with the public involved.
2. Ask them to determine independently the following (within 2 minutes):
   - Their own examples belong to which of the main types of decisions:

* This session reviews the main methods of public participation that can be applied for all types of decisions: related to specific activities, plans and programmes, the development of legislation. We recommend adapting this session as a way to review the mechanisms of public participation necessary for a specific decision to which the training is dedicated.
1) decisions related to specific types of activities;
2) decisions regarding the development of strategic plans and programs;
3) decisions related to the development of legal acts, which can cause a significant impact on the environment when applied?

3. Draw a table on a flip-chart, as shown below, and ask everyone to describe their own decisions. As the participants express their ideas, write their examples in the corresponding columns (within 10 minutes). Leave the third column empty for the time being.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of decision</th>
<th>Examples</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Decisions related to specific types of activities</td>
<td>Construction of a pipeline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Construction of an Embassy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decisions regarding the development of strategic plans and programs related to the environment</td>
<td>Plan for the privatisation of forests</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Report on the condition of the environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decisions related to the development of legal acts, which can cause a significant impact on the environment when applied</td>
<td>Law on privatisation of agricultural lands currently under governmental use</td>
<td>Legal act on the protection of recreational waters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. After all the participants have expressed themselves, conduct a brainstorming session (5 minutes) on the following question:

? What methods of public participation have you used when making these decisions?

5. Write everything that is being said on a separate sheet of paper.

6. Ask the participants:

? What other methods of public participation exist there?

Draw up a detailed list of the main methods of public participation.

training tips

The main methods of public participation include: press releases, briefings, written comments on draft documents, referenda, focus groups, meetings with key people, days of ‘open doors’, working groups, gatherings of the public, public opinion polls, public hearings, consultative and working groups, public stands/exhibitions, negotiations, etc.

7. After completing the brainstorming session hand out the three-coloured post-it® notes to the participants. Explain that each colour represents the methods that can be used when making certain decisions. For instance,

- Green — a method of public participation used for decision-making related to certain types of activities,
- Yellow — a method of public participation used for decision-making related to the development of plans and programmes,
- Blue — a method for public participation used for decision-making related to the development of legal documents.

Invite the participants to stick their colour papers next to the methods that can be used at the time of decision-making according to their colour (3 minutes).

Comment on the text that appeared in the third column of the table.

8. After completing this active exercise thank the participants for their work and make a summary, emphasising that similar methods can be used for various types of decisions, and suggest examining them more closely in this session.

Present the expected results of this session with the help of Slide 8.1 and familiarise the participants with the plan of the session (2 minutes).
8.2. Interactive lecture: Levels of public participation

Time: 90 minutes

Plan of the lecture

1/ Levels of public participation

Emphasise that the level of public involvement depends on a range of factors:

- Expected result;
- Scale;
- How many people and whom, specifically, the process will concern;
- Will the result ensure the settlement of the issues on a national, regional or local level.

Depending on the combination of these factors, the following levels of public participation are distinguished:

Certain methods correspond to each level of public participation. Let us examine some of them in greater detail.
8.3. Exercise: Methods of public participation

Time: 45 minutes

Expected results
After completing this exercise the participants will be able to:
• Explain how different methods of public participation are used;
• Determine the levels of public participation and the methods that correspond to them;
• Determine the methods of public participation that can be effectively used at the various stages of decision-making.

Necessary materials

How to organise the work
To work with the texts use the Mosaic method.
1. Arrange the participants into four groups of five persons each.
   Present the assignments for the groups:
   - Within 5 minutes read individually the text with the description of the several methods of public participation in decision-making. Within 10 minutes discuss in the group to what level or levels of public participation the presented methods belong*; what is the main idea of the method; what has to be remembered when using these methods.
   Prepare to present this material individually to the other participants.

   2. Distribute to the groups the assignments and the texts containing descriptions of the methods (H 8.1).

H 8.1. Methods and techniques of public participation

Group 1. Assignment
Within 5 minutes read individually texts 1 and 2 describing several methods of public participation in decision-making. Discuss in the group, to what level or levels of public participation do the presented methods belong; what is the main idea of the methods; what has to be remembered when using these methods.
Prepare to present this material individually to the other participants.

Text 1*: Referendum

A referendum — is a way for citizens to participate in the process of decision-making by putting to a vote the draft laws and other decisions that have a large significance nationwide or locally.

What can be decided in this manner?
A national referendum can adopt decisions related to:
• The Constitution and amendments to it;
• The adoption of laws or amendments to the laws;
• Other issues in the competence of the state.

A local or a regional referendum can adopt decisions related to
• Issues in the competence of the regional or local authorities.

* Some methods can belong to different levels of public participation, for instance, working groups can be used to receive feedback and for consultations and development of a mutual decision.
** It is necessary to adapt text 1 according to the national legislation of your country.
Who may convene referendum?

For a national referendum:
- The President of the country.
- A certain number of members of the electorate (for instance in Belarus — 450,000, in Moldova — 100,000), representing a certain number of regions of the country.
- A certain number of members of Parliament (usually 1/3 or 1/2).

For a local/regional referendum:
- A local/regional authorities.
- A local/regional council.
- A certain percent (usually 10 per cent) of the local electorate.

How can the public convene a referendum?

The public can use to main methods of initiating a referendum:
- Through the Parliament — by using their Member of Parliament or their political party.
- By collecting the signatures of a necessary number of members of the electorate.

Who pays for conducting a referendum?

- From the moment of its initiation (if initiated by the public — from the moment when the necessary number of signatures has been submitted) all expenses are covered from the state or local budget.

Decisions made at a referendum are final and have the highest legal force.

Advantages:
- The results are legally qualified and final: it is the only process of decision-making when public opinion has a mandatory character.
- The process of decision-making is quite independent in character.
- Often this is the only way to directly influence the process of decision-making.
- Decisions adopted at a referendum usually enjoy greater universal support than those that were adopted by the authorities alone.

Limitations:
- It is difficult to convene a referendum at the initiative of the public — an initiative group is necessary, as well as permission to conduct such activities, financial and staff resources, etc.
- Often, as with the elections, the system of voting can be manipulated.
- Referendum, as a rule, require significant financing.
- Possibly the economic benefit that can be received today will be considered more important than the harmful environmental consequences in the future.

Referendum on issues related to the environment

Putting issues related to the environment to a referendum is particularly provided for by the legislation of a few countries. But such questions increasingly more often become the subject of a referendum vote. For example, in Russia the issue of burying on its territory nuclear waste products brought from abroad was put to a referendum, in Denmark and Sweden — the issue of constructing a bridge over the channel, which involved unwanted environmental consequences. Experience also shows that local issues related to the protection of the environment can be solved with the help of a referendum.

In Hungary, legislation on referenda provides that issues related to the environment be considered. Local referendum do not occur every day, but they are also nothing exceptional. One of the recent causes for convening a referendum was an issue regarding the location of a future depository of low-radioactive waste products of a nuclear power plant. The public authority proposed several variants for locating the depository. The inhabitants of the first region from among those suggested by the authorities convened a referendum and turned down this proposal. The same occurred with regard to the second location. And, finally, in the third suggested region, the inhabitants voted for the depository, but they succeeded in agreeing with the government regarding economic privileges and very strict safety measures.
Text 2. Consulting and working groups

To solve a specific task (for example, when a preliminary plan for the construction of buildings on the territory of a residential area is being developed, or when a project is being assessed for its environmental safety) the public authority or the investor may create working groups or committees, where representatives of the local inhabitants of the other stakeholders can become members. They may be comprised of the people who represent the opinion of a certain target group, or of experts in the field concerning the problem to be solved or to which the project belongs. Members of the working groups should produce corresponding comments and consult the developers of the decision (public authorities).

Such groups may be organised through public initiative, work for either a short period or for quite a long one, depending on the problems to be solved.

The main stages of work of consulting and working groups are:

- Defining clear and realistic goals that a group should reach. In what way will its point of view later be taken into account by public authorities?
- Identifying a way that can help a group to be created: a local community can offer several nominees to representatives of the authorities, or conduct an election of members of the working groups based on the fact that they should have sufficient information regarding this community and represent a broad spectrum of the needs and interests of the entire population.
- Hold regular meetings of the working group with representatives of the authorities with the goal of systematically receiving the relevant information and necessary consultations.

Advantages:

- A working group can provide help in organising and coordinating public involvement in the development of a decision, or in receiving information from a broad circle of stakeholders on issues on a local and broader scale.
- Groups can be especially useful in the process of developing an action plan in one or another region involving the consideration of complex issues related to various groups of local inhabitants.
- The groups facilitate support of regular contacts between local inhabitants and an investor, stimulating the exchange of information for the consideration of alternative variants, as well as the holding of negotiations on solving problems and reaching a consensus.

Limitations:

- The main difficulty when creating working groups is the selection of participants — they should represent a broad spectrum of opinions but be prepared to work together. It is necessary to clearly realise the possibility that conflicts may arise.
- Representative(s) of a public authority or an investor should continuously participate in the work of a group and facilitate it so that the group focuses on implementing key issues.

Group 2. Assignment

Within 5 minutes read individually texts 1 and 2 describing several methods of public participation in decision-making. Discuss in the group to what level or levels of public participation do the presented methods belong; what is the main idea of the methods; what has to be remembered when using these methods. Prepare to present this material individually to the other participants.

Text 1. Public meetings: public hearings

Public hearing — is an official public meeting, usually connected with a procedure defined by legislation, for example:

- A presentation of the results of an environmental impact assessment of the proposed activities.
- Informing the public about the plans of an investor, an application submitted to a competent authority in order to receive permission.
- Informing the public regarding the development or adoption by a public authority of plans, programmes, legal acts related to the environment.

A public hearing provides an opportunity to conduct an official presentation of a decision before the public concerned, and provide the public with the possibility to comment, ask questions, demonstrate their attitude toward an issue being considered. Apart from the representatives of the groups of public concerned, experts can also be invited to the public hearing to present specific information on a problem.

If there is a law or another legal act that regulates the procedure of public hearings, adapt the text accordingly.

The procedure of public hearings includes: an official introduction of invited speakers, general discussion of the issue, answers from speakers to the questions of those present, comments of invited experts and the representatives of the public.
As a rule, the public authority responsible for holding a public hearing develops an agenda, invites people and appoints a chairperson who leads the meeting. If necessary, a neutral representative can be the chairperson. It is advisable to make a protocol or a stenograph of the hearing.

Participants, apart from the statements they make, often submit documents in written form. To consider applications from the public, a group is created comprised of representatives of the public authorities and the chairperson.

Public hearings can take the form of:

• **Inception hearings**: this is a useful method for collecting information that can be used to develop a project. At such hearings the planning authority has the opportunity to convey to the public the principal information regarding the goals and the possible consequences of a forthcoming project or decision.

• **Hearings-consultations**: these are held when there are no alternative variants for a solution, and allow the public to present developers or a public authority the necessary information on issues that raise concern. The organisers of a hearing should provide in advance background materials to the interested groups of the public.

• **Hearings-decision-making**: these are held immediately prior to decision-making regarding issuing a permission to the developers of a project to implement it, or when a strategy of development or programme, etc., is being developed. A public authority should initiate such a hearing if there is still a conflict of interests between the public and the developers prior to the moment of decision-making.

In this way, public hearings are not meetings for making a decision. Their goal is to examine an issue and develop the ideas that will be considered at further stages in the process of public participation.

**Advantages:**

• Holding a presentation in the presence of various people can immediately determine their attitude toward the ideas being presented.

• Public hearings can facilitate discussion between different groups of the public holding different interests.

• Quite a large number of people can be informed regarding later steps and final decisions regarding a project, it is possible to tell them directly, how their earlier expressed comments had been taken into consideration.

**Limitations:**

• The public hearing — is not the best way to achieve a compromise between groups and make a decision.

• When those who are present set the questions, and in the discussion that follows, individual people/groups may dominate. This may result in others not having time to express their opinions, and in the discussion deviating from consideration of the main questions.

• A meeting can lead to a rise in confrontation between individual groups and representatives of public authorities, or between different groups of the population.

When organising a public hearing it is necessary to:

**Determine the people** — they will have to be invited in written or verbal form, or in another way informing them about the procedure for participating in a public hearing.

**Select a suitable venue for the meeting**, for example, a school, library, a hall of a city administration building, or a hotel, depending on the preferences of the target group. It is necessary to make alternative provisions if less people come to the meeting than planned.

**Select a good chairperson with excellent communication skills**, because he or she plays an extraordinarily important role for the success of the meeting. He or she may be someone from among the organisers of the hearing, or a neutral person. A successful move would be to invite local inhabitants who are held in respect.

**Determine the goals and the desirable results**, develop an agenda of the hearing, which should include: an introduction, a presentation of the problem or a solution, a discussion, as well as summarise the results of the meeting (conducted by a chairperson).

When summarising the results, it is necessary to point out what the next steps of public participation in decision-making will be.

**Prepare the necessary materials** for dissemination among the participants of the hearing.

**Holding a meeting**. Before the start of the hearing it is necessary to pay attention to the following details: availability of a sufficient number of tables and chairs, badges or name-plates for the speakers, the proper functioning of audio-video equipment, as well as microphones, the availability of drinks, a sufficient number of copies of the programme and background documents. It is also necessary to prepare a list of participants, stating the names of the organisations that they represent and maintaining a protocol (stenograph) of the hearing.

**Text 2. Day of open doors**

The developers of a project or a public authority invite representatives of the public and other stakeholders to visit a certain place (a construction site, or a facility), to familiarise them with the proposal and provide feedback.
Advantages:
- This is an effective way of informing the public and other stakeholders. People can come at their own convenience to look through the documents and ask questions.

Limitations:
- The preparation and staffing of a day of open doors may require quite a lot of time.

Text 1. Meetings with important people

In this case ‘important’ people are those people who can have a significant influence on public opinion in the region, or who can present important information or useful ideas about possibilities and ways of making a project a reality, who has the authority to facilitate or hinder decision-making, etc.

Official or unofficial meetings with such people are an important component of any public participation programme. Immediately after defining the target groups it is necessary to hold interviews with them, because information regarding their readiness to take part should be considered at the time of preparing a public participation plan.

An interview is an effective and quick way to find out opinions of stakeholders, the main issues of concern, and ideas on how to make a project a reality. It is necessary to hold interviews with organisations and with private persons holding different opinions, and not only with those who support the project.

It is important to know:
- Prior to the beginning of an interview the person who will be interviewed should be provided with information regarding the planning process and given explanations regarding the significance of his or her opinion for the development of the decision.
- An interview should be conducted by an experienced person with relevant qualifications and is sufficiently familiar with the project.
- The person asking questions should have listening skills and should manifest an interest toward the subject.
- After conducting the interview, the person who was interviewed should regularly receive information regarding the process of implementing a project, making proposals about future cooperation (conducting public meetings, etc.).
- Information received during an interview can be considered confidential, or made public on the agreement of both sides.

It is necessary to clarify during the interview:
- Do the people see the planned activities as a threat to their everyday life, health, public well-being or, for example, the economic growth of the region?
- What problems and possibilities are envisaged during the planned activities at the local level?
- What is the degree of participation of the various stakeholders in the decision-making process; are they interested in cooperation, and if so, in what form?
- Do the mass media cover the activities comprehensively and at the proper level? Is there a belief that the mass media are so strong that they can change the way things are?
- How many of the local inhabitants think that they will be immediately affected by these activities?

Text 2. Negotiations

Negotiations — is a voluntary activity, during which all conflicting sides agree to sit at a table and try to eliminate the discrepancies between their positions. Negotiations are only possible when the representatives of various conflicting sides think that they can come to a decision acceptable to all of them. The sides agree on the schedule, inform each other about their interests, suggest alternatives and evaluate acceptable variants. Successful negotiations are concluded by reaching an agreement that all sides are ready to implement. Usually this depends on the skills and qualifications of the sides involved.

The main principles of conducting negotiations are:
- Decisions are adopted by way of reaching a consensus.
- When representatives are appointed, it is assumed that their mandate allows them to present, after completing negotiations, decisions to their organisations for approval.
Sometimes it is necessary to appoint a neutral facilitator to preside over negotiations, not a stakeholder, thus providing an opportunity for making things easier. A mediator not only facilitates a discussion, but is a central link between the sides in the negotiations. A good mediator can help explain to the groups the positions of the other sides, free them from stereotypes and determine the common features.

Conducting negotiations with the assistance of a mediator can lead to a fast solution to the issues that would otherwise take longer due to political processes of other political measures. Nonetheless, a mediator has limited possibilities in this situation. He or she can influence the process of negotiations only if the sides are convinced that they will benefit from conducting negotiations more than they will from confrontation.

Advantages:

- When applying this approach, the responsibility for finding a decision that would be acceptable for everyone lies on each of the sides.
- There is a great probability that agreements reached through negotiations will be real and become implemented.
- The participation of a mediator can lead to an agreement that would be supported by all the conflicting sides.

Limitations:

- Stakeholders should be prepared and able to work conscientiously.
- Reaching an agreement through negotiations can be a prolonged process that involves delays; it is advisable not to use this method if time is limited.
- Negotiations carried out with the assistance of a mediator (facilitator) are a voluntary activity. They only produce results if all sides are ready for the negotiations.

Text 1. Questionnaires

Questionnaires are used to find out the attitudes and spirits of the public, determine the point of view of the inhabitants of a region based on questioning a selected group of people. Questions can be asked by telephone, through a website (primarily when people want to preserve their anonymity), by sending out letters, carrying out interviews with one person or a small group of people.

The best results can be achieved by conducting individual interviews or in small groups. If questionnaires are sent out in the form of letters, you can only count on receiving responses to 10 per cent of the letters.

The main stages that precede the use of questionnaires to determine public opinion are the following:

- Decide how you will use the information, will you apply it in the process of decision-making, or when making a project a reality.
- Check whether other organisations collect or have been collecting similar information.
- Check whether or not you need permission to send out the questionnaires. If yes, then you will need to allocate additional time to receive the permission.

Draft questionnaires should be developed by a person with corresponding experience and qualifications to guarantee:

- The quality selection of people to be interviewed/questioned.
- The quality selection of questions.
- The comprehensiveness of the questions to be asked.

If there are no such people in your organisation, you should involve a person who works in an organisation that deals with marketing research.

Before asking a large number of people a question, it should be tried with a group of local citizens to ensure that the question is understood correctly.

For the results of the analysis to be trusted, at least 100 answers should be received in each of the categories. The analysis should be conducted using various statistical methods.

Text 2. Public opinion polls

Public opinion polls are yet another method for determining public opinion. They should be conducted by specially prepared people — asking the same questions in the same order during all of interviews. A poll can be taken in person or by telephone. Printed questionnaires are usually filled out by the person who is being questioned, while during a public opinion poll, answers are usually recorded by the person who asks the questions.

Questions should be clear, unbiased and formulated in such a way that the answers to them will contain all the necessary information.
There are standards that determine the number of people (at least 100) who should be questioned in order to ensure a certain degree of reliability of the results. The reliability of results can also be increased by increasing the number of respondents.

To draft a good questionnaire, experience and skills in the field of conducting marketing research is necessary. A questionnaire should not be very long. It is appropriate to provide a section inside the questionnaire where the respondents can offer their point of view regarding a project. It is necessary to take into consideration that:

- Questions should be formulated as ‘open questions’ (which do not imply simple answers such as ‘yes’, ‘no’ and ‘don’t know’). For example, ‘What do you think about the following alternatives?’;
- Questions concerning quantitative assessments should be avoided, since people do not like to answer such questions and as a result do not fill out a questionnaire completely;
- Participants of a poll should be told that this is just one of the possibilities for public participation (in addition to writing letters or attending meetings).

**Advantages:**

- It is possible to gather information from persons who will not attend public meetings or participate in another form. Confidential polls can provide the most honest answers. It can be determined what is already clear and what concerns there are.
- It is possible to learn the opinion of the silent majority.
- Results of polls can be measured with the help of quantitative indicators, examined statistically, and used later during decision-making on issues that cause disagreement.

**Limitations:**

- Answers can be incomplete and can reflect only the opinion that exists at a given moment.
- The group of people that have been questioned can turn out not to be representative (for example, an insufficient number of representatives of the public have been questioned, or all of them represented just one of the stakeholders).
- The development and conduct of good research or a poll can require a lot of financial resources and consume a lot of time.
- To prepare questionnaires special experience is required.
- Organising statistically reliable polls becomes expensive if an organisation does not have the qualified personnel and it is necessary to invite specialists.

**Text 3. Focus groups**

A focus group is a free discussion of a specific project or a decision in small groups (4-10 people). They are used in the majority of situations when it is necessary to learn the attitude of the public toward a discussed issue. For example, it is possible to conduct an entire series of focus groups to predict the reaction of a local population to a proposed project or proposal, and, if possible, correct it or abandon it.

Focus groups can be comprised of randomly selected persons that belong to the same target group (for instance, farmers, fire fighters, workers) or of the representatives of various target groups.

The work of such group is lead by a moderator. He or she has experience and special skills, stimulates people to express themselves, give comments, and manifest a lively reaction. One and the same moderator can direct the work of all groups, and then prepare a report with a summary: what has been said by the various sides?

**Advantages:**

- A quick method for determining the general reaction of the population to a proposal.
- Focus groups cannot reflect the opinions of all citizens of a region to a proposed decision, but are nevertheless not very expensive and a quick way to come to a preliminary evaluation of the reaction of a broad public.
- They can also help establish a connection with marginal groups and groups that do not make themselves readily heard.

**Limitations:**

- As a consequence of selection, some stakeholders in a local community can be left underrepresented among the participants.
- Groups should be rendered assistance and serviced, and this consumes a lot of time.
- A moderator must be very well qualified to ‘fish out’ the important comments. It is quite possible that it will be necessary to invite a consultant from outside.
- Focus groups help predict a reaction, but they do not substitute a discussion with the participation of all stakeholders.

3. After the groups finish studying the texts, ask the participants to rearrange into new groups. Create five groups of four participants each in such a way that each group has participants who worked on different texts.

4. Present the new assignment to these groups. Allocate 20 minutes for the work of the groups.
Assignments for the groups

Give the floor to each of the participants to present, taking turns, within 3 minutes information regarding methods of public participation in decision-making that he or she has studied.

The presentation from the participants should be built according to the following plan: the main idea of a method; the recommendations on the use of the method; the level or levels of participation.

After all participants present their methods, discuss which of them can be used at the various stages of development and adoption of decisions. To do this, ask the participants to fill out a chart in the handout material H 8.2.

H 8.2. Methods of public participation and the stages of decision-making

Write the methods of public participation that can be used at each of the presented stages of decision-making. Indicate the level of public participation that corresponds to each of the methods (5 minutes).

Choose a presenter who will report the results of the work at a plenary session.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stages of decision-making</th>
<th>Methods of public participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Before making a decision regarding issuing a permission: development of a plan, a programme or a policy by the government</td>
<td>Meetings with important people, inception hearings, public opinion polls, questionnaires, focus-groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>During the preliminary work: collecting alternatives</td>
<td>Meetings with important people, days of open doors, consulting groups, consultation public hearings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At the time of development of a final decision: working through the alternatives</td>
<td>Negotiations, consulting groups, public hearings, referendum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After the final decision is made</td>
<td>Public meetings with the aim of informing the public</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. After the work is completed, ask several groups to present their results, and the remaining few groups — to add to them or comment on them. Allocate 10 minutes for this work.

Training tips

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stages of decision-making</th>
<th>Methods of public participation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Before making a decision regarding issuing permission; development of a plan, a programme or a policy by the government</td>
<td>Meetings with important people, inception hearings, public opinion polls, questionnaires, focus-groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>During the preliminary work: collecting ideas that allow consideration of the alternative variants of decisions</td>
<td>Meetings with important people, days of open doors, consulting groups, consultation public hearings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When a final decision is being developed: working through the alternatives</td>
<td>Negotiations, consulting groups, public hearings, referendum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After the final decision is made</td>
<td>Public meetings with the aim of informing the public</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8.4. Conclusion

**Time: 10 minutes**

**How to organise the work**

To summarise the results of the session, hold a discussion with the participants in a large circle, focusing on the following questions:

- What principles of public participation do the methods discussed during the session correspond to?
- Why did we use for our work today such a Mosaic method?

Bring the attention of the participants to the fact that the Mosaic method is an illustration of work of focus groups or consultative groups where all the participants have different information and viewpoints, but as a result of the completed work they can draw up a complete picture and a multi-aspect point of view on the discussed issue.

- What was easy for you in the time of work in the groups, and what was difficult?
- What have you learned that’s new during this session? What have you learned?

Conclude the session by showing Slide 8.3, which illustrates the relevance of methods of public participation in the degree of involvement. Emphasise that in this session only a part of the methods have been discussed. There also exist methods of informing the public, which lay the foundation for use of all the other methods, and which will be discussed in the next session. They also differ depending on the targeted group of the public, and on the goals of the public authority that is responsible for the decision-making.

![Slide 8.3. Levels and methods of public participation](image-url)
Developing and delivering trainings for Officials: A Manual for Trainers

PART 2: Model Programmes

Methods to inform the public, ensuring effective public participation (Session 9)

Time: 90 minutes

Expected results

After completing this session the participants will be able to:

- Identify the main requirements of the Convention regarding informing the public to ensure its effective public participation in the process of decision-making;
- Clarify what background information, and how it should be provided to the public;
- Discuss the effectiveness of using various methods to inform the public;
- Determine what methods can be used to inform the public at the early stages of decision-making.

Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Brief formation from the trainer Slide 9.1</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>Requirements of the Convention regarding informing the public to ensure its effective public participation in the process of decision-making</td>
<td>Interactive lecture, short discussion Slides 9.2-9.8</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>Ways to inform</td>
<td>Group discussion Brainstorming</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>Effective information campaign</td>
<td>Interactive lecture with slides Slides 9.9-9.21 Work with text Work in small groups</td>
<td>55 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a large group</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9.1. Introduction*

Time: 5 minutes

Emphasise that there are various methods of public participation, among which information methods occupy an important place. Go back to the results of Session 8 ‘Methods of public participation’. Show Slide 8.2 and ask the participants to identify all methods related to informing the public. Write them separately on a large sheet of paper. Since the effectiveness of other methods depends on the quality of informing, ask the participants to have a more detailed look at these methods. Present the goals of the session (Slide 9.1) and its plan.


Effective communication of Environmental Information [http://www.grida.no/enrin/proceedings.cfm?article=18]
Slide 9.1. Expected results

After completing this session the participants will be able to:
- Identify the main requirements of the Convention regarding informing the public to ensure its effective public participation in the process of decision-making;
- Clarify what background information, and how it should be provided to the public;
- Discuss the effectiveness of using various methods to inform the public to ensure the effectiveness of public participation;
- Determine what methods can be used to inform the public at the early stages of decision-making.

9.2. Interactive lecture: Requirements of the Convention regarding informing the public to ensure its effective participation in the process of decision-making

⏰ Time: 15 minutes

📜 Plan of the lecture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1/</td>
<td>Why are information systems necessary? Slide 9.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/</td>
<td>Repeating the main principles of public participation Slides 9.3, 9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3/</td>
<td>Information systems for public participation: main concepts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(background information, informing in a relevant way) Slides 9.5-9.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Begin the lecture by presenting the concept of information systems, types, channels and goals for distributing information, as presented on Slide 9.2.

Slide 9.2. Why do information systems exist?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information produced</th>
<th>Communicated through</th>
<th>Forms opinions and attitude</th>
<th>With the goal of contributing to the creation of environmentally competent</th>
<th>Leading to</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>data</td>
<td>shops</td>
<td>of decision makers</td>
<td>laws</td>
<td>decreasing of impact on environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>statistics</td>
<td>libraries</td>
<td>of legislators</td>
<td>policy</td>
<td>and enhancing its condition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>graphs</td>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>of businessmen</td>
<td>values</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reports</td>
<td>mass media</td>
<td>of the electorate</td>
<td>organizations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>books</td>
<td>schools</td>
<td>of ‘builders of the future’</td>
<td>investments</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>web-pages</td>
<td>analytical centres</td>
<td></td>
<td>system of production and consumption</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ask the participants to have a look at the requirements of the Convention regarding informing the public with the goal of participating in decision-making, taking into account the information from this slide.

First, ask the participants to name the eight main principles of public participation. Make a summary of this conversation with the help of Slide 9.3. Bring the participants attention to the fact that on the slide the principles related to informing are highlighted. Besides this, the Convention establishes mandatory, timely and effective notification: Slide 9.4.

An information system for effective public participation can look the way it is demonstrated on Slide 9.5:

---

**Slide 9.3. Principles of public participation**

- The public is involved at an early stage when it is still possible to influence the decision being made;
- A reasonable time frame is set for public participation;
- Provisions are made for the public to be effectively informed about the opportunities it has to participate;
- The public is provided with background information;
- All information that is used in the process of decision-making is available to the public;
- An opportunity to submit remarks is provided;
- In decisions developed by public authorities, the remarks that have been submitted by the public are considered in an appropriate manner;
- The public is provided information on the final decision.

**Slide 9.4. Aarhus Convention — regarding information necessary for effective public participation**

Public concerned should be properly, timely and effectively informed either by an official or individual notification, depending on situation, at an early stage of a procedure of decision-making on environmental matters. (Art. 6.2)

**Slide 9.5. Informational system for public participation**

- Background information
- All information related to a decision
- Information on the final decision
- Individual notification
- Public notification
- In a proper way! Effectively! Timely!
- Public concerned
- Ensures effective participation of the public
- Decisions or optimal decisions
- Lowering the impact on the environment and enhancing its condition

With the goal of contributing to the creation of environmentally competent decisions or optimal decisions leading to lowering the impact on the environment and enhancing its condition.
In this way, to ensure effective informing and communication, it is necessary to take into account the particular features of a target group for which the information is intended, the goal that we pursue when developing the information, and the possible channels of its dissemination.

In the Convention the following requirements are provided regarding the provision of background information:

Slide 9.6. Background information

The public should know the following:

✘ The fact that the given activity is subject to a procedure of an environmental impact assessment on a national or a trans-border level*.
✘ What activities are proposed and what is contained in the application based on which the decision is going to be made?
✘ What will be the character of possible decisions or perhaps the draft decision?
✘ Which public authority is responsible for decision-making?
✘ What is the procedure of public participation?

Slide 9.7. Provision of all information

Public authorities are obliged to provide free of charge to public concerned in response to their request access to all information that is related to a decision that is being made. All information that is related to this issue should be provided, including all new documents and materials as they appear. It is inadmissible for the provided information to be limited to reports and short resumes only.

Public authorities can receive a reasonable fee for such services as producing copies of documents. The amount of the fee should only cover the cost of a copy itself, and not payment for the labour involved in producing it.

* Instead of the slide you can ask the participants to read the provisions of 6.2. of the Aarhus Convention that describe background information which must be disseminated to the public at the time of the decision-making on specific types of activities.

Slide 9.8. How to disseminate information?

An organiser is obliged to determine how to approach the various groups of stakeholders is the most appropriate one: public concerned should be timely and effectively informed either by official or individual notification.

9.3. Exercise: Ways to inform the public

✘ Time: 5 minutes

✔ Expected results

After completing this exercise the participants will be able to:

• Determine what ways of informing the public are appropriate when various decisions are being developed.

✔ How to organise the work

1. Ask the participants to think and answer the following question using the microphone method:
   – While making a decision about a landfill, the organiser has issued an announcement about their project in the municipality’s corridor. Is this way of informing an appropriate one?
   – Why?
3. If you have time, draw other examples and discuss them according to the same outline.

9.4. Exercise: An effective information campaign

Time: 55 minutes

Expected results
After completing this exercise participants will be able to:
- Determine the goals of disseminating information and target groups;
- Discuss the various channels of disseminating information and their effectiveness;
- Draft an information campaign with the goal of getting the public involved in the decision-making process.

Plan of the exercise

| 1/ Information campaign: main components | 10 min. | Slides 9.9-9.21 |
| 2/ Learning an example of an information campaign | 5 min. | Handout material H 9.1. |
| 3/ Development of an effective information campaign | 40 min. | Handout material H 9.2. |

Necessary materials

How to organise the work
1. Deliver an interactive mini-lecture dedicated to the development of an information campaign (Slides 9.9-9.21).
What is a goal of an information campaign?
How does it correlate with the goal of your organisation?

For example
Problem: A large amount of household waste results in dirty streets in a town. The municipality decides to build a landfill to bury the wastes there, in the proximity of the town X.
The goal of the information campaign: to get the public involved in active participation to develop the most optimal decision and ensure the tidiness of the town.

Think!
What should be the form of your message?
General / Special
Informing / Convincing / Motivating

What should be the style and the tone of your message?
Formal / Informal
Direct / Indirect
Personal / Impersonal
Harmonising / Confrontational

Who should be the sender of the message?
Level of trust
Position in an organisation
Relationships with an addressee

Who should receive the message?
One person — Who?
Small group — Why?
Large group — Why?
Public — Why?

Here it will be useful to emphasise the role of NGOs as a connecting link between the broad public and the authorities that make the decisions.

Will your campaign be successful in a given cultural context (organisational, national, etc.)?
Will your campaign be successful in a given political context?

Try!
To formulate your messages in the language that is understood by the target groups
To make messages short, precise and to encourage action
To avoid negative messages
Slide 9.16. Message

For example

Problem: A large amount of household waste results in dirty streets in a town. The municipality decides to build a landfill to bury the waste there in the proximity of the town N.

Goal: Tidy town

✘ Target group: business-community
✘ Goals: power, safety, high status in society
✘ Objectives: profit maximisation

Messages:
✘ A dirty town is unattractive for investors
✘ A tidy town is attractive for investors

Slide 9.17. Determining timing

Determine!

TIME
✘ How much time will be needed to prepare and deliver the message through the selected information channel?
✘ How urgent is the message?
✘ Will the recipient be able allocate the appropriate time and pay appropriate attention to the message?

MOMENT
✘ What moment is most appropriate to receive the message?

Slide 9.18. Channel selection

WRITTEN
✘ Letters
✘ Memoranda
✘ Reports
✘ Electronic mail
✘ Tele-faxes
✘ Announcement boards

Mass media
✘ Newspapers
✘ Magazines
✘ Brochures
✘ Internet-publications

VERBAL
Direct communication
✘ Conversations
✘ Meetings
✘ Speeches (Presentations)

Indirect communication
✘ Telephone conversations/
Tele-conferences
✘ Tape recordings/
Answering machine
✘ Video-conferences

Mass media
✘ Radio
✘ Television
✘ Motion pictures/video-films,
photographic slides
✘ Internet/Multimedia

Slide 9.19. Channel selection

Remember!

Effectiveness of communication means that your message:
✘ Is received by the audience for which it was intended
✘ Is interpreted by recipients without distortions
✘ Has remained in memory for a certain time
✘ Has led to a required action

Slide 9.20. Channel selection

Television
Radio
Press
Telephone
Internet
Electronic mail
Brochure
Lecture/seminar
Mail distribution


Evaluate the available resources!
✘ Financial resources
✘ Time resources
✘ Human resources

Take into consideration the need to:
– develop a schedule,
– appoint responsible persons,
– keep track, and correct deviations.

Ask the participants to discuss in pairs which among the channels for disseminating information that are presented on Slide 9.20, are, according to their opinion, the most effective.

2. Ask the participants to take a look at how an informational campaign works in practice. Distribute the handout material H 9.1. Examine a real situation: Create a national park. Ask them to briefly familiarise themselves with the situation. If necessary, explain the unclear parts or present the situation yourself.
**H 9.1. Examining a real situation: Create a national park**

In the beginning of August 2224, on the island of X the quarterly meeting of the Government of the country took place, where the Cabinet of Ministers decided to start working toward creating a new national park on the Beautiful Peninsula, which is a part of the island of X. This decision was unexpected for the inhabitants of the island of X, as well as for the public in the country.

In the press release of the Ministry of the Environment that was issued on the same day, it said that the ‘national park will contribute to the well-being of the inhabitants of the peninsula and revive tourism’. A description of the future national park followed: ‘the landscape reserve that exists today on Beautiful Peninsula possesses a significant natural and cultural richness. It is there that one of the most well-preserved coastal terraces is located, as well as littoral sandbanks and sand dunes. The forest landscape of Beautiful Peninsula is mostly comprised of mesotrophic and natural forests. Also valuable on the peninsula are the widespread pines ‘bear’s berry’. Form a geo-botanical point of view the territory is unique: 80 rare species of plants of the region were discovered here, including the plants that grow on coastal sand, and 18 species of orchids that are protected by law. Today the reserve is comprised of 10 zones of special use and two zones of limited use. Undoubtedly, all of Beautiful Peninsula needs a full-fledged environmental protection system’. The decision to create a National Park was unexpected not only for the citizens of the island X and Beautiful Peninsula, but also for the local authorities who take care of environmental protection matters, because the land in question is already under the protection of several nature protection regimes, and the whole island X has already been a part of a biosphere nature-protection zone. This form of protection of nature is different from the traditional ones, such as National Parks and common natural reserves.

The day after adopting a governmental decision, the administration of the biosphere nature-protection zone of X island distributed a press-release, which said that the idea of creating a new National Park on the initiative of the government has nothing to do with the nature-protection programmes of the biosphere zone.

The governmental decision also turned out to be unexpected news for the local municipality, which immediately raised a range of issues that have to be solved before the preparation for the creation of the new National Park begins. It is worth noting that in the document about the plan of activities an intention was outlined to construct several buildings for the future National Park. Apart from that, it is planned to extend the work of the Centre for Surfing and Tourism, which is located on the peninsula and uses for its activities the big surfs (bow-waves) — it must become the main tourist attraction in the region. Therefore, the mayor of the island of X appeared in a local newspaper with a proposal that ‘Before the final decision is made it is necessary to consider all arguments ‘in favour’ and ‘against’ and conduct a discussion among the local population’.

Even though the decision of the government was not sufficiently prepared, none of the official authorities expected serious opposition to the plan of creating the National Park.

Staff members of the department for the protection of nature on X island, having received from the Minister an instruction to begin the preparatory work, have not considered it necessary to conduct any large-scale discussions, because at the time of creating the landscape reserve there already had been discussions and consultations with the local residents. ‘The problem of the peninsula has already been discussed many times at round table discussions, and various stakeholders expressed their respect towards each other’s opinions and statements, and the benefit that we all will receive from the forthcoming activities should be clear to all’ — said the press-release that they had distributed.

However, in reality everything was quite different. The public was ready for active discussion. After getting the first message people started asking each other the following questions regarding the National Park: ‘What is going to happen inside it?’ ‘What limitations and opportunities will the local inhabitants receive when it is created?’ Various stakeholders have spoken out about their own interests.

In the article entitled ‘Speak with the people!’ that was published in a local newspaper a few days after the governmental decision, it was said that the population had learned about the decision from that very newspaper. ‘We hope that the Minister of the Environment asked the people’s opinion and found out what the local inhabitants, self-government bodies and environmentalists think about it. Public officials, certainly, can draw borders on a paper and develop management plans, but it is local inhabitants who will have to live here and earn their daily bread’. From the fall, 2224 through spring, 2227 many arguments, discussions, ‘on the spot’ meetings, meetings with the Minister, meetings of the public took place, about a hundred articles were published and finally a referendum was organised. The local residents said ‘NO’ to the creation of the National Park.

Public considered the whole discussion as an insult. This has happened because the idea of the National Park was presented to the public without an appropriate thorough development in hopes that the new National Park would serve as a positive development that would be beneficial for the local inhabitants. However, there appeared groups that were against the Park, acted aggressively, and created the impression that the majority of the inhabitants are opponents of the Park.
3. Ask the participants to briefly analyse the situation (5 minutes).

4. Suggest that the participants develop a more successful information campaign that would accompany the creation of a National Park. To do this, distribute material H 9.2.

5. Together, in a brainstorming session, define all groups of public concerned.

6. Arrange the participants into four groups according to the different stages of the creation of a National Park: before the decision is made by the government, during the preparatory work, during the development of the final decision, and after the final decision was made.

7. Allow each group 10 minutes to develop a part of the information campaign for a certain stage, according to the table, and present it on a flip-chart to the rest of the groups to examine. Place these sheets in four corners of a room in such a way that the groups could come up to each of them in turn.

8. After 10 minutes ask the groups to in turn move to each of the sheets that the other groups have been working on, and make additions, provide comments to the developed parts of the campaign. Each group should thus provide comments to the results of work of the three other groups. The time to be spent at the sheet of each of the other groups should not be more than 3 minutes.

9. After completing this exercise ask the groups to analyse the sheet with the comments of the groups at which they currently stand, and prepare to present the results of their work in a larger group.

Within 2 minutes, each of the small groups presents one of the stages of the information campaign, while other groups can make additions and comments to this presentation.

H 9.2. Preparation of an information campaign

Group 1. Assignment

You have 10 minutes to prepare a more successful information campaign for the creation of a National Park at the following stage: before the decision has been made by the government.

To do this, target groups should be studied, time frames, messages, necessary resources and specific activities should be thought over. Please fill in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Different stages of the creation of a National Park</th>
<th>Target groups</th>
<th>Messages</th>
<th>Time frames</th>
<th>Channels and methods of informing (of communication)</th>
<th>Resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Before the decision has been made by the government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Group 2. Assignment**

You have 10 minutes to prepare a more successful information campaign for the creation of a National Park at the following stage: at the time of preparatory work.

To do this, target groups should be studied, time frames, messages, necessary resources and specific activities should be thought over. Please fill in the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Different stages of the creation of a National Park</th>
<th>Target groups</th>
<th>Messages</th>
<th>Time frames</th>
<th>Channels and methods of informing (of communication)</th>
<th>Resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At the time of preparatory work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Group 3. Assignment**

You have 10 minutes to prepare a more successful information campaign for the creation of a National Park at the following stage: at the time of development of a final decision.

To do this, target groups should be studied, time frames, messages, necessary resources and specific activities should be thought over. Please fill out the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Different stages of the creation of a National Park</th>
<th>Target groups</th>
<th>Messages</th>
<th>Time frames</th>
<th>Channels and methods of informing (of communication)</th>
<th>Resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>At the time of development of a final decision</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Group 4. Assignment**

You have 10 minutes to prepare a more successful information campaign for the creation of a National Park at the following stage: after the final decision has been made.

To do this, target groups should be studied, time frames, messages, necessary resources and specific activities should be thought over. Please fill out the following table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Different stages of the creation of a National Park</th>
<th>Target groups</th>
<th>Messages</th>
<th>Time frames</th>
<th>Channels and methods of informing (of communication)</th>
<th>Resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>After the final decision has been made</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To conclude the exercise, conduct a discussion of the following questions:

- What should be the stages of an information campaign?
- What is the difference between the methods used to inform at different stages of decision-making?
- To what extent are you ready to carry out the development and implementation of such a campaign in practice?
- Where do you see the possible difficulties?

9.5. Conclusion

⏰ Time: 10 minutes

✍️ How to organise the work

To summarise the results of the session, carry out a discussion with the participants in a large circle on the following questions:

- What are the main requirements of the Convention regarding informing the public with the goal of ensuring its participation?
- What are the main information methods that can be used for effective public participation in decision-making?
- What, in your opinion, is most important for ensuring effective and timely informing of the public and its participation in the process of decision-making?

✍️ practical advice

Adapt the session

If your training has a practical objective, for example, to contribute to public participation at the time of development of a certain decision, use this real situation to develop the information campaign. It can later be put to practical use by the participants in their work. In this way the result of the training will turn out to be significantly higher.

Use the following handout materials

- Text of the Aarhus Convention
- Slides for the lecture
- Handout materials for the exercises should be printed in advance

Additionally, review some material on communication technologies

Despite the fact that this session contains enough information, before conducting the session, a trainer is advised to have a look at some materials on developing information strategies or on communication technologies.
Public participation plan (Session 10)

Time: 90 minutes

Expected results
After completing this session the participants will be able to:
- Develop a plan for public participation;
- Determine the stages of decision-making;
- Determine which stakeholders should take part in the process of decision-making;
- Explain what methods of public participation are used, and at what stages of public participation;
- Develop a plan for public participation, taking into consideration the main requirements of the Aarhus Convention.

Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer Slide 10.1</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>Plan for public participation. Importance and main elements</td>
<td>Interactive lecture Slides 10.2-10.7</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>Presenting a situation and determining the stages of decision-making</td>
<td>Information from the trainer Brainstorming</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4</td>
<td>Identifying a target group</td>
<td>Information from the trainer Work in the groups of three Slides 10.8-10.10</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>Selection of methods and ways to inform the public, methods of public participation 1/ Work in small groups 2/ Presenting the results of work in small groups: alternative plans of public participation</td>
<td>Work in small groups Presentations Slide 10.11</td>
<td>35 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a large group</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10.1. Introduction
The required preliminary conditions for effective public participation are providing it an opportunity and time to prepare for the process of participation. Preliminary planning of the process of public participation can be effective and useful for the authorities responsible for the decision-making.

Present the goals and objectives of this session with the help of Slide 10.1, and familiarise the participants with the plan of the session.
10.2. Interactive lecture: Plan for public participation. Main components

- **Time:** 10 minutes

- **Plan of the lecture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1/ Why is it necessary to have a plan for public participation?</th>
<th>Slides 10.2-10.5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The purpose of such a plan</td>
<td>Slides 10.2-10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2/ Main elements of the plan</td>
<td>Slides 10.6, 10.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Slide 10.2. Why is it necessary to have a plan for public participation (Plan for PP)?**

The effectiveness of public participation in the development of a decision depends on the level of public preparedness. Planning helps organise the work and ensures control. A plan for public participation allows to ensure:

- the involvement of all stakeholders in the process of decision-making;
- the development of comments on a problem or a decision by the stakeholders;
- the provision of these comments to the authorities that are responsible for decision-making, and other sides.

Developing a plan for public participation is only the first step in the process. The next steps are:

- After having developed a plan — begin its practical implementation: ensure effective public participation in the development of an optimal decision.
- Upon completing the work — perform an analysis of the results of public participation and evaluate the influence of the public on the final decision.

After presenting the information on Slides 10.2-10.4, ask the participants:

- What is the end purpose of getting the public involved?

Comment on the answers with the help of Slide 10.5.

**Slide 10.4. How to develop a plan for public participation?**

To ensure the effectiveness of public participation a plan should:

- Be developed with the entire process of developing a decision being taken into account, i.e. from an intention to examine a given issue to the point of making a final decision.
- Concentrate on the steps that are necessary to achieve the final goal.

**Slide 10.5. Purpose of public participation**

To contribute to the development of an optimal decision that meets the needs of the majority, a viable decision, designed for a long period of validity. Optimal decisions lead to the enhancement of the quality of life of every person.

- Setting up a goal of creating the plan.
- Identifying a group (target groups), public concerned.
- Selecting an activity depending on the degree of involvement:
- Determining methods of public participation;
- Selecting channels for communication with the public;
- Determining the necessary resources;
- Setting up a time frame (according to legislation).
10.3. Presenting a situation and defining the stages of decision-making

Time: 15 minutes

Expected results
After completing this exercise the participants will be able to:

- Explain what should the stages of developing a plan for public participation and adopting a final decision should be;
- Develop a plan for public participation.

Necessary materials
Description of a case. H 10.1. A flip-chart or a whiteboard and markers.

How to organise the work
1. Ask the participants to imagine themselves in the role of representatives of a municipality of the town of N. Briefly describe the situation that has developed in the town during the transition period, or invite them to read corresponding handout material. After this is done, ask the participants whether the situation is clear to them. If necessary, ask a few analytical questions in accordance with the recommendations given in Part 1 regarding the method ‘analysis of the situation’.

H 10.1. Description of a situation in the town of N

Story
The population of the town of N is 60,000 people. It was built in Soviet times around a few large industrial enterprises:

- 1st enterprise — is a low-output chemical factory manufacturing nitrogen- and phosphorus-based fertilisers. At the present moment it works at the level of 20 per cent of its maximum production capacity, satisfying the needs of the region.
- 2nd enterprise — is a machine-building plant. It has been producing combine harvesters and tractors, and is now manufacturing consumer goods (household products) and fulfils individual small orders (it also works at the level of 20-30 per cent of its maximum production capacity).

After the break-up of the Soviet Union, new types of industry began to develop, such as the woodworking industry. But the town is suffering from a high level of unemployment.

Around the town there are valuable natural sites, historical and cultural monuments, a good recreation zone, as well as sanatoriums and resorts.

There are several educational institutions in the town: local technical secondary schools, the chemical and the machine-building one, both working since Soviet times. Also a new commercial higher education institution is developing that graduates economists-financiers.

At the present time the town of N is striving for recovery and development. The city administration has made a decision: to develop a plan for the town’s social and economic development aimed at its revival.
2. Ask the participants to work on developing a plan for public participation. Explain that the case to be examined belongs to the subject of developing plans and programmes. The authority that makes the decision is responsible for the involvement of the public in this process. Before beginning to develop such a plan, it is necessary to identify the stages of development and adoption of a final decision.

To identify these stages, conduct a brainstorming session concerning the question:

- What, in your opinion, should be the stages of developing a plan for the town’s social and economic development?

Write all the proposals that are expressed on a large sheet of paper. When ideas run dry, ask the participants to clearly determine the sequence of stages.

### training tips

The following are the stages for the development of a plan for a town’s social and economic development:

- Decision of a local authority regarding the need to develop such a plan — the beginning of the process of developing a decision;
- Preparation of a plan (can be conducted by consultants);
- Agreeing a draft plan with the various stakeholders;
- Modification of the plan according to received comments;
- Issuing the plan for endorsement by the local authority — the final decision.

3. If necessary, tactfully make corrections to the resulting list. Invite the participants to consider how to get the public involved in this process, beginning with identifying the target groups.

### 10.4. Identifying target groups

- **Time:** 10 minutes

- **Expected results**
  
  After completing this exercise the participants will be able to:

  - Identify various groups of public concerned that are necessary to get involved in participating in the development of plans and programmes.

- **Necessary materials**
  
  A flip-chart or a whiteboard and markers.

- **How to organise the work**

  1. The Aarhus Convention contains a provision that says it is advisable to ‘…identify the circles of public concerned, conduct discussions and present information regarding goals and objectives…’. Art. 6.5. Present to the group the questions that help during the identification of the circles of public concerned with the help of Slides 10.8, 10.9.
2. Ask the participants to work in groups of three and identify the groups of the public that need to be involved in the development and coordination of a plan of a town’s social and economic development using the slides shown above (5-7 minutes).

3. Ask the first group of three to present their results, and the others to make additions to the list. If necessary, ask the presenter to explain why he or she has included these particular groups (5 minutes).

4. If necessary, ask the participants to merge some similar proposals. Tactfully make corrections if all the participants agree with your proposals.

5. Discuss with the group what role non-governmental organisations play in the process of decision-making. Conclude the discussion with the help of Slide 10.10.
10.5. Selection of methods and ways to inform the public, as well as methods of public participation

%! Time: 35 minutes

!% Expected results

After completing this exercise the participants will be able to:
• Develop a plan for public participation determining the methods of informing and methods of public participation for each stage of decision-making.

!% Necessary materials

Working sheets H 10.2. for each of the participants. Handout materials; H 10.3. Methods and means of informing and public participation; H 10.4. Methods and means of informing and public participation and stages of decision-making. Flip-chart and markers for each of the groups.

% How to organise the work

1. Arrange the participants into groups of not more than five persons each. Ask them to write individually a plan for public participation in developing a plan for the social and economic development of the town of N. Distribute to the participants the working sheets H 10.2.

2. Make sure that the assignment and the format of the table is clear to the participants. Remind them that the plan for public participation should reflect the Principles of public participation discussed in Session 7.

% Assignments for the groups

H 10.2. Plan for public participation

Within 20 minutes develop a plan for public participation in developing a plan for the social and economic development of the town of N. Write it on a flip-chart. Select a presenter to present your work to the larger group. The time allocated for the presentation of the plan is no more than 3 minutes.
Developing and delivering trainings for Officials. A Manual for Trainers
PART 2: Model Programmes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stages of decision-making</th>
<th>Goal of PP</th>
<th>Target groups</th>
<th>Level of PP (with an indication of a target group)</th>
<th>Methods</th>
<th>Terms</th>
<th>Necessary resources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Beginning of the development of a plan of social and economic development of the town</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Informing</td>
<td>Feedback</td>
<td>Joint development of a decision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process of the development of the plan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Informing</td>
<td>Feedback</td>
<td>Joint development of a decision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final decision</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Informing</td>
<td>Feedback</td>
<td>Joint development of a decision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. If the participants lack information to implement the assignment, help them find their way with the help of Slide 10.11, and the handout materials H 10.3.

### Slide 10.11. Level of public participation

**One-way communication**
- Press-conference
- Newspapers, magazines

**Feedback**
- Round tables
- Questionnaires
- Public hearings

**Joint development of a decision**
- Working groups
- Negotiations
- Referendum

### H 10.3. Methods and mechanisms of public participation: a short description

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Description and use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Informing — one-way communication</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Making a video-film for the purpose of informing. It may include computer graphics and other images.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coming on the spot for a visit</td>
<td>Studying the issue by carrying out organised meetings on the spot to provide information first-hand (regarding a specific type of activity or an examined problem).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exhibitions/public presentations</td>
<td>Exhibitions or reviews organised in public places for the purpose of informing, where specialists would present information and answer questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone hotlines</td>
<td>A telephone number that people can call to receive information, ask questions or offer their comments on proposals or problems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>A Website on the Internet used to provide information or quick feedback. It is necessary to take care to constantly update information. It is also possible to develop interactive forms of work on the Internet, for example, online forums and discussion groups.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. After the participants complete the development of their plans, ask them to present them to a larger group. The presenter from each group speaks for no longer than 3 minutes.

5. After all groups have completed their presentations, ask the participants to vote for the best plan.

6. Distribute to the participants the handout material H 10.4. as a reminder-note.
10.6. Conclusion

**Time: 10 minutes**

**How to organise the work**

To summarise the results of the session, arrange the participants in a large circle and discuss the following questions:

- Why did you vote for the given plan?
- Does the developed plan correspond to the principles of public participation, and why?
- What advantages of developing a plan for public participation do you see?
- Did you learn anything new in this session? What have you learned?
- Will you be able to independently develop a plan for public participation? What difficulties may you face in this work?

**practical advice**

**Adapt the session**

In this case a plan for public participation is being created based on an example of developing a 'social and economic plan of development for the town of N’. Other trainings that you will be conducting can focus on the development of a plan for public participation in a specific activity or in the development of legislation. In this case, you can use the plan and methods of this session as a basis by filling it with the necessary content presented in the Regional user guide on implementation of the provisions of the Aarhus Convention for public officials.

If there is an opportunity, it is recommended to examine the particular issues that your participants deal with, and develop a plan for public participation based on a specific decision that is being planned or developed by them at that moment.

**Use the following handout materials**

- The text of the Aarhus Convention
- Fragments (articles, norms) of the national legislation of your country that secures public participation in your country
- Slides from the lecture

Handout materials for the exercises should be printed in advance. Handout materials with answers should only be given to the participants after completion of the corresponding exercise.

**Improvise**
Role play ‘Developing a strategic plan for the social and economic development of the town of N’ (Session 11)

**Time:** 80-90 minutes

**Expected results**

After completing this session the participants will be able to:

- Discuss the procedures used to conduct public hearings;
- Compare positions of various stakeholders that interact in the process of environmentally important decision-making;
- Identify the benefits of public hearings;
- Identify the main factors that influence the successfulness of public hearings.

**Plan of the session**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Studying handout materials</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Stage I: Arrangement into groups, preparation for public hearing</td>
<td>Arranging the participants into five groups Discussion in the groups</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3</td>
<td>Stage II: Conduct the public hearing</td>
<td>Discussion in large groups</td>
<td>30 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>Stage III: Mayor’s presentation on the results of the public hearing</td>
<td>Work in a small group 1</td>
<td>8 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion of the results of the play in the large group</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Necessary materials**

Handout materials H 11.1.-H 11.3. Plates with the names of the performers: chairperson, local authority, women’s organizations, environmental organisations, businessmen, representatives of academia and a suitable room.

**How to organise the work**

11.1. **Introduction**

**Time:** 10 minutes

At the beginning of the role play give the participants a short explanation — introduction to the subject. Distribute to the participants text 1 from the handout material H 11.1.

**Handout material H 11.1.**

**Text 1. Description of the situation in the town of N**

The town of N with a population of 60,000 people strives for recovery and development. The local authority created a strategic plan for the social and economic development of the town and conducts public hearings in order to discuss it. Representatives of academia and the system of education, representatives of business, environmental NGOs and women’s NGOs are invited to the public hearing.
Background information
The town was built in Soviet times around a few large industrial enterprises.

- 1st enterprise — is a low-output chemical factory manufacturing nitrogen — and phosphorus-based fertilizers. At the present moment it works at 20 per cent of its maximum capacity, satisfying the needs of the region.
- 2nd enterprise — is a machine-building plant. It has been producing combine harvesters and tractors, and is now manufacturing consumer goods (household utensils) and fulfils individual small orders (it also works at 20 to 30 per cent of maximum capacity).

After the break-up of the Soviet Union, new types of industries started to develop, such as the woodworking industry. At present there is a high level of unemployment in the town, including those people with higher educations — chemical engineers and machine-building engineers, specialists in the field of agriculture. Around town there are valuable natural sites, historical and cultural monuments, a good recreation zone, as well as sanatoriums and resorts.

There are several educational institutions in the town: local technical secondary schools, the chemical and the machine-building ones, both working since Soviet times. Also a new commercial higher education institution is developing that graduates economists-financiers.

11.2. Stage I: Arranging participants into groups and group work

Time: 20 minutes

Arrange the participants into five groups of equal number with the help of coloured cards or using any other way. Distribute assignments to the groups. Together with the assignments distribute to the groups also Text 2.

Handout material H 11.2.

Text 2

The proposed plan of strategic development of the town envisages the town’s social and economic development by:

- Revival of the chemical industry up to the level of utilization of 100 per cent of maximum capacity, even though the demand for fertilizers has decreased (it is assumed that there will be a possibility of exporting the product to other agricultural regions); it was decided to upgrade the technology of the industry so that it becomes possible to produce new types of fertilizers and pesticides.
- Revival of the machine-building industry, changing its profile according to the demands of the market (reorienting the production on manufacturing of mini-tractors and other mini agricultural machinery).
- Development of the woodworking industry by extending the range of products.
- Development of tourism and the system of sanatorium and resort services to satisfy the needs of the population of the town and the region.
- Development of an infrastructure.
- Creation of new faculties of higher education, for example: a faculty of management for small and medium-sized businesses.

Handout material H 11.3.

Group 1. Local authorities

Congratulations, you represent the local authorities. Your group has to present for discussion a plan for the town’s strategic development. You are certain that the draft plan that has been developed is the most rational solution for the revival and further development of the town. You view public hearings predominantly as a tribute to modern requirements and the possibility of avoiding accusations of lack of openness. In this manner you are absolutely sure that you will not change anything, but will only make ‘cosmetic’ amendments. One of the main questions that you are concerned about — whether you will be able to find investments to implement the expressed proposals and recommendations.

You have 15 minutes to carry out the following tasks:
PART 2: Model Programmes

• Prepare for conducting a public hearing* and explain its procedure to all the participants at the start of the hearing.
• Attentively examine and prepare to present a plan for the town’s social and economic development and your arguments regarding its effectiveness.
• Select a presenter and a facilitator for the public hearing.
• Select a secretary who will make a protocol and collect proposals.
• Select two people for an analytical group who will evaluate which proposals can be included in the plan during the collection of proposals at the hearings, and why.

Group 2. Environmental NGOs

Congratulations — you represent an association of nature protection organisations. Your initial position is determined by the results of the public environmental expertise that has been conducted earlier.

The results of the expertise show the following:
• The issues of environmental safety have not been considered sufficiently.
• The issues of municipal improvements on the territory of the town have not been considered.
• The development of tourism and recreation is not sufficiently emphasised.

In particular, the results of the expertise demonstrate that:
• For the past 10 years an insignificant decrease of quantity of heavy metals in the surface water (in the lake) and in the soil has taken place, while the amount of polluting agents contained in the atmosphere of the town has decreased significantly — as a result of the reduction of industrial production and, accordingly, emissions from stationary sources.
• The problem of solid household wastes and industrial waste products has not been solved (the wastes are simply brought to the town’s landfill, which does not meet modern environmental and sanitary-hygienic requirements): the town is polluted with waste products containing metals.
• In the last 12 years (the transformation period) 20 per cent of the forests located in the vicinity have been annihilated both as a result of using it for fuel, and (predominantly) as a result of cutting it to produce raw materials for the woodworking enterprise.
• A certain increase of indicators of child diseases caused by the emissions of the chemical factory is observable.
• The following indicators have decreased in the town: percentage of stillbirths and percentage of births of children with congenital defects, which is evidence of the positive influence on the environmental situation in the town from the sharp reduction of production of the chemical factory.
• The development of the chemical industry will slow down or even stop the development of the recreational and tourism activities.

You have 15 minutes to fulfil the following assignments:
• Prepare your proposals to the plan using the proposals presented below. Discuss what else needs to be added and corrected. In general, propose to transform the plan into local Agenda XXI.**
• Present arguments to back up your position, show the possible advantages that the town will have if your proposals are considered. Try to point out the advantages not only in the environmental field, but also in the social and economic ones.
• Select a presenter who will present your point of view at the public hearing. The presenter should actively lobby his or her position. The discussion will last no longer than 20 minutes. For the initial presentation you will have no more than 2 minutes.

Your key proposals to the plan:
• The chemical industry should not be revived, it should simply be liquidated. The development of tourism is impossible with a functioning chemical factory.
• The machine-building plant can only be revived on the condition of using cleaner, waste-free technologies or installing cleaning facilities.
• The woodworking industry should be discontinued because they receive permission to do sanitary cuttings, while in practice they cut the best trees. If the town wants to have a woodworking industry, special plantations should be created, and this industry should only use the wood from such plantations. To do this, special territories should be selected.

* Prepare and distribute to the participants the materials on the procedure of conducting a public hearing that are presented in the Trainer’s Guide in the section ‘Role Plays’.
** Agenda XXI was proclaimed at the Conference on Development and the Environment (Rio-de-Janeiro, 1992). It proposes the development of a country (or region, district, town…) that would provide for balanced economic, environmental and social interests.
Group 3. Association of businessmen

Congratulations — you represent the association of businessmen. You have been actively participating in the development of a plan for the town’s social and economic development. Therefore, you support this plan, because it contributes to the social and economic revival of the town. Nevertheless, you think that the plan does not take into account some possibilities for development, and you propose to include the following provisions into the plan:

- Stimulating small- and medium-sized businesses by providing special low-rate crediting for the creation of consulting services.
- Stimulating the development of an infrastructure, in particular, the roads.
- Lowering taxation for the developing industrial branches.
- Extending the chemical enterprise in connection with the possibility of attracting significant investments.

You have 15 minutes to carry out the following tasks:

- Discuss the plan and propose several arguments to back up your proposals regarding the amendment of the plan, and a few arguments to back up the plan for social and economic development proposed by the local authorities.
- You know that environmental and women’s non-governmental organisations speak in favour of closing down the chemical factory. Prepare your arguments and during the discussion try to confront them on the issue of closing down the chemical factory.
- Select a presenter who will present your point of view during the public hearing. The presenter should actively lobby his position. The discussion will last no longer than 20 minutes. For the initial presentation you will have no more than 2 minutes.

Group 4. Women’s organisations

Congratulations — you represent the women’s non-governmental organisation of the town of N. You have been invited to the discussion of the plan for the town’s social and economic development one day in advance of the public meeting and have only familiarised yourselves with it only the day before the meeting.

You are concerned over:

- The possibility of restoring the chemical industry, because during the past decade, following the decrease of production at this factory, the indicators of reproductive health have significantly improved. Besides this, a decrease in the number of child diseases related to air pollution has been observed (respiratory tract and cardiovascular diseases, allergies, etc.).
- Difficult social and economic conditions. The number of people in town who live below the poverty line has sharply increased. The majority of families cannot afford to have children, which leads to a decrease in the number and increase of the average age of the town’s population. Unemployment leads to labour migration — husbands leave homes for extended periods of time in search of jobs, resulting in many family break-ups. Many women, being left alone and unemployed, barely make ends meet. Your organisation invests a lot of efforts to support women. At the present time you have organised retraining/skill conversion courses — many women can either work in the service sector or organise small- and medium-sized businesses, in particular, with a tourism orientation.
- Lack of comfort and improvement of residential areas, especially poor conditions and the absence of playgrounds for children and green areas inside the residential areas. Besides this, the remaining parks are being chaotically developed with gas stations, cafes and gambling houses. People do not have a place where they can walk with their children and elderly people do not have a place where they can rest.
- The fact that women are ousted from the level at which decision-making is done. You are sure that had they been present among the self-government authorities, the situation in the town would have been significantly better.

You have 15 minutes to conduct the following tasks:

- Prepare your proposals regarding the amendment of the plan (use the key proposals outlined below). Discuss what else should be added and corrected. Bring the attention of the environmental non-governmental organisations to the fact that the town nearly does not take into consideration the issues of municipal improvements, in particular, the restoration and expansion of green areas.
- Support your position with arguments and show the benefits for the town. Try to point out the benefits not only in the environmental field, but also in the social and economic ones.
- Select a presenter who will present your point of view during the public hearing. The presenter should actively lobby his position. The discussion will last no longer than 20 minutes. For the initial presentation you will have no more than 2 minutes.

Key proposals from the side of the women’s organisations:

- The chemical industry enterprise should not be allowed to be extended.
- The creation of jobs should be ensured through other enterprises or the services sector.
- There should be created a public council at the city administration, where a gender balance would be observed.
**Group 5. Representatives of academia and education**

Congratulations — you represent a group of scientists. Your group consists of specialists of various profiles, therefore, you try to manifest a balanced and constructive approach. A sociologist, an economist and an environmentalist — all three are specialists in the field of sustainable special development. You support the proposals of the environmental NGOs regarding transformation of the plan for social and economic development into local Agenda XXI.

**Your key proposals are:**

- Revival of the machine-building plant on the condition of adapting to the conditions of the modern market. Research shows, that the enterprise can indeed manufacture mini-tractors and other mini-agricultural machinery. The production must meet the requirements of environmental safety (for instance, the metal-containing dye-stuffs can be replaced) and the reduction of specific resource consumption.

- Particle maintenance of the chemical enterprise. You propose to keep 20 per cent of the production facilities to satisfy the internal needs of the region for fertilisers on condition of a well-maintained functioning of the cleaning facilities; the remainder of the production assets can be transferred or sold to the machine-building plant or another company to produce solar collectors and/or wind turbine-based power plants.

- Conduct an experiment in the field of agriculture — a pilot project on introducing sustainable methods of agriculture (permaculture, biodynamic agriculture, etc.). Should this practice prove successful, the experience needs to be expanded and the remaining chemical production facilities closed down.

- Use the wood from sanitary cuttings as raw material for the woodworking industry (under strict supervision, particularly of environmental NGOs), as well as imported wood (if this possibility exists). The extension of production can only be planned after it becomes possible to use the wood from plantations. Also, wood residues should be used to produce small items for household use, as well as souvenirs for tourists.

- Significant expansion of the tourism branch involving the entire existing potential: sanatoriums and resorts for sanitary and therapeutic tours; historical and cultural monuments for cultural learning tours; valuable natural sites — for eco-tours. At the same time the achievements in the area of sustainable agriculture can be demonstrated, as well as in the area of environmentally justified technologies in the industrial and energy fields. It is necessary to maintain the level of service and observe environmental norms.

- Creation of a faculty of sustainable (environmentally-oriented) methods of agriculture, as well as a faculty of management of small- and medium-sized businesses.

- You insist that during the period of transition it is better to begin using new progressive technologies, and not become a market for the morally obsolete technologies of the West.

You have 15 minutes to carry out the following tasks:

- Discuss the above-mentioned proposals and prepare a short presentation for the public hearings.

- Select a presenter who will present your point of view during the public hearing. The presenter should actively lobby his position. The discussion will last no longer than 20 minutes. For the initial presentation you will have no more than 2 minutes.

During the time of discussion manifest a comprehensive and balanced approach and help the local authorities to make the right decision.

---

**11.3. Stage II: Conducting the public hearing**

**Time: 30 minutes**

Organise the public hearing that will be presided over by group 1. At the time of the hearing do not provide more than 4 minutes to any of the small groups for presenting their objections, wishes and compromise proposals (2 minutes for the first presentation and no more than 2 minutes for all subsequent ones).

The plan of development of the town that has been discussed in the small groups is not the basis for further discussion at the public hearings.

After 30 minutes stop the discussion and give the floor to the representatives of the local authorities. Let them conclude the hearing by thanking all the participants and expressing their brief (1 minute) comments on the process of the hearing.

**11.4. Stage III: Mayor’s presentation on the results of the public hearing**

**Time: 8 minutes**

Ask group 1 to conduct one more stage of work with the following task.
Assignments for the groups

You have 5 minutes. Listen to the representatives of the analytical group who have been assessing the submitted proposals and make a decision, which of them you will take into consideration at the time of the final amendment of the plan. Back up your position with arguments.

Select a presenter who will play the role of the Mayor of your town and present your decision on his 3-minutes speech on television.

Following the end of the hearing briefly reflect with groups 2-5 based on the following questions:

– Are you satisfied by the presentation of your group at the time of the hearing, and why?
– Which group, in your opinion, has succeeded in presenting and defending their position in the most successful way, and why?
– Which arguments from among those presented by the groups have been the strongest?
– How has the opinion of your group influenced the representatives of the authorities?
– Have you been heard?

Give the floor to the representatives of the local authorities to carry out the Mayor’s presentation ‘on television’ within 3 minutes. Then discuss with group 1 which arguments presented by groups 2-5 have influenced them the most and why.

Conclusion

Time: 20 minutes

Discuss the role-play using the following questions:

– How have the main principles of public participation in the environmentally important decision-making been realised in the process of the role-play (use the slides from Session 7)?
– How effectively has your group succeeded in taking part in the public hearing? What particular methods have you learned today?
– Has your position regarding the project been changing depending on the role that you have played, and how, exactly?
– What determines whether or not you will be heard during a public hearing?
– What should a group that organises a public hearing need to remember?
– What should a group that comes up with a constructive position need to remember? How does a group have to act in order to be heard?
– Has your attitude toward public participation in the process of decision making changed, and in what way, exactly?
– How effectively can public hearings influence the process of decision-making? How can their influence be increased?

training tips

Bring the participants attention to the fact that it is important to be positive when defending your position — to speak from the position of ‘for’ or ‘in favour of’. I am ‘for’ or ‘in favour of’ a clean environment, rather than ‘against’ your decision.

practical advice

Use the session as a model session

You can use this session as an example of how to organise a public hearing during training. Depending on the goals of your training, you can modify the assignments for the groups. For example, if the training is oriented at organising public participation in the decision-making of some particular decision, the subject of the public hearing can be developed in advance of a plan for public participation (especially if the representatives of various stakeholders are present at the training). Such a public hearing will give a concrete practical result.

Use other roles too

Another variant of a story for a role-play and the roles of participants is presented in Annex 11.1. This role-play will be useful for studying the procedure of public hearings.

To study the methods of public participation in decision-making of specific types of activities, use the role-play presented in Annex 11.2.

In this role-play you can examine the activities of working groups and the opinions of working groups that take part in public hearings. The participants can try out different roles and get a clear picture of the positions of various stakeholders.
Working with media to facilitate the implementation of the Aarhus Convention (Session 12)

**Time: 180 minutes**

**Expected results**

After completing this session the participants will be able to:

- Determine why and how they can attract journalists in the process of implementing the Aarhus Convention;
- Select the ways and methods of work with mass media in concrete situations: for the active dissemination of information, to get the public involved in the decision-making process (to plan work independently with mass media, taking into account the specifics of a journalist’s job, conduct media-activities, prepare materials for mass media).

**Plan of the session**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Exercise ‘Ice-breaker’</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>Exchange of good and bad experience</td>
<td>Joint discussion</td>
<td>30 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.3</td>
<td>Mass media in our society: role, mission, types and effectiveness</td>
<td>Interactive lecture</td>
<td>20 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>Development of a media campaign</td>
<td>Work in groups</td>
<td>30 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>Preparation of materials for mass media</td>
<td>Interactive lecture</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>Preparation of materials for mass media</td>
<td>Role-play</td>
<td>60 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a common circle</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**12.1. Introduction**

**Time: 10 minutes**

**Necessary materials**

Paper for drawing, flip-chart.

**How to organise the work**

Ask participants to state their names, the organisation they are from, and an animal that they associate with journalists. You can ask them to draw this animal.

Write the answers on a flip-chart.

**training tips**

Remember that this exercise is only an instrument for becoming acquainted and creating a favourable atmosphere. Do not allocate too much time to it so that it does not become the main significance of the session and turn into a universal entertainment.
12.2. Exercise: Exchange of good and bad experience

**Time:** 30 minutes

**Expected results**

After completing this exercise the participants will be able to:

- Evaluate their practical experience in the area of work with the mass media in particular situations;
- Understand to what extent the training meets their real needs;
- Compare their own experience with that of others;
- Analyse the reasons for mistakes and successes in work with mass media.

**Necessary materials**

Paper for drawing, flip-chart.

**How to organise the work**

1. Ask each participant to briefly describe one positive and one negative example from their own experience of work with mass media in implementing the Aarhus Convention.

2. Ask them in which cases the mass media helped, and in which it hindered successful work.

   As the stories are being told try to record on the flipchart the main claims against journalists, and the reasons for failures or successes. You can record the positive and negative points with different colours.

**training tips**

After the end of the exercise absolutely make sure that the participants understand the connection of the training with their practical activities, and emphasise that work with the mass media requires special approaches and methods that will be examined during the session.

Remember that the material collected during this exercise will serve as a reference point for you for the entire duration of the training. Return to it after completing each of the stages. Suggest that the participants recall the stories that have been told, to think (and explain, if they agree) based on the knowledge they have just received, what mistakes they had made, and in which cases they acted correctly.

12.3. Interactive lecture: Mass media in our society: role, mission, types and effectiveness

**Time:** 20 minutes

**Plan of the lecture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Role of mass media in society and assistance in implementing the Aarhus Convention</th>
<th>Types and kinds of mass media</th>
<th>Accessibility and effectiveness of different mass media</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Slides 12.1-12.6</td>
<td>Slide 12.7</td>
<td>Slide 12.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Slide 12.1. Why it is necessary to work with the mass media?**

If your target group won’t pay attention to you, you will not be able to achieve your goals.

**Slide 12.2. Mass media will help you fulfil your responsibilities, according to the Aarhus Convention:**

- Contribute to the practical implementation of the environmental rights of citizens (Article 3.2);
- Contribute to environmental education and increase the awareness of the population on issues of access to information, participation in the process of decision-making and access to justice (Article 3.3);
- Provide the public with information regarding the condition of the environment, as well as where, from whom, and in what way this information can be received (Article 5.2);
- Timely inform citizens about the processes of decision-making and the opportunities to take part in them (Article 6.2).
Slide 12.3. Why it is necessary to work with the mass media?

*Good mass media* can:
- ✗ Raise the prestige of public authorities;
- ✗ Secure the sympathy of citizens and public support;
- ✗ Establish good contacts and cooperation with all the stakeholders;
- ✗ Attract like-minded people to joint activities;
- ✗ Attract financing from the budget due to the increased interest of society and the government.

*Bad mass media* can destroy your activities or make you spend a lot of effort and time to restore your reputation.

Slide 12.4. What is mass media?

Mass media — is a specific part of an audience with their particular features, the most important of which is that they are an intermediate link that disseminates information among virtually all target audiences. With the help of mass media the problem of reaching out to a large audience is easily solved.

Slide 12.5: Journalists tasks

The task of journalists — is to implement the right of citizens to obtain information with the help of which the people can make adequate decisions.

Slide 12.6. Mass media in society

- ✗ helps provide the public with access to information,
- ✗ informs the public,
- ✗ is a social observer,
- ✗ Influences the way that people think.

Slide 12.7: Types and kinds of mass media

Mass media can be divided into groups:
- ✗ Based on covered territory: city-level, district-level, regional, interregional, national, international;
- ✗ Based on how they are disseminated: printed (newspapers, magazines) and electronic (television, radio, Internet);
- ✗ Based on the type of information: advertisement-informational, entertainment-oriented, business-oriented, social-political oriented, general;
- ✗ Based on the subjects and the way the information is presented: popular and specialised (belonging to industrial and agricultural enterprises, professional groups, interest communities, educational institutions and creative associations, national and religious communities, non-governmental organisations, it is here where the “green press” also belongs);
- ✗ Based on the type of publisher: political parties, governmental structures, business companies and private persons, non-governmental organisations;
- ✗ Based on periodicity.

Slide 12.8. Effectiveness and accessibility of mass media

- ✗ The most effective and accessible mass media is television.
- ✗ Radio channels are more often privately owned, and have a greater influence in difficult-to-access regions or regions located in the mountains.
- ✗ Printed media — are less accessible because of the cost of newspapers and magazines, which has significantly increased for the past 10 years. In Ukraine it is only possible now for an average salary to buy 10-12 times fewer newspapers than in Soviet times, and for an average pension — 30 times less.
12.4. Exercise: Development of a media campaign

**Time:** 30 minutes

**Expected results**

After completing this exercise participants will be able to:

- Explain why a campaign for work with mass media is necessary;
- Independently develop a media campaign for a specific activity in implementing the Aarhus Convention;
- Identify the key mass media depending on the goals and objectives of their campaign;
- Determine the forms of work with mass media.

**Necessary materials**

Assignments for the groups, flip-chart, markers and paper.

**How to organise the work**

Explain to the participants the purpose of this exercise.

1. Arrange the participants in 2-3 groups and distribute an assignment to each of the groups. Explain that the participants should develop a plan for a media campaign in the next 30 minutes: define goals, select mass media according to their interests and types, and identify the corresponding forms of work.

2. After the work in groups is completed, all participants will gather together and the representatives of each group present the results of their work. Ask the participants to comment on each other’s presentations.
3. After the completion of the discussion carry out a joint reflection on the exercise, using the following questions:

- Have you discovered anything new for yourself?
- What methods of work with mass media can be useful for informing the public and involving it in the process of decision-making? Why?
- What methods of work with mass media will be especially useful for the active dissemination of information? Why?
- How is it possible to constantly inform the press regarding your own activities?
- What is it important to know when planning work with mass media?
- Why do you think we have included this exercise in the programme training?

### training tips

You can ask the participants to develop a general plan for media-campaigns. Such a plan can truly help them in their future work. The work on one and the same assignment in different groups will help them see different ways to solve a problem and identify the best ones together.

Try to maintain a friendly atmosphere in the group. Ask the participants to employ a positive style of commenting. For example, instead of a remark such as 'I don't like...', use 'I would rather do it this way'. To develop joint decisions it is very important to maintain a positive attitude and the ability of the discussions’ participants to defend their opinions, as well as listen to different opinions.

### 12.5. Interactive lecture: Preparation of material for mass media

**Time:** 15 minutes

**Plan of the lecture**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1/ What materials must be prepared for journalists?</th>
<th>Slides 12.11, 12.12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2/ How to check oneself</td>
<td>Slide 12.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Slide 12.11. Help a journalist!

(The less work that remains for a journalist to do, the more willingly he or she will take your information and the less mistakes he or she will make).

Write yourselves! But remember: if you have not succeeded in attracting a journalist’s interest by the first three lines, your message may end up in the trash bin.

Make sure the information you present is up-to-date, trustworthy and objective!

### Slide 12.12. What causes the greatest interest?

- A unique incident or sensation.
- An unusual turn in a well-known or popular story.
- A direct appeal to the interests of many people.
- Significance from the viewpoint of political, economic or social consequences.
- Impact on the health and safety of the population.

### Slide 12.13. Checklist of questions used when writing a press release

- Is the date of its release stated in it along the mark “for immediate distribution” or does it contain a prohibition to release it before a certain date or time?
- Is the name and telephone number of a responsible person provided?
- Is the title of the press release short and informative enough?
- Does the first paragraph answer the questions — Who? What? Why? When? and Where?
- Do you cite the main actors in the second or the third paragraph? Have you agreed the published citations with these people?
- Are the names of the people, the titles and the names of organisations written correctly?
- Do you mention the possibility of receiving a photo if there is such a possibility?
12.6. Role-play: Holding a press conference

**Time: 60 minutes**

**Expected results**

After completing this exercise the participants will be able to:

- Develop a plan for a press-conference;
- Independently carry out a press-conference;
- Prepare the necessary materials;
- Carry out the press conference taking into consideration the interests and needs of the journalists.

**Necessary materials**

Assignments for the participants, flip-chart, markers and paper.

**How to organise the work**

1. Explain to the participants that this role-play will help them reinforce the received knowledge and apply it in practice. Participants will also be able to use the received skills in the future in their daily work.

2. Present the topic of the press conference. This can be, for example, a press conference dedicated to the publication of a pollution release and transfer register on the site of the Ministry of the Environment. Do not forget to mention that press conferences are usually held on significant occasions. Publication of the register is a good reason for such an activity.

3. Distribute the roles and the corresponding assignments to the participants. Give them some time to prepare and comprehend their roles.

4. During the press conference do not hinder the participants in playing their roles.

**training tips**

Distribution of roles is an important part of a role-play in order to prepare and motivate the participants. You may resort to using an ordinary method of drawing lots. Or ask the participants to answer very unexpected questions, such as: **What is better — sleep or sweets?** In this way the participants will be arranged into two groups: journalists and public authorities holding the press conference. You can simply distribute to the participants the candies or chocolates of different brands and announce who is playing whom according to the brand of candies or chocolates that they have received.

Such a method of arranging the participants into groups will help them relax and make up their minds for the role-play.

However, if during the training you have already noticed who will be working best when playing certain roles, and if the participants trust you quite well, you may simply distribute the roles. Or yet — distribute according to their wishes.

**Group 1: Assignment**

**Public authorities who are preparing the press conference**

You have to prepare the press conference.

1. Develop a programme: who will speak, about what and how long will they speak, who will facilitate at the press conference. Organise a support group in the room. Write invitations for the journalists, a press release, list documents that can be provided as additional information. Also think about the technical equipment necessary to demonstrate the website, as well as about a relevant room and placement of furniture.

2. Hold the press conference in line with your plan (no longer than 30 minutes).

**Group 2: Assignment**

**Journalist working for a chemical company**

The main task is — this entire undertaking concerning the registers should look silly and impossible to implement. Prepare provoking questions and try to ask them all, overcoming the resistance of the facilitator.
Group 3: Assignment

Journalist working for an environmental news programme

Wants to find out the tiniest detail, asks essential questions, strives to receive as much as possible additional materials and contacts.

Group 4: Assignment

Journalist from a news agency

He or she has to produce a 10-line news story immediately after the conference. He or she does not have time or preparation on the subject. He or she wants to catch the main point as precisely and quickly as possible.

12.7. Conclusion

Time: 15 minutes

How to organise the work

To summarise the results of the session, discuss with the participants in a large circle the following questions:

– What conclusions have you drawn from the last exercise?
– How did the information that you received during training help you in holding the press conference?
– What mistakes will you try to avoid in future work with mass media?

In the end you can go back to the pictures that the participants had drawn at the start of the training, and ask them to add a drawing that would reflect their feelings at the end (this can be a plain background, a feeling of being near a journalist, some additional details, etc.).

Adapt the session

In the capacity of the concluding exercise of the session some other forms may also be used.

For example:

1. A case study based on a real case. Analyse together with the participants a television program about the Aarhus Convention. Show the programme; distribute to the participants the initial material that the journalist has received to create this programme. Carry out a joint analysis: What information has the journalist received? What was correct, and what was missing from the material? Why? How can such mistakes be corrected in the future?

2. An analysis of the article and the press release that the written article was based on. The task is to explain the mistakes being made using concrete examples, to develop advice on how to avoid mistakes, advice for journalists and for those who present information to them.

In such cases the trainer needs examples of articles, TV-programmes and press releases.
Topic III. Access to Justice

The sessions for this topic are prepared based on the publication: ‘Implementing the Aarhus Convention. A User Guide for Officials.’

Chapter 2: Access to Justice

Access to Justice (Session 13)

-Time: 80 minutes

Expected results

After completing this session the participants will be able to:

- Determine in which cases and how the provisions of the Aarhus Convention regarding access to information and public participation are being violated;
- Explain in which cases judicial and non-judicial ways should be used to protect citizens’ interests regarding access to information and justice.

Plan of the session

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Associations, discussion in a large group Slide 13.1</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>In which cases is it necessary to apply the provisions of the Aarhus Convention on access to justice?</td>
<td>Work in small groups on the analysis of the cases, discussion in a large group based on slides Slides 13.2-13.6</td>
<td>35 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>Possibilities of implementing access to justice</td>
<td>Work in small groups on the assignment H 13.2 Discussion in a large group based on slides</td>
<td>25 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a large group</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13.1. Introduction

-Time: 10 minutes

To open the session, ask the participants to formulate with the help of the ‘microphone’ method their associations with the words ‘court’ and ‘court procedure’. Listen to 5-7 responses and ask the groups why they have this particular association with this word? Do the participants have experience applying to court, and what is this experience, exactly? (If the participants do not have such experience, emphasize that in Western European countries people apply to courts significantly more often than in post-Soviet countries, and ask the participants to answer why it happens this way). After this present the subject and the objectives of the session.

Slide 13.1. Expected results

After completing this session the participants will be able to:
- Determine in which cases and how are the provisions of the Aarhus Convention regarding access to information and public participation are being violated;
- Explain in which cases judicial and non-judicial ways should be used to protect citizens’ interests regarding access to information and justice.
Emphasise that in order to secure the right to access to information, public participation and the right to live in an environment adequate to health and well-being, a powerful mechanism to protect these rights is necessary. Such protection is provided by Article 9 of the Aarhus Convention, ‘Access to Justice’.

13.2. Exercise: In what cases is it necessary to apply the provisions of the Aarhus Convention regarding access to justice?

Time: 35 minutes

Necessary materials
Texts of the assignments for the groups and the texts H 12.1. of the Aarhus Convention (for each group).

How to organise the work
1. Arrange the participants into four small groups and ask them to implement the assignments.

Assignments for the groups

Handout material H 13.1.

Within 10 minutes read the cases described below and determine which of the provisions of the Aarhus Convention is upset in each of the cases. Back up your point of view with arguments based on the relevant articles of the Convention. Present your answers to the larger group.

Case 1
In a small town a group of scientists monitored the level of pollution in drinking water with heavy metals. Mrs. R. knows that the fact of such pollution did take place, but her requests to be provided with a corresponding report were left unanswered by the City Water Supply organisation. She has submitted an official request to the Ministry of the Environment to receive a scientific report and the copies of all laboratory tests that had been done during the monitoring. The Ministry has responded that the laboratory tests contain only the ‘preliminary’, not the ‘final’ information.

Case 2
The city administration of the town of P has issued permission for the construction of a facility, but has not carried out a proper environmental impact assessment. The only information accessible to the public was a short article about this decision that was published in a local newspaper.

Case 3
A company that is located 50 kilometres away from the town of B dumps its waste products into the river that flows through the town. The mayor of the town is worried about an increase in the sickness rate of the population. He often relies on the provisions of the local legislation on access to information, as well as article 4 of the Aarhus Convention. He discovers that the regional authorities know that the company violates the terms described in the permission, but they take no steps to do something about it. The city administration files a suit with the regional court against the company.

The right to access ecological information on the condition of the environment has been violated. The copies of laboratory tests are final documents about the condition of the environment and must have been provide to the woman. A scientific report can be in the stage of development, and the Ministry can refuse to provide it, stating exactly when it will be possible to use it. (Art. 4.)

The public has not been informed about this project — the right for participation in decision-making has not been secured, the public has not had an opportunity to comment on the decision to build the facility. (Art. 6.)

The city administration can file a suit with a court against the company on the grounds of the violation of the terms of the permission, and, therefore, the violation of the legislation on protection of the environment.
Case 4
An environmental NGO has sent a letter to the Minister of the Environment and Natural resources in which the desire is expressed to participate in the development of a plan for recycling of wastes in the country. The Ministry has left the letter of the NGO unanswered.

Training tips
The right to access information has been violated (Art. 4). The Ministry should have presented information about the procedure of public participation in the development of plans and programmes. Article 7 of the Aarhus Convention points out that a ‘public authority, taking into consideration the goals of the Aarhus Convention, defines the circles of the public that can take part in this process.’ Therefore this NGO may be left off the list of the public that is invited to take part in the development of the plan. Nonetheless, the Ministry should have provided an answer to the request.

After 10 minutes has passed, present the results of the group work using the method ‘Circle of ideas’ (10 minutes). Invite one of the groups to present a solution for case 1 to the other participants and back it up with arguments. Then ask the other groups to add or correct the answer given by this group. Ask another group (the next round the circle) to present the solution for case 2, and the other groups to comment on the answer. In the same manner do this for cases 3 and 4 (the main thing is that you have to ensure that each group has an opportunity to present their solution and avoid the situation where one group dominates).

Ask the participants to compare the results of group work with the information that is presented on Slides 13.2-13.4 (3 minutes).

Slide 13.2. Situations in which Article 9 ‘Access to justice’ applies (1)
Violation of the right to access information:
✓ Information is provided, but it is incomplete or irrelevant to the request.
✓ A request for provision of information is rejected (provision of all requested information or part of it is rejected).
✓ A response is not provided during the established time frame (1(+1) month).
✓ The public authority asks to provide reasons for requesting information.

Slide 13.3. Situations in which Article 9 ‘Access to justice’ applies (2)
Violation of the right to participate (Art. 9.2):
✓ Notification regarding the procedure of decision-making has not been made.
✓ The information that is contained in the notification is insufficient for it to reach addressees.
✓ The notification was issued at a late stage of the procedure (Art. 6.2).
✓ The notification does not contain the necessary minimum information (Art. 6.2).
✓ It is impossible to receive more detailed information about a project, programme or a plan (Art. 6.6).
✓ A procedure does not provide for submission of comments (Art. 6.7).
✓ At different stages the public participation procedure does not allow reasonable time for the public to study the proposed decision and prepare comments (Art. 6.3).
✓ Comments provided by public are not sufficiently taken into account, the final decision does not contain the reasons on which it is based (including the decision related to comments provided by the public (Art. 6.9).
✓ The final decision is not publicly announced (Art. 6.9).

Slide 13.4. Situations in which Article 9 ‘Access to justice’ applies (3)
The laws on protection of the environment have not been observed. (Art. 9.3):
✓ Activities or lack of activities of private persons who violate environmental protection laws can be appealed.
✓ Action or lack of action on behalf of public authorities against those who break the law in the sphere of protection of the environment can be appealed.
To summarise the results, propose to the participants to discuss in a large circle whether or not they agree with the following statements (10 minutes):

- NGOs must protect in court only the interests of their own organisation,
- people can go to court only if the problems related to the environment concern themselves personally (for example, there is a threat to their health of property).

Make a final summary of this part of the session by using Slides 13.5 and 13.6. Note that Article 9 of the Convention gives a **special status to environmental NGOs** by acknowledging their interest in cases on access to justice based on the right to participate in the process of decision-making.

To illustrate the special status of NGOs, it is advisable to draw the following example.

**Birds in oil**

The special status of NGOs, established by the Aarhus Convention, has allowed the Dutch Society for Nature Protection to file a suit against a shipping company with claims to receive compensation for expenses related to saving birds that suffered from oil that was spilled as a result of a shipwreck in the North Sea. The basis for filing the suit with a court was environmental damage.

The story was as follows. In 1998 a Romanian cargo ship ‘Borsea’ suffered wreckage in the North Sea, which led to a large oil spill. The littoral waters were significantly polluted and thousands of sea birds were unable to fly, because their feathers were covered with oil. The Dutch Society for Nature Protection initiated a campaign to save the birds and clean them from the oil. This required significant financial resources.

After this the Dutch Society for Nature Protection filed a suit against the Borsea Company seeking compensation for the expenses related to saving the birds and restoring their habitats. The court accepted their suit recognising the Dutch Society for Nature Protection’s legal standing based on the fact that protection of birds is a public interest, and this public interest correspond to the goals of the Society for Nature Protection.

As a result, the Dutch Society for Nature Protection and Borsea managed to solve the conflict.

In this case, by the ruling of the court all expenses related to the environmental damage were compensated, and not the individual damage done to the Dutch Society for Nature Protection.

13.3. Exercise: Possibilities of implementing access to justice

Time: 25 minutes

Necessary materials
Flip-chart, markers, handout materials for the groups H 12.2.

How to organise the work

Emphasise that this part of the session will be dedicated to the possibilities of implementing citizen and NGO rights to access justice. Ask the participants exactly what possibilities of protecting environmental rights they are aware of. Write their answers on a flip-chart. After finishing ask them to compare the resulting list with the contents of Slide 13.7.

Slide 13.7. The ways to protect environmental rights

- Appealing the decision to a higher instance
- Submit a complaint to a public prosecutor
- File a complaint with a court
- Submit a complaint to an ombudsman

1. Arrange the participants into three small groups with no more than seven persons in each of them. (If there are too many participants, make six small groups and in this case the same assignments will be performed by two groups). Offer the following assignments to the groups. Emphasise that the time allocated for implementing this assignment is 10 minutes.

Assignments for the groups

Handout material H 13.2.*

Case 1

Analyse the given situation and the additional information that comes with it.

A Charity Foundation ‘Ecopravo-Lviv’ was working on a case regarding the condition of underground waters in the area of the location of a water-intake tower located in the immediate vicinity of the city wastes landfill in the town of Brody, Lviv region.

On the 23rd of May, 2001 the CF ‘Ecopravo-Lviv’ sent to the State communal services enterprise ‘Brody Water Supply’ an information request about the State communal services enterprise ‘Brody Water Supply’ establishing zones of sanitary protection for the water-intake tower, its boundaries, an action plan on securing the quality of the water, implementing systematic laboratory and industrial monitoring of the quality of water and the condition of sources of the water supply. But according to a letter dated 31st May, 2001 the State communal services enterprise Brody Water Supply refused to satisfy the information request, motivating the refusal by the fact that the information requested by the CF ‘Ecopravo-Lviv’ does not belong to open information according to the Art.30 of the Ukrainian Law ‘On information’.

Group 1. Assignment

Discuss the case and answer the following questions:

- What rights of the public have been violated?
- How can the public protect them and why? Will this defence be effective or not? Why?

Prepare the presentation of the results of work in a group to the larger group.

* The texts of the exercises are based on real cases brought to court by the Ukrainian Charity Foundation ‘EcoPravo-Lviv’ [http://www.ecopravo.lviv.ua/]. Consultation was provided by Ms. Zoryana Kozak, PhD. Environmental Law from ‘Eco Pravo- Lviv’.
Developing and delivering trainings for Officials. A Manual for Trainers
PART 2: Model Programmes

In this case the right of the public to receive environmental information was violated.

After the presentation by the group of their results, you should tell the group how the real situation developed.

In July, 2001, 'Ecopravo-Lviv' filed a suit application with the Economic Court of the Lviv region requesting the following: (1) to recognise that the refusal to provide information is illegal and violates the right of the non-governmental organisation; (2) to oblige the State communal services enterprise 'Brody Water Supply' to provide the necessary information; and (3) to make the defendant responsible for the court expenses of the plaintiff.

On the 1st of November 2001 the first court session took place, where both sides presented their arguments. While doing so, both the CF 'Ecopravo-Lviv' and the State communal services enterprise 'Brody Water Supply' based their arguments not only on Ukrainian legislation, but also on the Aarhus Convention on access to information, public participation in decision-making and access to justice on environmental matters.

On the 9th of November, 2001 at the time of the second court session, the Economic Court of the Lviv region satisfied the suit brought by CF 'Ecopravo-Lviv' to the full extent, obliging the State communal services enterprise 'Brody Water Supply' to fully provide the necessary information, and ruling that the amount of the State fee (95 hryvnia), as well as expenses for the informational and technical support of the arbitration process (69 hryvnia) must be collected from the State communal services enterprise 'Brody Water Supply'.

The ruling of the court was the first court precedent in Ukraine when a court reinforced that the CF 'Ecopravo-Lviv' — is an environmental non-governmental organisation with the right to request information about the condition of water facilities, as well as about the sources of their pollution, use of waters, plans and activities aimed at using waters and restoring water resources (environmental information). And at the same time does not have to state the goals for the use (reasons for receiving) of such information.

On the 26th of December 2001 the State communal services enterprise 'Brody Water Supply' provided the information.

On the 5th of March 2002 the State communal services enterprise 'Brody Water Supply' reimbursed court expenses in amount of 154 hryvnia.

Case 2

Analyse the situation described below.

In the beginning of 1998 in the newspapers of the city of Lviv a message appeared that the city council is planning to build a waste incineration plant. It was planned that a Swedish company would take part in building the plant, which offered a well-known Scandinavian technology for burning waste and producing electric energy as a result of the burning. The organisation 'Ecopravo', concerned over the safety of such a project, requested and received from the State department of environmental safety of Lviv region official information confirming the intention to build the plant in order to burn wastes directly inside the city. In the received information it said that the documentation for this project has not been submitted to the Department for review.

After some time a member of the Lviv city council, Mr. V. Poluiko contacted the 'Ecopravo' and informed that in May 1998 the city council signed an agreement regarding building a waste incineration plant with a capacity of 200,000 tonnes per year, with construction costing 90 million dollars. Mr. V. Poluiko also presented the text of the agreement that was signed. An analysis of the text showed that its individual provisions violate the legislation currently in force, because they were adopted without a prior environmental evaluation of the project.

The lawyers of the organization informed the member of the city council Mr. V. Poluiko regarding the violation of the legislation, and he in turn informed the city council about it.

But the council did not pay attention to the remark of this member and made an agreement to allocate a plot of land in the village Soroki-Lvivskiyi (not far from Lviv) for the construction site (because to allocate a plot of land for a construction site in the city of Lviv it was necessary to make a decision at a session of the city council, and in this situation it was easier for the city council to do it at the level of a village council).

Group 2. Assignment

Discuss the situation and answer the following questions:

- Which rights of the public have been violated?
- How can they be protected by the public and why? Will this protection be effective or not? Why?

Prepare a presentation of the results of the work in a larger group.
In this case the right of the public to participate in the process of decision-making was violated.

After the presentation by the group of their results you should tell the group how the real situation developed:

The Scandinavian company that planned the construction of the waste incineration plant was offering a well-known Scandinavian technology for burning waste and producing electric energy as a result of the burning. With the help of the Internet, representatives of the NGO Ecopravo found information regarding this technology. A prolonged search in the Internet for information about the company produced no result.

However, the address of the company had been stated in the agreement, and the representatives of the NGO ‘surf’d onto the website of the town of Avesta. Even though the site was in the Swedish language, they succeeded in making out the main information about the town and the local authorities: Avesta – is a small town with population of about 20,000 people. The representatives of the NGO decided that in such a town people should know about a large company with a well-known technology that can invest 90 million dollars into the construction project in another country. Therefore, they sent a letter to the mayor of Alvesta, as well as to the economic department of the local council, asking it to provide information about the company, the project and the people who are responsible for it.

In response to the letter the representatives of Ecopravo received a message saying that in the town of Alvesta there is no such company, and the people who are mentioned in the letter work as taxi drivers. Two of them design and sell water boiling equipment. At the moment they have not succeeded in selling a single project in Sweden, but, according to their words, they are trying to sell projects in other countries. Their company (Scandinavian Gartner Recyckling AB Gera) is not on the list of private companies of Sweden. The letter was signed by the head of the department of industrial development of the town of Alvesta.

Representatives of the NGO Ecopravo immediately sent copies of this letter to the mayor of the city of Lviv, to the State department for environmental safety in the Lviv region, and informed the other stakeholders. The information interested journalists, publications in the press followed, and the inhabitants of the city learned about this story. Then the Lviv city council informed journalists that they had cancelled the agreement with the Swedish company.

Case 3

Analyse the situation described below and the additional information that comes with it.

Mr. Ivanov has learned that in the flood plain of the Yuzhnyi Bug River within the town of M. (along Pribugskaya Street) the Pilate Company is constructing a gas station. He contacted the Chief sanitary inspector of the region and requested information related to the construction of the gas station itself on Pribugskaya Street, and about the general condition of the environment and the health of the population in the town of M., as well as about the existing and possible risk factors to health and the level of risks that they pose. He received a response to his questions that grossly violated Mr. Ivanov’s rights, in particular, it did not contain the information that the citizen requested. It should be pointed out that the information he requested did not belong to the types of information with limited access and should have been provided within terms established by legislation.

Moreover, the Chief sanitary inspector recommended Mr. Ivanov to ask for the requested information at the city’s Sanitary Epidemiological Station. According to Art.7 of the Ukrainian Law ‘On Citizens’ Applications’ if the questions set forth in a request received by a public authority do not lie in the sphere of its competence, the request is to be forwarded by the authority that received it to a proper logical Station. According to Art.2 of the Ukrainian Law ‘On Informatio’, ‘On Citizens’ Applications’ and ‘On securing the sanitary and epidemiological well-being of the population’.

In this manner, the Chief sanitary inspector of the region grossly violated with their actions the legitimate rights and freedoms of Mr. Ivanov provided by the Constitution of Ukraine, the Ukrainian Laws ‘On Informatio’, ‘On Citizens’ Applications’ and ‘On securing the sanitary and epidemiological well-being of the population’.

Group 3. Assignment

Discuss the case and answer the following questions:

- Which rights of the public have been violated?
- How can they be protected by the public and why? Will this protection be effective or not? Why?

Prepare for a presentation of the results of the work in a larger group.

training tips

When working on this case you should bring the group’s attention to the fact that it has really taken place in the town of Khmelntiški (Ukraine).

Mr. Ivanov contacted the Charity Foundation ‘Ecopravo-Lviv’, which drafted a complaint on his behalf. The complaint contained an appeal against the unlawful actions of the Chief sanitary inspector, and the request to the court was the following:

1. ‘To recognise the complaint as a justified one, and the lack of action on the side of the Chief sanitary inspector — as unlawful and violating my legitimate rights and interests’.
2. ‘To oblige the Chief sanitary inspector of the Khmelntiški Region to take the measures provided for by the law and provide me with the necessary information’.
3. ‘To compel the defendant to cover the legal costs’.

On the 2nd of July, 1999 the court ruled in favour of Mr. Ivanov: the court recognised the lack of action on the side of the Chief sanitary inspector as unlawful and obliged them to satisfy the request.
2. After the groups conduct the assignments, ask them to present the results of their work. Each group should present its case and the results of its work within 3 minutes according to the questions that have been set forth in the assignments. The participants of the other groups may ask questions and comment on the results. If you had six small groups, allocate two times as much time for the presentation. Then the total time for the implementation of this exercise will also increase.

After all three groups have spoken, emphasise that in many countries the Code on Civil Procedures demands that all the administrative means to protect one’s right are exhausted (i.e. before one goes to a court all the non-judicial means of protection of rights have been used).

3. Conduct a group discussion on the exercise according to the questions (5 minutes):
   - What are mechanisms for the protection of environmental rights of citizens are?
   - What ways of judicial and non-judicial protection of rights do you know?

13.4. Conclusion

Time: 10 minutes

How to organise the work

To summarise the results of the session, conduct a discussion of the session with the participants in a larger circle using the following questions:

   - What thoughts and feelings has the work during the session inspired in you?
   - Have you learned anything new? What new experience for yourself have you received?
   - How can you use this experience?

In conclusion remind the participants that if someone contests your decision in a court, this person or organisation is not necessarily the enemy of public authorities. In reality, the goals and convictions of these people most probably are the same as yours. It simply turned out that your views differ on some particular issue. Sometimes you can sort this situation out between yourselves. But if this is not possible, the court will be able to evaluate all the arguments and find the best solution. It will help both you and your opponent.

Governmental institutions in many countries cooperate on a constant basis with the very same people who often are their opponents in a court hall. The examples of such an approach are the situations that have just been looked at. In reality, there are many other countries where environmental lawyers' organisations bring suits against the decisions of the very same ministries they work together with on the development of legislation and preparation of programmes. It is very important to look at a court case as an opportunity to solve a problem, and not a way to express disagreement. After all, public authorities can sometimes use such court decisions to avoid inappropriate but strong pressure from the outside. Or yet, as it happens with public authorities on protection of the environment, to use public participation and court rulings to support their interests within the government.

practical advice

Adapt the session

If you have examples of how things are in your country, use them.

Use the following handout materials

- Chapter 3. About access to justice from the Guide on the Aarhus Convention
- Slides of the lecture
- Handout materials for the exercises should be printed in advance
Conclusion (Session 14)

**Time: 45-60 minutes**

**Expected results**
At the time of this session the participants will be able to (only for the trainer):

- Determine to what extent they have retained the knowledge and mastered the skills related to the requirements of the Aarhus Convention on access to information, public participation and access to justice;
- Express their opinions regarding the organisational side of the training, the style of work of the trainers, etc.;
- Express their proposals and wishes on how to enhance trainings on the Aarhus Convention.

**Plan of the session**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Elements of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>Introduction — let us recall our expectations</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>Interactive evaluation</td>
<td>Smiles</td>
<td>15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.3</td>
<td>Filling out questionnaires</td>
<td>Questionnaire</td>
<td>10 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>Receiving feedback regarding the results of the training</td>
<td>Discussion in a large group</td>
<td>10-15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>Issuing certificates</td>
<td>Plenary session</td>
<td>5-10 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

14.1. Introduction — let us recall our expectations

**Time: 5 minutes**

**Necessary materials**
Prepare in advance the records of the results of the exercise ‘Expectations’ that was carried out during the first session of the training.

**How to organise the work**
Ask the participants to recall the results of the exercise ‘Expectations’ that they implemented during the first session. Announce that the current session is dedicated to determining to what extent these expectations have been met.

14.2. Interactive evaluation

**Time: 15 minutes**

**Necessary materials**
A flip-chart with a pre-prepared format as shown below, coloured markers, or sticky colour notes (post it® notes).
### How to organise the work

1. Show the participants the form for the interactive evaluation (place it on a wall or on a flipchart in advance). Ask the participants to evaluate to what degree they have succeeded in mastering the different topics presented at this training. To do this, each participant has to come up and fill out the evaluation form with the help of colour markers (or colour sticky notes).

   Explain what the symbolic signs on the form mean:

| ☺ ☺ | I am sure that this statement is correct |
| ☺ | I fully agree with this statement |
| ☺ | I agree with this statement |
| ☺ ☺ | I only partially agree with this statement |
| ☺ ☺ ☺ | I do not agree with this statement |

2. After all the participants fill out the form, ask them to have a look at the result and make a summary. You can count in percentages both the results of how they mastered/digested separate modules, and the general results of the training, as well as discuss it with the participants.

### 14.3. Written evaluation

**Time:** 10 minutes

**Necessary materials**


**How to organise the work**

Announce to the participants that you would also like to receive feedback — regarding how the training was and how the course can be enhanced. Ask them to fill out the questionnaires. Point out that sincere answers are welcome. Indicating a name is not mandatory, although desirable.

### 14.4. Feedback on the results of the training

**Time:** 15 minutes

**Necessary materials**

Notes that were placed on flip-chart the Expectations exercise conducted during the first session of the training.
How to organise the work

training tips

This exercise will allow the participants to express themselves, including gratitude or criticism in the organisers' address. Such a method will harmoniously conclude the training, relaxing possible emotional tension.

Ask the participants to first examine to what extent have their expectations related to the training come true.

Then ask them to picture the following in their imagination: that in the centre of a circle stands a large basket full to the brim with information, abilities, skills, feelings, relationships, etc. that are related to the training, which has just ended. Ask the participants the following question:

? What will you take with you from this basket when leaving the circle?

If you succeeded in creating a good, trustful atmosphere at the seminar, it is advisable to use the following question:

? What do I want to say to the other training participants and to the organisers?

Ask all the participants to speak, taking turns.

14.5. Presenting certificates

Be natural! Present the certificates with pleasure!
Annexes
Annex 1. Getting-acquainted exercises

These exercises are absolutely necessary for all types of educational seminars and trainings. [9, p. 10-11].

Offer the participants an opportunity to become acquainted. There can be several options — choose the appropriate one, depending on the composition of the group and the goal of the training (seminar).

1. Ask each participant to state their name, briefly explaining a little bit about themselves (occupation, place where they live, hobbies). Start the process of getting acquainted with the first who volunteers, and then move around the circle. Do not skip anyone, including the trainers. Thank everyone and move on. The trainers introduce themselves when it’s their turn to speak.

2. Ask the participants state their names and briefly explain the history of their name. Stick to the requirements, presented in variant 1.

3. Ask the participants to tell their name and a trait of their character that starts with the same letter as their name. They can demonstrate this trait of character by means of pantomime. Do not forget about the order in which you should carry out the exercise, that was described in the variant 1.

4. Let each participant state their name and finish the sentence ‘I am proud…’ Explain, that they can be proud of the various traits of their own characters. Stick to the rule that people only speak of their own free will, as well as to the rules of work in the common circle. If someone refuses to express themselves, skip him or her, but return to them after the circle is complete — they will surely have something to say by then.

5. Divide those who are present into pairs and have them take a seat, forming a circle. If someone can not be paired get a trainer involved. Ask them to decide who in each pair will be number one, and who will be number two. Tell them that the number ones will have three minutes in order to ask their partner five questions about their job, family, hobbies, etc., in order to find out as much as possible about him or her. After this the number twos will take turn to ask questions. After that ask everyone to briefly tell to the whole group sitting in the circle about their partner, using the most interesting and relevant bits of information they have received. Remember that people should speak of their own free will, support the continuity of the circle, and be sure to remind to those who speak too long about the need to be concise. Instead of the numbers you can assign names to the participants in each pair, for example, Joy and Happiness. In this case when the participants introduce their partners, they should start with the words: ‘I would like to introduce to you my Joy (Happiness)’.

6. Prepare in advance a small collection of coins. Let every participant choose one coin from your collection, after which ask the participants to study ‘their’ coins — what sort of coin is that (one cent, ten cents, etc.), in what year was it minted — and to remember an event of their life, that has taken place in that year and stuck to their memory the most. Listen to the participants’ stories in a circle, having reminded them that they should start their story by introducing themselves. Don’t forget to collect the coins right after the exercise is finished.

Irregardless of the selected variant, you must carry out an evaluation of the exercise by asking the following questions: ‘How did you feel when you were doing this exercise?’ or ‘What did we do it for?’

7. Ask the participants to finish one of the following phrases: ‘Most of all I like…’ or ‘Most of all I dislike…’, and add a few words about themselves in the context of what they just told.

8. Take a Polaroid camera and take pictures of all the participants (having received their consent, of course). Hang a big sheet of paper on the wall and attach the photos to it. Then ask all those who are present to determine at least one positive trait of character of at least one person, judging by their photograph — and write that trait of character near the photograph. During the next exercises ask the participants to expand the lists of positive traits of character (they should not write about the negative ones).

An ‘icebreaker’ should be carried out in the beginning of every day of training. On the second and the third days of training it can be conducted in the form of reflection of the previous working day.

9. Ask the participants to build their own image of the day, according to the following scheme: Name… for today, public participation means for me the following… or name… after yesterday I understood that…

10. Ask the participants to define their attitudes for the specific day: Name, today for me the following will be important…
Annex 2. Expectations

Begin each day of a multi-day seminar from carrying out an exercise aimed at discovering the participants’ expectations. If you are having a short presentation-type seminar, combine the ‘discovering participants’ expectations with the introduction of the participants, or don’t include this exercise into the program at all.

Expectations should be put on a sheet of A1 formatted paper and hung up in the room. It is useful to come back to them while conducting this exercise the next time, and compare expectations from the first day of work with the expectations of the second one.

Before you begin, place an emphasis on the fact that you all are at the beginning of an important journey, and in order to complete it successfully it is necessary to determine what everyone present expect from the work in this training.

1. Ask the participants to finish the sentence: ‘From this training I expect…’. Ask them to be concise.

Let your partner put down all the expressions of the participants on the whiteboard (blackboard). You can draw a chamomile flower in advance, whose petals will be expectations, or a sail ship, whose sail has to be full with the wind of expectations from the training. You must absolutely carry out a reflection, using the following question: ‘And did we do this for?’ [9, p.12]

2. If there are too many participants (over 24 persons), and you don’t have the time to listen to everyone separately, you can split them up into small groups and ask them to define and express the expectations of their small group. This technique is also useful in case there are a few people among the participants who don’t really know themselves what they want.

3. Hand out to the participants the small color post-it® notes and ask them to put down on them the question that they would like answered at the time of training. After a short time for them to think it over (5-10 minutes) ask everyone to put their sticky note on the wall or on the flip-chart, read it, and comment their question. In this manner, the questions that are most important to the participants will be identified.

Instead of post-it® notes you can use small flags — the pieces of color paper, cut diagonally. After the participants put their questions on them, they can hang them on a long thread, in order to form a large garland of flags.
Annex 3. Training needs analysis: questionnaires

Sample 1.
Target group: state officials and representatives of the local authorities

Dear friends!

We would like to ask you to fill out the following questionnaire. This will help us create the most adequate training programme that will satisfy all of your needs and interests.

1. Do you need information about the Aarhus Convention?
   Yes □ No □

2. Do you need theoretical information about access to information?
   Yes □ No □

3. Do you need practical skills regarding access to information?
   Yes □ No □

4. Do you need theoretical information about access to justice?
   Yes □ No □

5. Do you need practical skills regarding access to justice?
   Yes □ No □

6. Do you need theoretical information about public participation in decision-making in environmental matters?
   Yes □ No □

7. Do you need practical skills regarding public participation in decision-making in environmental matters?
   Yes □ No □

8. What experience do you have, related to public participation in decision-making in environmental matters?

9. What groups of public did you get involved in your work?

10. What methods and means of public participation do you utilise in your work?

11. What methods and means of increasing public awareness do you utilise in your work?

12. On which of the following topics do you need an additional training?
   □ Management of routine activities.
   □ Work with mass media.
   □ Establishing relationships with the partners and the public.
   □ Participation in the development programmes.
   □ Other (please, describe).

Thank you very much for your cooperation!
Dear participants of the training!

In order for the training programme on public participation in your town to be developed in a greater detail, will you please fill out the following questionnaire? This will help us develop a programme that will more adequately reflect local conditions.

Your name, name of your organisation and contact address:

1. Do you have any experience of utilisation of the provisions of the Aarhus Convention or other legal acts, connected to this subject? (please, draw examples)

2. When and in what circumstances have you learned about the Aarhus Convention?

3. Based on your own experience, what provisions of the Aarhus Convention are the most difficult ones to utilise?

4. Which of the provisions of the Convention do you consider the most useful?

5. What problems do you face in receiving (disseminating) information, or in public participation in decision-making in environmental matters?

6. What methods and ways of public participation in decision-making are used in your region?

7. What difficulties do you face in the use of the Aarhus Convention?

8. What specific knowledge and skills would you like to receive at this training?

9. What target groups should be gotten involved in the process of implementation of the Aarhus Convention?

10. What prevents the cooperation of the authorities, mass media and the population for the sake of improvement of the mechanisms of implementation of the Aarhus Convention?

Thank you for your assistance!
Such exercises are used in order to relieve fatigue, stimulate mental work, enhance atmosphere in the group. Sometimes they are about moving around, and sometimes just about having some fun.

**Imitate the object or animal: a Viking, a toaster, an elephant**
First the trainer with the help of participants demonstrates the poses, and then conducts the exercise with everyone participating. Having split the participants into triads, he or she points to a triad, and informs them of what object or animal they have to imitate — a ‘toaster’, an ‘elephant’, or a ‘Viking’ [9, p. 50].

**Compote**
The trainer assigns each participant a certain fruit name. Then he or she arranges them in groups by the names of the fruits, saying: *now I will be cooking compote from apples, grapes and peaches* (there can be different variants). The participants who were called come into the center of the circle and form a group there [9, p. 50].

**Tropical rain**
The trainer asks the participants to stand up and form a circle. Walking around the circle, the trainer asks each participant he or she passes, to copy the trainer’s movement in order to reproduce the sounds he or she makes. While walking around the circle, the trainer snaps his or her fingers, rubs one palm on another, claps his or her hands, stamps his or her feet (snaps, rubs, claps, stamps…). The participants have to repeat all movements and sounds, and change them only when the trainer passes them. After the noise reaches its highest level, the exercise goes in the reverse order [9, p. 50].

**Energy check-up**
The trainer asks everyone to form a circle and tells them that he or she will demonstrate the movements that should be copied precisely. The trainer starts the game: clapping his or her hands, the trainer says ‘one’, three times — ‘one, two, three’, five times — ‘one, two, three, four, five’, then, crossing his arms on his chest, says ‘ooh’. The exercise is repeated with increased pace until the group’s energy is recharged sufficiently. The trainer tells the group that whenever its pace of work goes down, or the group becomes tired, he or she will start this exercise to check the group’s energy [9, p. 51].

In order to raise the energies of the group you can also use funny exercises.

---

**Annex 4. Energisers**

**Come up with an alternative version**
The best way to produce a good idea is to have many ideas to choose from. For instance, project an image of a paper clip on a screen and ask the participants to come up with various non-standard ways to use it. The prospering companies usually encourage creative ideas of their employees, even if not all of those ideas are congenial.

**Two on a newspaper**
Ask the participants to find a solution to the following problem that requires a creative approach. For example, ask the question: how can it be arranged for two people to stand facing each other on a newspaper, put on the floor, and not touch each other? Warn them that they may not use ropes! (The solution: *put the newspaper under the closed door*).

**What do a minister and a fly have in common?**
Ask the group to think what do a minister and a fly have in common. After they suggest a few ideas, tell them yours: *both a minister and a fly can be killed by a newspaper*.

**Puzzles**
Puzzles are very energising. Use one of the puzzles shown below, or think up your own [11].

1. Connect all the dots by means of four straight lines, without lifting the pencil from the paper.

   ![Answer](image)

   **Answer**: 38 triangles

2. Ask the participants to determine, how many triangles are there on the figure.

   ![Image](image)

   **Answer**: 38 triangles
Annex 5. Setting the rules

1. 'Contract'
This method can be used for a relatively prepared group. We recommend using while conducting trainings for representatives of civil society.

1. Write the list of rules of work at the training on a sheet of paper of A1 formatted paper. Let some of the rules to be harsh or provocative. For instance, ‘before the beginning of each session say “hello” all together’, or ‘if you need to leave the room in the middle of a session, you need to explain the reason aloud’, etc. Having provocative rules is necessary in order to initiate a group discussion. We recommend to absolutely include the following onto the list of rules:
- come on time;
- speak in turn;
- speak on your own behalf;
- be positive;
- no one can force anyone else to speak, people only speak when they are willing to do so;
- switch mobile phones into silent mode.

2. Ask the group to discuss the rules they were offered and highlight on the sheet of paper those that they agree with, cross out those they do not agree with, and add their own ones.

3. Ask the participants to copy all highlighted rules that they agree with onto the sheet of paper of A1 formatted paper entitled ‘Contract’.

4. Ask the participants to sign this sheet of paper so as if they would be signing a contract. Their signature will mean that they will have entered into a contract with the trainers and with each other, about observing these rules.

2. ‘Try this...’
You can skip the development of rules at the very beginning. Nevertheless, if the main rules of work, listed in the previous example, are not observed, and this impedes the progress of the training, talk to the group and suggest developing such rules. For example, tell them: ‘We have not discussed the rules of work, but it seems that we need to talk about them, in order for us to be able to work more effectively’. Then use the previous method, or the method, presented in the Chapter 3.2.
Annex 6. Handout for the exercise ‘Coat of Arms’
Annex 7. Some methods for receiving feedback

Feedback is useful to both the participants and the trainer. The exercises, described below, will let the participants feel the feedback during their work at the time of the training.

Different methods can be used to receive feedback.

1. ‘Train carriages’
   This method lets receive feedback at a certain stage of training (most commonly one session is evaluated). The trainer asks the participants to evaluate the previous part of the training, using a poster with a steam locomotive and train carriages (the number of the carriages should be same as the number of training stages being evaluated). Impressions, thoughts and ideas should be put on the post-it® notes that are to be placed on the corresponding carriages. After this anyone who likes can familiarise themselves with their contents. [2, p. 68]

2. ‘Rear-view mirror’
   In the beginning of a new day of a seminar you can use the method ‘Rear-view mirror’.

   The participants are reminded of the function of a rear-view mirror (enables one to see what is going on behind). Then they are asked to take a few minutes to analyse the previous day (stage) of the seminar, using the following methods:

   • What did you like?
   • What caused you some thinking?
   • What could have been done differently?

After this everyone takes his or her turn to speak in circle [2, p. 85].

3. ‘Lyrical, Practical, Abstruse, Critical’
   This is a group-oriented method to receive feedback.

   The participants are arranged in four groups. Each group receives a sheet of paper with one of the following inscriptions: ‘Lyrical’, ‘Practical’, ‘Abstruse’, and ‘Critical’. The participants are then asked to take a few minutes to describe the previous stage of training (for instance, the previous day), proceeding from the inscription they received. Descriptions should take form of narratives written on a sheet of paper.

   Then the groups exchange their sheets of paper and continue the descriptions, started by the others. In this way, each group describes the stage of the seminar that is being analysed, from four viewpoints. Then every group receives their original version and reads it in the common circle.

   The number and content of characteristics that are being offered, as well as the algorithm of conducting the activity, may vary. In case there are many people at the seminar, it is better to arrange them into eight groups, i.e. two consecutive ‘streams’, rather than creating quantitatively large groups (of more than 5 persons).
Annex 8. Final evaluation form of the training

First Name

Last Name

1. For me the training was:
☐ Very useful;
☐ Quite useful;
☐ Interesting, but not useful;
☐ Useless.

Your comments:

2. Evaluate please, according to a seven-point scale (7 — very good, 1 — unsatisfactory; whenever possible, please explain your evaluations):
   • Training content 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
   • Logic of the training 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
   • Atmosphere at the training 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
   • Style of conducting the training 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
   • Relevance of methods that were selected 1 2 3 4 5 6 7
   • Organisation of the training 1 2 3 4 5 6 7

3. Are you happy with how you yourself have worked at the training?
☐ Yes ☐ Not entirely ☐ Rather not ☐ No ☐ Don’t know
4. What contribution have you made to the joint work?

5. Have your expectations been met at the seminar? To what extent and why?

6. Indicate, please, the three most important aspects that turned out to be significant for you at the time of the training:
   1. 
   2. 
   3. 

7. What turned out to be less useful for you?
   1. 
   2. 
   3. 

8. How would you describe for yourself the result of the training you have just completed?

9. What suggestions would you like to make to the trainers and organisers?

Other comments:

Thank you for your cooperation!

Source: [4, p. 240]
Annex 9. Role-play ‘Public participation in decision-making regarding construction’

The plot of the role play

The public authority has given permission to build a waste treatment plant on land that is adjacent to the village B of the region A (at a distance of 500 m from the village). According to the project, the plant has to process industrial (including dangerous) and household waste from various regions. The local population has not been informed about the adoption of the indicated decision, and, accordingly, the participation of the inhabitants of the village in the process of decision-making has not been provided for. The local population, as well as the non-governmental organizations, has learned about the decision, after which protest actions have started. The head of the local public authority has met the activists. Negotiations have started, with the result that an agreement has been reached to hold a meeting, in which all stakeholders will take part. The head of the local local public authority has explained to the activists that the construction of the plan has not started yet, and asked them to stop the actions and elect representatives who will take part in the meeting in two days time. The activists have agreed and broken up.

Additional information: on the territory of the village there have been discovered the remains of an unknown species of dinosaurs; this fact has great scientific significance.

In two days, according to the agreement, the meeting takes place, in which the following people take part…

Participants’ roles

1. The head of the local public authority of the village. You preside over the meeting and try to avoid opposing the construction, your task is to lead the participants to some decision. You are interested in the construction of the plant, because the investors have promised to invest finances in the development of the infrastructures of the village, and this will help strengthen your stand as an official. You also protect the following position: informing the public is in the government’s competence, not yours.

2. Representative of the government. You stick to the position that the plant should be built, the result of which will be that new jobs will be created, the infrastructure of the village will be developed, and the finances, received from the operation of the plant, will be spent on the development of agriculture. You also think that informing the public and ensuring its participation is in the competence of the local public authorities, not the government’s.

REMARK: You may change your position and act the way you think is necessary.

3. Investor. You categorically demand from the government and the head of the local public authority that the situation is immediately sorted out so that the construction can get started. At the same time you explain to the public that the plant can help solve the unemployment problem in the village. Promise high salaries, a new school, that the hospital will be fixed and provided with modern equipment, that the cinema will be fixed, etc.

REMARK: You may change your position and act the way you think is necessary.

4. Non-governmental organization. You are against the construction and you threaten to file a court case, because the government did not have right to make a decision (to issue permission) without informing the public and without public participation. The Law obliges the government to do this and it had no right to break it.

REMARK:
1. If you feel that the head of the local public authority does not let you speak, protest strongly.
2. You may change your position and act the way you think is necessary.
5. Inhabitant of the village. You are against the construction, because your health and the health of your children is more important for you then sorting out material issues. You are also aware of the fact that the second person who, together with yourself has been elected as a representative of the village — and a supporter of the construction — is a cousin of the head of the local public authority.

**REMARK:** You may change your position and act the way you think is necessary.

6. 2nd inhabitant of the village. You support the construction because you are in a very difficult financial situation and you are interested in working at the plant in order for your children not to be hungry. At the same time, you are a cousin of the head of the local self-government authority.

**REMARK:** You may change your position and act the way you think is necessary.

7. The representative of the Regional service of the Ministry of Protection of Environment and Natural Resources of Georgia. You are against the construction, but, being a governmental official, do not express your opinion clearly, and rather try to propose to those who are present an alternative, which will help them make some sort of decision.

8. Representative of a scientific research institute. Your institute, at the request of one of the local non-governmental organizations has examined the territory, adjacent to the village, and the possible impact of the plant on the environment. The results of the research have shown that construction of the plant at such a short distance of the village (500 meters) will inevitably cause a decrease in the agricultural yield, an increase in the level of sickness, and the deterioration of the general environmental condition. This is directly connected to the fact that the plant’s emissions, due to the prevailing wind, will be carried exactly onto the territory of the village.
Annex 10. Role-play ‘Public participation in selection of locations for placement of land-fills for waste burial’

**Time: 4 hours 30 minutes**

**Expected results**

After the completion of this session the participants will be able to:

- Explain the main elements of work of focus groups and working groups;
- Identify the stages of decision-making, at which it is possible to use public hearings and meetings of the public;
- Compare positions of various stakeholders who interact in the process decision making;
- Identify advantages of public hearings;
- Identify main factors, influencing the successfulness of public hearings;
- Identify criteria of good preparation and argumentation of a position.

**Plan of the role play**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element of the session</th>
<th>Method to be used</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Brief information from the trainer</td>
<td>5 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage I: Who will participate</td>
<td>Arranging participants into groups</td>
<td>10-15 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage II: Preparation and carrying out a working meeting of representatives of the Ministry of Environment with the representatives of the sides whom this problem concerns</td>
<td>Work in 5 small groups, Role play ‘Public working meeting’ Reflection on the results</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage III: Development of a draft plan</td>
<td>Work in three groups Role play ‘Plenary meeting’ Reflection</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage IV: Public hearing and a public meeting</td>
<td>Work in 5 small groups Role play ‘Public hearing’ Reflection on the results</td>
<td>40 min.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage V: Preparation and adoption of a final project</td>
<td>Work in 3 groups Role play ‘Plenary meeting’ Reflection</td>
<td>1 hour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>Discussion in a large group</td>
<td>30 min.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Introduction**

**Time: 5 minutes**

At the beginning of the role-play present to the participants a short explanation — an introduction to the subject (if necessary you can distribute the description of the case to the participants):

- It is necessary to build a 20-hectare land-fill;
- The land-fill will be located near the nature reserve;
- The road toward the land-fill will cross the nature reserve;
- The new land-fill will replace the 10 existing ones, which are at the moment located in open gravel pits;
- The land-fill has to meet the requirements presented by EU directives;
- Placement of waste on the land-fill will cost… per ton;
- At the present time there are no plans for the introduction of alternative ways of waste treatment;
- Fines have been imposed for the placement of waste in undesignated areas.
Stage I: Who will participate (arranging participants into groups)

**Time: 10-15 minutes**
Ask all the participants the following questions:
- Who has to participate in the process of making such a decision?
- Why is it important that these particular groups participate?

After 5 minutes of discussion (‘brainstorming’ is possible) arrange the participants into 5 groups of an equal number of members with the help of coloured cards (as shown on the list below):
- The Ministry of Environment (the public authority that is responsible for the issues of environmental protection and issuing corresponding permission);
- Association of house owners;
- Representatives of industrial enterprises;
- Non-governmental organizations (an association of nature-protection organizations, environmental organizations, etc.);
- Representatives of the municipality (local administration).

Stage II: Preparation and carrying out a working meeting of representatives of the Ministry of Environment with the representatives of the sides whom this problem concerns

**Time: 60 minutes**
Explain that all the stakeholders will have to take part in a working meeting, initiated by the Ministry of Environment. At this meeting the groups will have to present their positions regarding the project. The positions will be determined by the written instructions, that will be received by each group. Distribute the instructions and make sure that they are clear to the participants.

Instructions for the groups

**Group 1. Ministry of Environment**
Congratulations — you are the representative of the Ministry of Environment. Your group will have to represent the corresponding point of view. Your point of view regarding the location and design of the land-fill is defined by the map. Take into account that the working meeting will be held in the plenary meetings hall and will take approximately 30 minutes.

- You have 20 minutes in order to implement the following assignments:
  - Welcome the participants of the public meeting.
  - Present your proposals and arguments regarding the selection of the location (shown on the map), using the instruction, shown below, to which you may add your own arguments.
  - Explain the process of decision making.
  - Select a presenter who will be speaking at the plenary meeting.
  - Select a secretary who will take the minutes at the time of the public discussion. All comments presented at the meeting have to be collected and given to the staff members who are responsible for the design of the land-fill (Stage III of the role play).

**Your position regarding the selection of a location for the land-fill:**
*It has to be located outside the nature reserve. It will replace the 10 existing land-fills. The smell or noise from the land-fill or the access roads must not reach the reserve and residential areas, etc.*
Group 2. Association of house owners

Congratulations — you represent the association of house owners.

Your group has to present the point of view of the association of house owners and make sure that your interests are considered to the fullest extent. At the working meeting you have to speak concerning the location for placement of the land-fill, proposed by the Ministry of Environment and marked on the map.

Take into account that the working meeting will be held in the plenary meetings hall and will take approximately 30 minutes.

You have 20 minutes in order to implement the following assignments:

- Discuss and prepare arguments regarding the selection of the location (shown on the map), using the instructions given below, to which you may add your own arguments.
- Select a presenter, who will speak at the plenary session.

**Your position regarding the selection of a location for the land-fill:**

*The location for the land-fill is okay, but the access road should go to the east of the nature reserve; your point of view is very important to you, because the traffic on this road will generate a lot of noise and dust and the road will prevent free access to the nature reserve, etc.*

Group 3. Representatives of industrial enterprises

Congratulations — you represent industrial enterprises. Your group will have to present the point of view of the industrialists, and make sure that your interests are considered to the fullest extent. At the working meeting you have to speak concerning the location for placement of the land-fill, proposed by the Ministry of Environment and marked on the map.

Take into account that the working meeting will be held in the plenary meetings hall and will take approximately 30 minutes.

You have 20 minutes in order to implement the following assignments:

- Discuss and prepare arguments regarding the selection of the location (shown on the map), using the instructions given below, to which you may add your own arguments.
- Select a presenter, who will speak at the plenary session.

**Your position regarding the selection of a location for the land-fill:**

*You propose to place the land-fill in the northern part of the region of the nature reserve. You think that any other location for the land-fill, but the one proposed by yourselves, is not convenient, as it will lead to an increase of distance of transportation. Your point of view is very important to you. A land-fill inside the nature reserve will occupy less space. Later it can be included into the nature reserve, for example, as a golf course, etc.*

Group 4. Non-governmental organizations

Congratulations — you represent the association of nature-protection organizations, environmental organizations, etc. Your group will have to present the point of view of the non-governmental organizations, and make sure that your interests are considered to the fullest extent. At the working meeting you have to speak concerning the location for placement of the land-fill, proposed by the Ministry of Environment and marked on the map.

Take into account that the working meeting will be held in the plenary meetings hall and will take approximately 30 minutes.

You have 20 minutes in order to implement the following assignments:

- Discuss and prepare arguments regarding the selection of the location (shown on the map), using the instructions given below, to which you may add your own arguments.
- Select a presenter, who will speak at the plenary session.

**Your position regarding the selection of a location for the land-fill:**

*You think that both the land-fill and the access road break the environmental balance in the nature reserve zone. The land-fill should be placed further away from the nature reserve (closer to the mayor’s house), and the access road — to the east of the open gravel pits. Or the access road can go through the southern side of the pit, where gravel is not being extracted. The protection of the environment will serve to everyone’s good in the long-term perspective. There is a threat to the biological diversity, etc.*
Group 5. Municipality

Congratulations — you represent the municipality. Your group will have to present the point of view of the municipality, and make sure that your interests are considered to the fullest extent. At the working meeting you have to speak concerning the location for placement of the land-fill, proposed by the Ministry of Environment and marked on the map.

Take into account that the working meeting will be held in the plenary meetings hall and will take approximately 30 minutes.

You have 20 minutes in order to implement the following assignments:

- Discuss and prepare arguments regarding the selection of the location (shown on the map), using the instructions given below, to which you may add your own arguments.
- Select a presenter, who will speak at the plenary session.

Your position regarding the selection of a location for the land-fill:

You think that the land-fill should be located to the south of the nature reserve, and the access road should go through the nature reserve zone. You want to make the most economic decision; otherwise there is a risk of placing the waste on land that is not intended for this. You do not want the road to go near the church (the mayor lives in the house next to the church). You also do not want the access road to go through the densely populated districts. You think that the road will not break the balance in the nature protection zone, and, after all, there are so many nature territories around besides the nature reserve, etc.

Give the groups 20 minutes to discuss and prepare arguments regarding the selection of a place for the land-fill. Arguments should be presented during a public working meeting, which will last approximately 30 minutes. Each group has to appoint a presenter.

The order of holding a public hearing is as follows:

1. Representatives of the Ministry of Environment should:
   - Welcome the participants of the public meeting (1 minute.).
   - Present own proposals/vindications for the placement of the land-fill and the access road (2 minutes.).
   - Explain the process of decision-making (1 minute.).
   - Collect all comments during the meeting (in writing), and hand them over to the staff members working on the design of the land-fill (on the Stage III).

2. Other groups (House owners/industrialists/non-governmental organizations/municipality) have to present their remarks, comments and proposals during 3 minutes.

After the end of the second stage of the role play — the ‘working meeting of the sides’ — ask the participants the questions given below and listen to 2-3 answers to each of them:

- How difficult (or easy) was it for you to prepare the arguments?
- Has your group succeeded in being convincing at the time of presenting your position at the working meeting? What could have strengthened your position?
- What do you think, will the position of your group be considered at the time of making the final decision? Why?

Allocate not more than 10 minutes for the discussion! This is an intermediate stage of reflection, aimed at relieving any emotional strain and helping in further interaction.
Stage III: Development of a draft plan (group work — 1 hour)

**Time: 60 minutes**

Arrange the groups in three new groups (not more than 10 persons in each). Now all of them will act as the representatives of the Ministry of Environment. On the basis of comments, collected during Stage II, the groups will discuss and compile the proposals concerning the placement and the design of the land-fill.

In the plenary session, which will conclude this stage, the groups will present three proposals regarding the place and design of the land-fill, and the participants will vote for the best plan.

Give the groups 30 minutes for preparation of the proposals and 20 minutes for presentation (5-7 minutes to each group) and voting at the plenary session. All groups receive similar assignments, sufficient copies of which have to be made in advance. Besides the assignment, given below, give each group the comments from the previous stage (they also have to be copied in sufficient number).

**Assignments for the groups**

Now you represent the Ministry of Environment. On the basis of the comments collected at the working meeting, you should discuss and develop proposals concerning the placement and design of the land-fill.

Consider the following possible consequences, as well as economic indicators:

**Land-fill:**
- noise;
- smell;
- harmful substances leaking through into the soil and waters;
- working hours;
- protective fence;
- conditions of depositing dangerous waste products;
- maintaining tidiness of adjacent land;
- access roads;
- plan in case of an emergency situation;
- price of burying waste (per ton);
- necessity to prevent subterranean waters from pollution;
- proximity of the nature reserve zone.

**Access roads:**
- noise;
- cost of maintenance of the roadway covering;
- dust.

Please formulate the proposals concerning the placement and design of the land-fill and mark them on the map. You have 30 minutes to prepare the best proposals.

Prepare arguments to back up your position. Select a presenter from your group in order to present your position at the common session.

At the time of the plenary meeting give the groups 5-7 minutes in order to present their positions. When the time runs out, stop the presenters. After the end of the presentations invite the joint group to select one plan by means of an open vote.

Then ask the following questions to the whole group:

- In what way and in what order did consider the comments from the previous stage at the time of working on the proposals?
- Did all the members of the small groups succeed in taking part in the discussion of the proposals during the group work?
- Have all the proposals been considered? How did the small groups come to a consensus?
- Which presentation, to your mind, has been the most successful and why?
- To what extent is this type of work in working groups (focus groups) effective in a real process of decision making? How can it be made more effective?
Stage IV: Public hearing

Time: 40 minutes

The plan that was selected by means of voting is now the basis for further discussion and group work.

Arrange the participants again into 5 groups as they were at the first stage of the role play.

Give 4 groups — the representatives of the stakeholders — 10 minutes to prepare objections, comments and proposals regarding the plan that has been accepted. Explain that the groups have to set priorities — which issues are important for them, and on which issues a compromise is possible. Distribute the assignments to the groups.

The group that represents the Ministry of Environment, receives an individual assignment on preparation of a public hearing.

Assignments for the groups

Group 1. Ministry of Environment

You represent the Ministry of Environment again. You have 10 minutes in order to prepare to carry out a public hearing on the nominated issue. Try to recollect the procedure of public hearings.

Decide who will preside over the public hearing, what questions you, as the public authority in charge would still like to clarify for yourselves before the making the final decision.

Do not forget to select a secretary, who will be take the minutes during the public discussion. All comments presented at the public hearing, have to be collected (the key points — in written form) and given to the staff members who are responsible for the design of the land-fill (Stage V of the role play).

Group 2. Association of house owners

You represent the association of house owners again. You have 10 minutes in order to prepare objections, comments and proposals regarding the plan that has received the majority of votes.

Determine, which issues are a high priority for you (list them one by one), and decide, on which issues you would like to reach a compromise.

Please, consider also the possible influence on the environment and on the residential area nearby. Will the harmful substances poison the environment, threaten safety and tourism?

Select a presenter who will have to present your opinion during 5 minutes at the public meeting.

Group 3. Representatives of industrial enterprises

You represent the industrialists again. You have 10 minutes in order to prepare objections, comments and proposals regarding the plan that has received the majority of votes.

Determine, which issues are a high priority for you (list them one by one), and decide, on which issues you would like to reach a compromise.

Please, consider also that the land-fill has to be accessible and cheap, otherwise we will move our enterprises to a neighboring country.

Select a presenter who will have to present your opinion during 5 minutes at the public meeting.
Group 4. Non-governmental organizations

You represent the non-governmental organizations again. You have 10 minutes in order to prepare objections, comments and proposals regarding the plan that has received the majority of votes.

Determine, which issues are a high priority for you (list them one by one), and decide, on which issues you would like to reach a compromise.

Please consider also, has there been carried out an assessment of the real need in creating such a large land-fill. Why waste separation, recycling or paper, carton-paper, plastic, garden wastes is not being implemented?

Select a presenter who will have to present your opinion during 5 minutes at the public meeting.

Group 5. Municipality

You represent the municipality again.

You have 10 minutes in order to prepare objections, comments and proposals regarding the plan that has received the majority of votes.

Determine, which issues are a high priority for you (list them one by one), and decide, on which issues you would like to reach a compromise.

Please consider also, that the land-fill and the access road should not create additional expenses for the municipality (for example, organizing a supply of water, electricity, etc.). The land-fill should not be placed close to the church, mayor’s office, etc.

Select a presenter who will have to present your opinion during 5 minutes at the public meeting.

Organize holding a public hearing which will be presided over by group 1. During the public hearing give not more than 5 minutes to each of the small groups (20 minutes for all) in order to present their objections, comments and compromise proposals.

Concluding the public hearing, it would be good for the representatives of the Ministry of Environment to thank all the participants and express their short comments (1 minute) on the process of the public hearing. Who? How did he or she participate? Do they consider this public hearing to be useful?

After the end of the hearings reflect briefly on the following questions:

– Are you satisfied by the presentation of your group at the public hearing, and why?
– Which group do you think succeeded in presenting their position in the most successful way, and why?
– How effectively can public hearings affect the process of decision-making? How can their effectiveness be raised?

Stage V: Preparation and adoption of a final project

Time: 60 minutes

Arrange the participants into 3 groups again (as in Stage III). They have to prepare a final project and justify the reasons for their decisions. The grounds for decisions have to be presented in written form and have to take into consideration all the relevant comments from the other groups.

Distribute to the groups the written assignment, presented below, and large sheets of paper to write on and present their final decision. Also do not forget that the groups have to receive in written form the comments from the previous Stage (IV) of the role play.
Assignment for the groups

Now you are again representing the Ministry of Environment. You have 20 minutes in order to prepare the final project. You have to prepare the project and justify the reasons for your decision. The grounds for decisions have to be presented in written form and have to take into consideration all the relevant comments from the other groups, which have been received during the public hearing. If some of the comments from one of the groups of stakeholders among the public have been turned down by you, do not forget to explain why during the presentation.

After the completion of this work you have 10 minutes, in order to write the final decision on a flip-chart.

The final project (and the reasons for the decision) should be presented during 5 minutes at the joint meeting.

During the plenary session give the groups 5 minutes each in order to present their positions. After the time runs out — stop the presenters. After the end of the presentations invite the large group to select one of the plans by means of an open vote.

After this ask the following questions in the large group:

- In what way and in what sequence did you consider the comments of the groups from the previous stage and at the time of work on the proposals?
- How did you reach a consensus?
- Which among the positions was, in your opinion, the most successful, and why?
- To what extent can such a work in the working groups (focus-groups) be effective in the real process of decision-making? How can its effectiveness be strengthened?

Conclusion

Time: 20 minutes

After a short break discuss common activities on the subjects:

- What can be the methods of public participation in environmentally significant decision-making?
- How effective can be the different methods at the various stages of development of a decision?
- Explain, using the examples from the role-play, how the main principles of public participation in the decision-making were implemented (use the slides from Session 7);
- How effectively have you succeeded in participating in developing an environmentally significant decision with the help of various methods?
- What methods have you learned in particular today?
- Has your position regarding the project been changing depending on the role that you have been performing? How exactly?
- Has your attitude toward public participation in the process of decision-making changed? How exactly?
- What can be done in the separate stages of developing a decision so that the result would be optimal?
Annex 11. List of Aarhus Convention experts

Elena Veligosh
the Project Regional Training Expert
Royal Haskoning
elena.veligosh@fenixgruppen.se

Elena Pometun
Training expert
Doctor of pedagogical science, Professor
Institute of Pedagogic, Academy of Pedagogical Science of Ukraine
(380-44) 5138938
pometun@hotmail.com

ARmenia

Aida Iskoyan
Team Leader
Aarhus Convention Focal Point in Armenia,
Vice Chairman of the Aarhus Convention Bureau
Head of the NGO ‘Environment Public Advocacy Centre’
Member of the International Council of Environmental Law (IUCN, Bonn)
(3741) 539255
(3749) 420021
fax: (3741) 530669
epac@arminco.com
aidaisk@arminco.com
web-site: http://www.epac.am

Karine Danielyan
Team Trainer
NGO ‘For Sustainable Human Development’/ UNEPCOM, President
(3741) 922327
ashd@freenet.am
kdanel@freenet.am

Sona Ayvazyan
Team Member
‘Transparency International’,
Armenian branch
(3741) 512066
(3749) 433278
sayvazyan@yahoo.com
web-site: http://www.transparency.am

Abgar Yeghoyan
Team Member
NGO ‘Consumers Union’, President
(3741) 460824
(3749) 479250
fax: (3741) 561461
abgar@freenet.am
upcr@netsys.am

Amalia Hambartsumyan
Team Member
NGO ‘Khazer’, President — Team Member
(3741) 534472
fax: (3741) 538187
khazer@nature.am

Inga Zarafian
Team Member
Mass media ‘Noyan Tapan’ Agency, Journalist
(3741) 399942
(3741) 524279
zarafian@yahoo.com

Lev Harutyunyan
Team Member
Ministry of Nature Protection, Informational-analitic center
(3741) 532802
(3749) 428446
lev_h@inbox.ru
iac@netsys.am
iac@mnpiac.am
web-site: mnpiac.am

Nune Hovhannisyan
Team Member
Ministry of Nature Protection, International relations department
(3741) 534948
(3741) 585336
nuneoganesyan@rambler.ru

Arthur Hairumian
Team Member
(3741) 571896
(3741) 550519
arthurh@irex.am

Elena Pometun
Training expert
Doctor of pedagogical science, Professor
Institute of Pedagogic, Academy of Pedagogical Science of Ukraine
(380-44) 5138938
pometun@hotmail.com
AZERBAIJAN

Samir Isayev
Team Leader
NGO Environmental Law Center
‘Ecolex-Azerbaijan’
(994) 50 3121439
(994) 12 398180
(99412) 683 359
tacis.aarhus@azdata.net

Enver Safar-Zadeh
Team Trainer
NGO ‘Crude Alternative’
(994) 55 7790207
enver_ca@mail.ru

Chingiz Mehdiyev
Team Member
Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources
(994) 12 663012
ChingizME@mail.ru

Rauf Hajiyev
Team Member
Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources
(994) 12 983964

Hamlet Ismayilov
Team Member
Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources
(994) 50 3530656
11_hambt@mail.ru

Sarvar Valiyev
Team Member
Ministry of Justice
(994) 50 3365873
s.veliyev@mail.ru

Sabir Israfilov
Team Member
NGO ‘Azerbaijan Society for Nature Protection’
(994) 50 3396998
isabir@azdata.net

Arzu Jabarova
Team Member
NGO ‘Ecolex’,
HFO ‘Coalition in region’, Charwoman
(994) 17741566
aj-jasmin@yandex.ru

Azer Garayev
Team Member
NGO ‘Azerbaijan Society for the Protection of Animals’
(994) 50 3125089
agarayev@azspa.org

Gulnara Mammadova
Team Member
Mass media, Freelance Journalist
(994) 50 3331044
gula_mamedzade@mail.ru

BELARUS

Irina Sukhy
Team Leader
NGO ‘Ecohome’
(375-17) 2200313
(375-17) 2801652
aarhus@tut.by
suhisha@tut.by

Irina Belaya
Team Trainer
NGO ‘Next Stop — New Life’
(375-29) 7760422 (mob.)
opxyc@tut.by
belkango@rambler.ru

Svetlana Koroliova
Team Member
Journalist
(375-29) 7760634 (mob.)
karaleva@tut.by

Ekatgerina Goncharova
Team Member
Ministry of Natural Resources and Environmental Protection
(375-17) 2202767
minat1974@mail.ru

Victor Svirelin
Team Member
Byelorussian scientific-research centre ‘Ecologia’
(375-17) 2348539; 2661350
svirelin@e-mail.ru

Anatoly Shvetsov
Team Member
National Academy of Sciences,
Inter department Bulletin ‘Natural Resources’
(375-17) 2644542; 2602573
shvetsov88@tut.by
jr-bull@ns.ecology.ac.by

Alesya Vidruk
Team Member
Innovation Fund of Law Technologies
(375-17) 2365517
vidles@mail.ru

Valeriy Kurilov
Team Member
Business Centre ‘Ecologiyainvest’
(375-17) 2267669
ecoinv@home.by
GEORGIA

Lia Todua
Team Leader
National Project Office
(995) 99577969
liatodua@gol.ge

Nana Nemsadze
Team Trainer
National Project Office
(995) 99242722
nnemsadze@gol.ge

Nino Kituashvili
Team Member
Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources,
Public Relations Department
(995) 77760572
moeprdept@gol.ge

Archil Adamia
Team Member
Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources,
Legal Department
(995) 93303287
meldachiko@yahoo.com

Eka Badridze
Team Member
NGO ‘Canter for Strategic Research
and Development of Georgia’
(995) 77741542
ebadridze@hotmail.com

Giorgi Gakheladze
Team Member
Mass media, newspaper ‘Mtavari Gazeti’
(995) 77793098
Ggakheladze@yahoo.com

Rusudan Simonidze
Team Member
NGO ‘Greens’ Movement of Georgia’
(995) 99532611
info@greens.ge

Tamar Gobejishvili
Team Member
Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources,
Public Relations Department
(995) 77760574
aarhusgeo@access.sanet.ge

Tamar Peikrishvili
Team Member
Ministry of Environment and Natural Resources,
Public Relations Department
(995) 77408604
moeprdept@gol.ge

Manana Kurtubadze
Team Member
NGO ‘GRID-Tbilisi’
(995) 99 110805
m.kurtubadze@gridtb.org

MOLDOVA

Pavel Zamfir
Team Leader
NGO ‘Eco-Lex’
(373) 22 220412

Vasile Spinei
Team Member
NGO ‘Access Info’, President
(373) 22 244145
acces@mtc.md

Alecu Renita
Team Member
NGO ‘Environmental Movement
of Moldova’, President
(373) 22 237157
renitsa@eco.moldnet.md

Tatiana Siniaeva
Team Member
NGO ‘Biotica’, ‘Eco-Tiras’ Association
(373) 22 225615
tatiana_siniaeva@yahoo.com

Maria Sandu
Team Member
National Scientific Institute
of Ecology RM,
member of the Board
of experts of Ministry of Ecology
and nature resources RM and REC,
NGO ‘Water Quality’
(373) 22 721803
sdumaria@mail.md

Lidia Ilascu
Team Member
Government
of the City of Chisinau
(373) 22 238084
li@pmc.md

Nicolae Grosu
Team Member
NGO ‘Renasterea’
(373) 242 41203
nicolagros@mtc-sv.md
UKRAINE

Borys Vasylykivskiy
Team Leader
NGO ‘EcoPravo-Kiev’
(380-44) 2545764
vborys@ecopravo.kiev.ua

Tamara Malkova
Team Trainer
NGO Information Centre ‘Green Dossier’
(380-44) 2276277
tamara@bg.net.ua

Igor Malakhov
Team Member
National Academy of Sciences
(380-564) 728408
imal@ingok.com.ua

Andrey Dashko
‘Teleradiocurrier’ Centre
Ukrainian Media Union
(380-44) 2308302
ad@tv-radio.kiev.ua

Andrey Ostapenko
Team Member
State Institute for Professional Re-training
(380-44) 2063131
andrii_ostapenko@ukr.net

Olena Simonova
Team Member
Ministry of Ecology,
Public Relations and Mass Media Department
(380-44) 2063117
prescente@menr.gov.ua

Vanda Baranovska
Team Member
State Institute for Professional Re-training
(380-44) 2063131
wandaveg@i.com.ua

Ruslan Bilyk
Team Member
State Department of the natural resources
Khmelnitskiy region
(380-3822) 91375
r_bilyk@inbox.ru

Elena Turos
Team Member
Academy of medical sciences of Ukraine
Institute of hygiene and medical ecology
(380-44) 5593415
turos@i.kiev.ua

Myroslava Ganyushkina
Team Member
NGO Information Centre ‘Green Dossier’,
Journalist
(380-44) 2276277
miroslavka@pisem.net
List of literature


* Prepare and distribute to the participants the materials on procedure for holding public hearings, which are resent in the Trainer’s Guide in the section ‘Role plays’. 